

# Record of Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: **North America**

Global Technical Committee: **Information and Control**

TC Chapter Cochairs: **Brian Rubow / Cimetrix, Jack Ghiselli**

Standards Staff: **Inna Skvortsova**

|  | Scheduled in Background Statement | Actual                |
|--|-----------------------------------|-----------------------|
| Date   | 11/09/2016                        | 11/09/2016            |
| Location   | SEMI HQ, San Jose, CA             | SEMI HQ, San Jose, CA |
| Reason for Change of Date and/or Location (if changed) |                                   |                       |

Note: See *Regulations* ¶ 9.5 Exception for allowable reason to change.

## I. Document Number and Title

|                                |  |
|--------------------------------|--|
| <b>Document Number</b><br>6038 | <b>Document Title</b><br>Reapproval of SEMI E160-1211, Specification for Communication of Data Quality |
|--------------------------------|--|

## II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: **As-cast tally after close of voting period**

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.7.1.1)

Voting Tally (with example values):

| Voting Interest:          | Returned Votes |   | Distribution              |   | Return Rate |      |
|---------------------------|----------------|---|---------------------------|---|-------------|------|
| Letter Ballot             | 64             | ÷ | 105                       | = | 61.0%       | ≥60% |
| Intercommittee Ballot     | 17             |   |                           |   |             |      |
|                           |                |   |                           |   |             |      |
| Voting Interest Reject(s) | 1              |   | Total Voters with Rejects |   |             | 1    |
| Voting Interest Accept(s) | 35             |   |                           |   |             |      |
|                           |                |   |                           |   |             |      |

Note: See *Regulations* § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

### III. Rejects

#### Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: MitchSakamoto)

#### Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Sakamoto, Mitsune, Self)

#### Negative 1

|                          |                                     |  |  |                                |  |
|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|--|--------------------------------|--|
| Negative                 | Referenced Section/ Paragraph       | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.  |  |                                |  |
|                          | Negative Text                       | *Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.<br>E160 should be obsolete.                                |  |                                |  |
| TF input (optional)      |                                     | The specification is being used by at least one company and is referenced in the latest ITRS (2015 version, see www.itrs2.net) so it is not "obsolete" |  |                                |  |
| Withdrawal (check one)   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.  |  | GO TO "Related" subsection     |  |
|                          | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.   |  | GO TO "Final" subsection → (A) |  |
| Related                  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | 'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)  |  | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection  |  |
|                          |                                     | Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)   |  |                                |  |
|                          |                                     | Reason   | XXXX   |                                |  |
|                          | Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by       | Name (Company)/Name (Company)  |  |                                |  |
|                          | Discussion                          |  |  |                                |  |
|                          | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.   |  |                                |  |
|                          |                                     | <input type="checkbox"/>   | [Negative is not related.] < 2/3   |                                | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection                              |
| <input type="checkbox"/> |                                     | 2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]   |  | GO TO "Final" subsection → (B) |  |
| Persuasive               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)  |  |                                |  |
|                          |                                     | Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)  |  |                                |  |
|                          |                                     | Reason   | Specification is being used by at least one company and is referenced in the latest ITRS (2015 version, see www.itrs2.net) |                                |  |
|                          | Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by       | James Moyne (AMAT/University of Michigan)/Brian Rubow (Cimterix)   |  |                                |  |
|                          | Discussion                          | None   |  |                                |  |
|                          | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | 7 Y-0 N; Motion passed   |  |                                |  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> |                                     | [Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3  | Is a technical change recommended? (check one)   | <input type="checkbox"/>       | Y<br>GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection |

|                                |  |   |  |  |                |   |                                |
|--------------------------------|--|---|--|--|----------------|---|--------------------------------|
|                                |  |   | [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3                        |  |                | N | GO TO "Final" subsection → (E) |
|                                |  |   | $2/3 \leq$ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%             | GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)                               |                |   |                                |
|                                |  | X   | $90\% \leq$ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]                  | GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection            |                |   |                                |
| Not Significant Finding Option | This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2) |   |  |  |                |   |                                |
|                                | Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one)  | X   | It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant".     | GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)                               |                |   |                                |
|                                |  |   | It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "significant".         | GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)                               |                |   |                                |
|                                |  |   | Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote. |  |                |   |                                |
|                                | Motion   | The Negative is "not significant".            |  |  |                |   |                                |
|                                | Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by  | Name (Company)/Name (Company)                 |  |  |                |   |                                |
|                                | Vote   |   | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority                          | GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)                               |                |   |                                |
|                                |  | XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority | GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)   |  |                |   |                                |
| Final                          | (check if applicable)  |   | (A)  | Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)                   |                |   |                                |
|                                |  |   | (B)  | Not related (counted under i in disposition)                 |                |   |                                |
|                                |  |   | (C)  | Related and not persuasive (significant)                     |                |   |                                |
|                                |  | X   | (D)  | Not significant (counted under j in disposition)             |                |   |                                |
|                                |  |   | (E)  | Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change | DOCUMENT FAILS |   |                                |
|                                |  |   | (F)  | Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)  |                |   |                                |
|                                | (check if applicable)  |   | Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.                     |  |                |   |                                |

## Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 1

Check only when the Document has not been failed.

|       |  |                           |   |
|-------|--|---------------------------|---|
| 1     | Original number (#) of Negatives   | (g)                       |   |
| 0     | Number of Negatives withdrawn  | (h)                       |   |
| 0     | Number of Negatives found not related  | (i)                       |   |
| 1     | Number of Negatives found not significant  | (j)                       |   |
| 0     | Number of Negatives addressed by technical change (Negative becomes not significant) | (k)                       |   |
| Final | X  | $g - (h + i + j + k) = 0$ | Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check |
|       |  | $g - (h + i + j + k) > 0$ | Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check                      |
|       |  | Reject without a Negative | Not Valid   |

Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.4.3.3)  
 Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)

## IV. Other Technical Issues

Note: TC Chapter may choose to address a technical issue that is not part of a Negative received on a Letter Ballot (i.e., a Comment or a reason not addressed by a Vote response) by handling it as a Negative and finding it related and technically persuasive. The TC Chapter may then fail the Document or address such technical issue by using the procedure defined in *Regulations* § 9.6.4.3 to make a technical change to the Document. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.6.2.4.5)

NONE

## V. Comments

NONE

## VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in “FROM” and “TO” fields.

NONE

## VII. Approval Conditions Check

### VII. - (i). Approval Rate

**APPROVAL CONDITION 1:** All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.7.1.2)

**APPROVAL CONDITION 2:** At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.7.1.3)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

|               |   |         |   |                              |   |        |  |      |  |
|---------------|---|---------|---|------------------------------|---|--------|--|------|--|
|               |   |         |   |                              |   |        |  |      |  |
|               |   | Accepts |   | (Accepts +<br>Valid Rejects) |   |        |  |      |  |
| Approval Rate | = | 35      | / | 35                           | = | 100.0% |  | ≥90% |  |
|               |   |         |   |                              |   |        |  |      |  |
|               |   |         |   |                              |   |        |  |      |  |

### VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

Note: See *Regulations* § 9.7.2 for further information.

|   |  |
|---|--|
| X | <b>Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):</b><br>The Letter Ballot meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.                                 |
|   | <b>Need a Ratification Ballot:</b><br>The Letter Ballot meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes. |

## VIII. Safety Check

**Note: See Regulations § 15 for further information.**

|                              |   |   |
|------------------------------|---|---|
| Motion                       | X | <b>This is not a Safety Document</b> , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is still technically sound and complete. ( <i>Regulations ¶ 8.7.1</i> ) |
|                              |   | <b>This is a Safety Document</b> , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is not technically sound and complete. ( <i>Regulations ¶ 8.7.2</i> )       |
|                              |   | Safety Checklist ( <i>Regulations ¶ 15.3</i> ) is complete and has been included with the Document throughout the balloting process. ( <i>Regulations ¶ 15.1.2</i> )        |
| Motion by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by |   | Brain Rubow (Cimetrix) / Matsuda Mitsuhiro (Hitachi Ltd)  |
| Discussion                   |   | None  |
| Vote                         |   | 8 Y-0 N; Motion <b>passed</b>   |

## IX. Intellectual Property (IP) Check

**Note: This Letter Ballot may cover all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline. See Regulations § 16 for further information.**

|                              |   |   |   |
|------------------------------|---|---|---|
| X                            | The TC Chapter meeting chair asked those participating, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline. ( <i>Regulations ¶ 8.8.1</i> ) |   |   |
|                              | X   | No potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known.  | GO TO SECTION X.  |
|                              |   | Potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known, but a Letter of Assurance (LOA) or copyright release letter for such items has been obtained or presented to the TC Chapter.  | GO TO SECTION X.  |
|                              |   | Potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known and use of such materials is technically justified by the TC Chapter, but an LOA or copyright release letter for some of the item(s) has NOT been obtained or presented to the TC Chapter. |   |
|                              | Motion  |   | Ask ISC for special permission to publish.                            |
|                              |   |   | Quit activity.  |
|                              |   |   | Wait for LOA for patented technology or release of copyrighted items. |
| Motion by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by |   | Name (Company)/Name (Company)   |   |
| Discussion                   |   | XXXX  |   |

|  |                     |           |               |
|--|---------------------|-----------|---------------|
|  | <b>Vote</b>         | XX Y-XX N |               |
|  | <b>Final Action</b> |           | Motion passed |
|  |                     |           | Motion failed |

\* **Note:** Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this Letter Ballot.

## X. Action for This Document

|   |                                     |  |
|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <b>Motion</b>                           | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | This Document passed TC Chapter review as balloted and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.  |
|   | <input type="checkbox"/>            | This Document passed TC Chapter review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.   |
|   | <input type="checkbox"/>            | This Document passed TC Chapter review with technical changes and with or without editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review. A Ratification Ballot will be issued to verify the technical changes. |
|   | <input type="checkbox"/>            | This Document failed TC Chapter review and will be returned to the TF for rework.  |
|   | <input type="checkbox"/>            | This Document failed TC Chapter review and work will be discontinued.  |
| <b>Motion by/<br/>2<sup>nd</sup> by</b> |                                     | Brian Rubow (Cimetrix) / Chris Maloney (INTEL)   |
| <b>Discussion</b>                       |                                     | None   |
| <b>Vote</b>                             |                                     | 7 Y-0 N  |
| <b>Final Action</b>                     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Motion passed  |
|   | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Motion failed  |

Standards staff to record the result of the A&R procedural review here:

|                |                          |  |
|----------------|--------------------------|--|
| <b>A&amp;R</b> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Approved for publication                               |
|                | <input type="checkbox"/> | Approved pending acceptance of the Ratification Ballot |
|                | <input type="checkbox"/> | Not approved   |
|                | <b>Reason:</b>           |  |