

Record of Line-item Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: **North America**

Global Technical Committee: **Information and Control**

TC Chapter Cochairs: **Brian Rubow (Cimetrix); Jack Ghiselli (Ghiselli Consulting); James Moyne (Applied Materials, University of Michigan)**

Standards Staff: **Inna Skvortsova**

	Scheduled in Background Statement	Actual
Date	Wednesday, April 11, 2018	Wednesday, April 11, 2018
Location	SEMI HQ	SEMI HQ
Reason for Change of Date and/or Location (if changed)		

Note: See *Regulations* ¶ 9.5 Exception for allowable reason to change.

Document Information

I. Document Number, Title, Lists of Line Items

Document Number 6336		Document Title LINE ITEM REVISION TO SEMI E138-0217 SPECIFICATION FOR XML SEMICONDUCTOR COMMON COMPONENTS
List of Line Items	Line Item 1	Line Item Title Modify TypeDefinition Variables
	Line Item 2	Line Item Title Add Units to a Structure Field

Line Item 1 Adjudication

II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.1)

Voting Tally (with example values):

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes	Distribution	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	69	÷ 114	= 60.5%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	25			
Voting Interest Reject(s)	2	Total Voters with Rejects		2
Voting Interest Accept(s)	39			

Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

III. Rejects

Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: AFF_GlobalFoundires)

Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Downey, Jack / GlobalFoundires)

Negative 1

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.		
		n/a		
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.		
		This change places a burden on the End User and End User application for accounting for all variations changes possible which is not acceptable.		
		This comment from Table 18 'If there are zero type hints, then the parameter value can assume any primitive, array, structured, no value or enumerated value type and the type can change each time the value is reported.' is unacceptable. For any End User who is responsible for enabling automated and intelligent decisions on data values this change has now made this job more difficult.		
	TF input (optional)			
	Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection

Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	‘Related’ is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)		GO TO “Persuasive” subsection		
	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)				
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)				
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Reason	Statements are true. This is the feature requested by users because sometimes they cannot know the published type. For example, when the parameter is a placeholder for recipe data which is determined within the recipe.			
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Jack Ghiselli (Ghiselli Consulting) / Brian Rubow (Cimetrix)					
	Discussion	The feature could be abused. Recommendation to add requirements to restrict usage of this feature in SEMI E164.					
	Result of Vote (check one)	4 Y-0 N; Motion passed					
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Y	GO TO “Address by Technical Change Option” subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N	GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)			
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO “Not Significant Finding Option” subsection			
	Not Significant Finding Option	This option can be used only “if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)					
Use of “Not significant finding option” (check one)		<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “not significant”.			GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “significant”.			GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Whether or not the Negative is “not significant” is decided by a vote.				
Motion		The Negative is “not significant”.					
Motion by/ 2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)					
Vote		<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority			GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority			GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)		
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)			
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)			

		(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS
		(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
(check if applicable)		Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.		

Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 1

Check only when the Document has not been failed.

1	Original number (#) of Negatives	(g)	
0	Number of Negatives withdrawn	(h)	
0	Number of Negatives found not related	(i)	
0	Number of Negatives found not significant	(j)	
0	Number of Negatives addressed by technical change (Negative becomes not significant)	(k)	
Final		$g - (h + i + j + k) = 0$	Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
	X	$g - (h + i + j + k) > 0$	Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
		Reject without a Negative	Not Valid

Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)

Voting Interest Reject 2 (Voting Interest Name: Self)

Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Mitch Sakamoto)

Negative 1

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.	
		Table 18	
	Negative Text	<p>*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.</p> <p>Where: In Table 18, added text “If there are zero type hints, then the parameter value can assume any primitive, array, structured, no value or enumerated value type and the type can change each time the value is reported.”</p> <p>Negative: Defining “zero hint” may be all right, but text in the Table 18 should be corrected. The text suggests, when the hint is not specified (zero hint), the type of the parameter can be one of (1) primitive (2) array (3) structure (4) no value (5) enumerated value. Those types have already been defined in E138. Where any of those types can be selected at reporting the parameter, the fact can be described with associating hints for all types defined in E138. The zero hint might be intended to describe any unknown (may be defined by the supplier) parameter type.</p>	
	TF input (optional)	Ballot does not intend as the voter states. The intent is not to allow the supplier to define their own type. They must publish one of the existing E138 types.	
	Withdrawal (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter. GO TO “Related” subsection
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on 04/10/2018. GO TO “Final” subsection → (A)
Final	(check if applicable)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(A) Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B) Not related (counted under i in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(C) Related and not persuasive (significant)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D) Not significant (counted under j in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(E) Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change DOCUMENT FAILS
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(F) Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)
	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment #

Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 2

Check only when the Document has not been failed.

1	Original number (#) of Negatives	(g)
1	Number of Negatives withdrawn	(h)
0	Number of Negatives found not related	(i)
0	Number of Negatives found not significant	(j)
0	Number of Negatives addressed by technical change (Negative becomes not significant)	(k)
Final	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> $g - (h + i + j + k) = 0$	Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check

	$g - (h + i + j + k) > 0$	Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. <i>Approval Conditions Check</i>
	Reject without a Negative	Not Valid

Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (*Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3*)

Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2*)

IV. Other Technical Issues

NONE

V. Comments

V- (i) Voters' Comments

NONE

VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

NONE

VII. Approval Conditions Check

VII. - (i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (*Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.2*)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (*Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.3*)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)					
Approval Rate	=	35	/	36	=	97.2%		≥90%	

VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

Note: See *Regulations § 9.7.2* for further information.

Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):

Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.

Need a Ratification Ballot:

Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

Line Item 2 Adjudication

II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.1)

Voting Tally (with example values):

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes	Distribution	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	69	÷ 114	= 60.5%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	25			
Voting Interest Reject(s)	3	Total Voters with Rejects		3
Voting Interest Accept(s)	40			

Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

III. Rejects

Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: AFF_GlobalFoundires)

Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Downey, Jack / GlobalFoundires)

Negative 1

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.		
		Table 13		
Negative	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.		
		In the Table 13 under Form for unit = 'When the attribute is included.....'. 'When' as the Customer indicates at least two variations that need to be accounted for OEM implementations. Our request is 'it is' required or remove the addition of 'unit'		
TF input (optional)				
	Withdrawal (check one)	X	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	X	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
	Motion and Reason	X	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)	

Persuasive	(check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)				
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Reason	The unit is optional on purpose in this ballot. Will rework the ballot to clarify when a unit is required to be included and when it should be excluded since this is not clear.			
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Albert Fuchigami (PEER Group) / Brian Rubow (Cimetrix)					
	Discussion						
	Result of Vote (check one)	6 Y-0 N; Motion passed					
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	GO TO “Address by Technical Change Option” subsection
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> X	<input type="checkbox"/> N	GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)	
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)				
<input type="checkbox"/>		90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO “Not Significant Finding Option” subsection				
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)			
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)			
	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment #				

Checks for Entire Document Including All Approved Line Items

VIII. Safety Check

Note: This Safety check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items. See § 15 of the *Regulations* for further information.

Motion	X	This is not a Safety Document , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is still technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.7.1)
		This is a Safety Document , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is not technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.7.2)
		Safety Checklist (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 15.3) is complete and has been included with the Document throughout the balloting process. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 15.1.2)
Motion by/2nd by		Chris Maloney (Intel) / Nick Infelise (Omron)
Discussion		NONE
Vote		6 Y-0 N; Motion passed

IX. Intellectual Property (IP) Check

Note: This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items. See § 16 of the *Regulations* for further information.

X	The TC Chapter meeting chair asked those participating, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.8.1)	
X	No potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known.	GO TO SECTION X.

* Note: Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this Letter Ballot.

X. Action for This Document

Motion (Check all applicable items)		Line item(s) #1 passed TC Chapter review as balloted and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.	
		Line item(s) #2 failed TC Chapter review and will be returned to the TF for rework.	
Motion by/ 2nd by		Albert Fuchigami (PEER Group) / Chris Maloney (Intel)	
Discussion		NONE	
Vote		6 Y-0 N	
Final Action			Motion passed
			Motion failed

Standards staff to record the result of the A&R procedural review here:

A&R		Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are Approved for publication
		Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are Approved pending acceptance of the Ratification Ballot
		Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are Not approved
	Reason:	