

Record of Line-item Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: **North America**

Global Technical Committee: **Information and Control**

TC Chapter Cochairs: **Brian Rubow (Cimetrix); Jack Ghiselli (Ghiselli Consulting); James Moyne (Applied Materials, University of Michigan)**

Standards Staff: **Inna Skvortsova**

	Scheduled in Background Statement	Actual
Date	Wednesday, April 11, 2018	Wednesday, April 11, 2018
Location	SEMI HQ	SEMI HQ
Reason for Change of Date and/or Location (if changed)		

Note: See *Regulations* ¶ 9.5 Exception for allowable reason to change.

Document Information

I. Document Number, Title, Lists of Line Items

Document Number 6337		Document Title LINE ITEM REVISION TO SEMI E132-1015 SPECIFICATION FOR EQUIPMENT CLIENT AUTHENTICATION AND AUTHORIZATION
List of Line Items	Line Item 1	Line Item Title SessionPing Clarification
	Line Item 2	Line Item Title New Operation ChangeClientEndPoint.
	Line Item 3	Line Item Title Remove Operation EnhancedEstablishSession.

Line Item 1 Adjudication

II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: **As-cast tally after close of voting period**

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.1)

Voting Tally (with example values):

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes	Distribution	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	69	÷ 114	= 60.5%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	25			
Voting Interest Reject(s)	2	Total Voters with Rejects		2
Voting Interest Accept(s)	37			

Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

III. Rejects

Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: Self)

Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Mitch Sakamoto)

Negative 1

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.		
		Where: 1.1.3 Proposal to add EstablishSession2		
Negative	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.		
		EstablishSession2 service should not be required. The service requires to change session ping conditions each time establishing session. It requires users to select one service of establishing session form two options, EstablishSession and EstablishSession2. For the alternate, I would like to propose (1) define default of those settings (2) define Change Session Ping Settings service. The Change Session Ping Setting service may have session Id in the parameter. In that definition, the session Id will be optional. In the case the session Id is not given, all sessions are specified the settings specified in the service. For example, the definition is; Change Session Ping Settings Parameter Definition		
	TF input (optional)			
	Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)	
			Reason	

	Motion by/ 2nd by	Albert Fuchigami (PEER Group) / Chris Maloney (Intel)				
	Discussion	NONE				
	Result of Vote (check one)	6 Y-0 N; Motion passed				
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> X	<input type="checkbox"/> N	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection		
		<input type="checkbox"/>				
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)		
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)		
	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment #			

Line Item 2 Adjudication

II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.1)

Voting Tally (with example values):

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes		Distribution	=	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	69	÷	114	=	60.5%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	25					
Voting Interest Reject(s)	1		Total Voters with Rejects		1	
Voting Interest Accept(s)	35					

Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

III. Rejects

Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: **AFF_ASM**)

Voter Reject 1 (Voter: **Takasaki, Yoshihisa**)

Negative 1

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.				
		n/a				
Negative	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.				
		Usage of this message is unclear. New message seems redundant. Server can achieve same function by sending CloseSession to old client, then send EstablishSession to new client.				
TF input (optional)						
Withdrawal (check one)		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.		GO TO "Related" subsection	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)			
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)			
		Reason	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposed new method is not the same as closing a session and establishing a new one because data can be lost using this technique. The new method allows for instantaneous change of the target EDA client URL as a failover. This is explained in the ballot's background statement. 			
Persuasive	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Albert Fuchigami (PEER Group) / Brian Rubow (Cimetrix)				
	Discussion	NONE				
	Result of Vote (check one)	6 Y-0 N; Motion passed				
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Y GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)			
Not Sign		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection		
	This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)					

	Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant".	GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "significant".	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote.	
	Motion	The Negative is "not significant".		
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)
<input type="checkbox"/>		XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)	
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # .		

Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 1

Check only when the Document has not been failed.

1	Original number (#) of Negatives	(g)	
0	Number of Negatives withdrawn	(h)	
0	Number of Negatives found not related	(i)	
0	Number of Negatives found not significant	(j)	
0	Number of Negatives addressed by technical change (Negative becomes not significant)	(k)	
Final	<input type="checkbox"/>	$g - (h + i + j + k) = 0$	Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	$g - (h + i + j + k) > 0$	Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Reject without a Negative	Not Valid

Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)

Line Item 3 Adjudication

II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.1)

Voting Tally (with example values):

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes	Distribution	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	69	÷ 114	= 60.5%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	25			
Voting Interest Reject(s)	1	Total Voters with Rejects		1
Voting Interest Accept(s)	35			

Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

III. Rejects

Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: AFF_GlobalFoundries)

Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Downey, Jack)

Negative 1

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.		
		n/a		
Negative	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.		
		EnhancedEstablishSession is an integral component of our EDA client implementation. Optional wording would be acceptable, but cannot remove altogether		
	TF input (optional)			
	Withdrawal (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.	GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)
Final	(check if applicable)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)

		(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS
		(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
(check if applicable)		Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # .		

Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 1

Check only when the Document has not been failed.

1	Original number (#) of Negatives	(g)	
1	Number of Negatives withdrawn	(h)	
0	Number of Negatives found not related	(i)	
0	Number of Negatives found not significant	(j)	
0	Number of Negatives addressed by technical change (Negative becomes not significant)	(k)	
Final	X	$g - (h + i + j + k) = 0$	Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
		$g - (h + i + j + k) > 0$	Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
		Reject without a Negative	Not Valid

Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)

IV. Other Technical Issues

NONE

V. Comments

V- (i) Voters' Comments
NONE

VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

NONE

VII. Approval Conditions Check

VII. - (i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.2)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.3)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)					
Approval Rate	=	35	/	35	=	100.0%		≥90%	

VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

Note: See *Regulations* § 9.7.2 for further information.

Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):

Line Item 3 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.

Need a Ratification Ballot:

Line Item 3 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

Checks for Entire Document Including All Approved Line Items

VIII. Safety Check

Note: This Safety check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items. See § 15 of the *Regulations* for further information.

Motion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This is not a Safety Document , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is still technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.7.1)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This is a Safety Document , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is not technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.7.2)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Safety Checklist (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 15.3) is complete and has been included with the Document throughout the balloting process. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 15.1.2)
Motion by/2nd by		Chris Maloney (Intel) / Nick Infelise (Omron)
Discussion		NONE
Vote		6 Y-0 N; Motion <u>passed</u>

IX. Intellectual Property (IP) Check

Note: This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items. See § 16 of the *Regulations* for further information.

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The TC Chapter meeting chair asked those participating, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.8.1)	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known.	GO TO SECTION X.

* Note: Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this Letter Ballot.

X. Action for This Document

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [1] passed TC Chapter review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.	
Motion by/ 2nd by		Albert Fuchigami (PEER Group) / Chris Maloney (Intel)
Discussion		NONE
Vote		6 Y-0 N
Final Action		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Motion passed
		<input type="checkbox"/> Motion failed

Standards staff to record the result of the A&R procedural review here:

A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are Approved for publication
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are Approved pending acceptance of the Ratification Ballot
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are Not approved
	Reason:	