

Record of Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: [Japan](#)

Global Technical Committee: [Silicon Wafer](#)

TC Chapter Cochairs: [Naoyuki Kawai/self](#), [Tetsuya Nakai/SUMCO](#)

Standards Staff: [Junko Collins](#)

	Scheduled in Background Statement	Actual
Date	12/17/2015	12/17/2015
Location	Conference Tower, Tokyo Big Sight, Tokyo	Conference Tower, Tokyo Big Sight, Tokyo
Reason for Change of Date and/or Location (if changed)		

Note: See *Regulations* ¶ 9.5 Exception for allowable reason to change.

I. Document Number and Title

Document Number	Document Title
5893	Revision of SEMI M1-0915 SPECIFICATIONS FOR POLISHED SINGLE CRYSTAL SILICON WAFERS

II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: **As-cast tally after close of voting period**

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.7.1.1)

Voting Tally (with example values):

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes		Distribution	=	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	56	÷	91	=	61.5%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	17					
Voting Interest Reject(s)	0		Total Voters with Rejects		0	
Voting Interest Accept(s)	31					

Note: See *Regulations* § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

III. Rejects: No reject to this document

IV. Other Technical Issues: None for this document

Note: TC Chapter may choose to address a technical issue that is not part of a Negative received on a Letter Ballot (i.e., a Comment or a reason not addressed by a Vote response) by handling it as a Negative and finding it related and technically persuasive. The TC Chapter may then fail the Document or address such technical issue by using the procedure defined in *Regulations* § 9.6.4.3 to make a technical change to the Document. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.6.2.4.5)

V. Comments

V- (i) Voters' Comments

Commenter 1 (Supika Mashiro/TEL) - Comment 1

Comment	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph #, if necessary. 2.5	
	Related Information is not the official part of the Standard. If the guides for the specification of 300 and 450 mm diameter prime silicon wafers for the 32, 22, and 16 nm technology generations are given only in the Related Information, referring it in the Scope section is not appropriate.. I submit this as Comment as it is substantial in rule-wise but non-technical issue. I strongly suggest adopting this issue as a New Business as soon as the Ballot is approved and published.	
Action	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.	
	*No motion is required in this step.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #
	<input type="checkbox"/>	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Refer to the TF for more consideration.
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	New Business
Options for editorial change (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Case 1: No vote in this section: To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. <i>Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V.</i>
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Case 2: Voted in this section: Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.
	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph xxx
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx
2	FROM: Section/Paragraph xxx	
	TO: Section/Paragraph xxx	

	Justification (If necessary)
Motion	To approve above editorial change(s)
Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)
Discussion	XXXX
Vote	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.

Commenter 1 (Supika Mashiro/TEL) - Comment 2

Comment	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph #, if necessary. 7.5	
	The section headings: "Specifications for the 32, 22, and 16 nm Technology Generations" is confusing, as no specification but guides are provided. Change the heading to match with its contents.	
Action	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.	
	*No motion is required in this step.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #
	<input type="checkbox"/>	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Refer to the TF for more consideration.
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	New Business
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Editorial Change
	Options for editorial change (check one)	Case 1: No vote in this section: To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. <i>Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V.</i>
		Case 2: Voted in this section: Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.
	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph xxx
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx
Justification (If necessary)		
2	FROM: Section/Paragraph xxx	
	TO: Section/Paragraph xxx	
	Justification (If necessary)	
Motion	To approve above editorial change(s)	
Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	

Discussion	XXXX
Vote	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.

Commenter 1 (Supika Mashiro/TEL) - Comment 3

Comment	<p>*TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph #, if necessary. Appendix 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2002/95/EC has been superseded in 2011 by 2011/65/EU Similar Regulation applicable for electrical electronic equipment has been enacted in PRC since 2006. This APPENDIX should clarify that Silicon wafer itself is not electrical electronic equipment (EEE), and not in scope of the RoHS Directive, though as a mechanical separable part of IC chip that is most likely to be integrated in EEE, IC chip manufacturer or its downstream user would be concerned about if Si wafer contains any of restricted substance defined in RoHS Directive above restriction threshold levels <p>I recommend not to quote the actual requirements of such Regulations. I recommend that the APPENDIX should refer potentially relevant substance restriction Regulations by name, suggest possibility of similar Regulations to be adopted in future, and explain why restriction of substance contained in EEE is of a concern.</p>	
	<p>The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.</p> <p>*No motion is required in this step.</p>	
Action	<input type="checkbox"/>	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #
	<input type="checkbox"/>	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Refer to the TF for more consideration.
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	New Business
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Editorial Change
Options for editorial change (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<p>Case 1: No vote in this section: To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V.</p>
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<p>Case 2: Voted in this section: Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.</p>
	<input type="checkbox"/>	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	
Editorial Changes	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph xxx
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx
		Justification (If necessary)
	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph xxx
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx
		Justification (If necessary)

Motion	To approve above editorial change(s)
Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)
Discussion	XXXX
Vote	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.

V-(ii) Comments Created by Handling Negative: None for this document

VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V: None for this document

VII. Approval Conditions Check

VII. - (i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.2)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.3)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)					
Approval Rate	=	31	/	31	=	100.0%		≥90%	

VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

Note: See Regulations § 9.7.2 for further information.

Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):
 The Letter Ballot meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.

Need a Ratification Ballot:
 The Letter Ballot meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

VIII. Safety Check

Note: See *Regulations § 15* for further information.

Motion	X	This is not a Safety Document , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is still technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations ¶ 8.7.1</i>)
		This is a Safety Document , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is not technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations ¶ 8.7.2</i>)
		Safety Checklist (<i>Regulations ¶ 15.3</i>) is complete and has been included with the Document throughout the balloting process. (<i>Regulations ¶ 15.1.2</i>)
Motion by/2 nd by		Y. Takamori(GWJ)/ R. Takeda (GWJ)
Discussion		
Vote		14Y- 0N; Motion passed

IX. Intellectual Property (IP) Check

Note: This Letter Ballot may cover all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline. See *Regulations § 16* for further information.

	The TC Chapter meeting chair asked those participating, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline. (<i>Regulations ¶ 8.8.1</i>)	
Motion	X	No potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known. GO TO SECTION X.
		Potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known, but a Letter of Assurance (LOA) or copyright release letter for such items has been obtained or presented to the TC Chapter. GO TO SECTION X.
		Potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known and use of such materials is technically justified by the TC Chapter, but an LOA or copyright release letter for some of the item(s) has NOT been obtained or presented to the TC Chapter.
		Ask ISC for special permission to publish.
		Quit activity.
		Wait for LOA for patented technology or release of copyrighted items.
	Motion by/2 nd by	
Discussion		XXXX
Vote		XX Y-XX N
Final Action		Motion passed
		Motion failed

* Note: Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this Letter Ballot.

X. Action for This Document

Motion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This Document passed TC Chapter review as balloted and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This Document passed TC Chapter review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This Document passed TC Chapter review with technical changes and with or without editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review. A Ratification Ballot will be issued to verify the technical changes.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This Document failed TC Chapter review and will be returned to the TF for rework.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This Document failed TC Chapter review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/ 2nd by	Y. Takamori(GWJ)/ R. Takeda (GWJ)	
Discussion	Comments will be treated as a new business by the task force.	
Vote	14Y- 0N	
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed

Standards staff to record the result of the A&R procedural review here:

A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Approved for publication
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Approved pending acceptance of the Ratification Ballot
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
	Reason:	