

Procedural Review Voting Sheet 2015 Cycle 1

REGION: **China**
 COMMITTEE: **Photovoltaic**
 EVENT: **SEMI China PV Standard TC Spring Meeting 2015**
 DATE OF MEETING: **2015/3/17**
 PLACE OF MEETING: **Pudong Ballroom 4, Kerry Hotel, Pudong, Shanghai**
 COMMITTEE CO-CHAIRS: **Guangchun Zhang/CSI, Jun Liu/CESI**
 SEMI STAFF: **Kris Shen**

A&R Voter: **Name/Company**
 Date: **200X/MM/DD**

I. Document Number & Title

Document 5728	Document Title New Standard: Test Method for the Wire Tension of Multi-wire Saws
--------------------------	---

II. Tally (Staff to fill in)

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

A minimum of 60% of the voting interests that have voting members within the technical committee must return votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.1)

	Return	÷	Distribution	=	Return Rate	
Yellow	93		154		60.4%	≥60%
Lilac & Others	83					
Total Vote	176					
Reject	2					
Accept	41					

A&R		Not approved
		Reason:

III. Rejects

Reject 1 (Takashi Ishihara/Mitsubishi Electric Corporation)

Negative 1 of Reject 1

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	Reason	The name of the commercial product (brick master) in section 2.2 should not be included.	
	Withdrawal	<input type="checkbox"/>	No withdrawal made GO TO "Related" section
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by staff on Mar.13 GO TO "Final" → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/>	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.
		<input type="checkbox"/>	*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)
		Reason	XXXX
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related] > 1/3
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related] < 2/3
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=< [Negative is not related]
		<input type="checkbox"/>	
		GO TO "Persuasive"	
		GO TO "Final" → (B)	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)
			Reason
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion		
		Result of Vote (check ONE)	<input type="checkbox"/>
<input type="checkbox"/>			[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3
<input type="checkbox"/>			2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%
<input type="checkbox"/>			90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]
		GO TO "Final" → (E)	
		GO TO "Final" → (C)	
		GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"	

Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used “if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.3.2)		
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “not significant”	GO TO → (D)
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “significant”	GO TO → (C)
	Motion	The negative is “not significant”.	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Vote	XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority		GO TO → (C)	
Final	Negative is:		
	X (A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
	(B)	not related (counted under i in disposition)	
	(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)	
	(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
	(E)	related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
	Comment generated. See comment #x		
A&R	Not approved		
	Reason:		

Disposition of Reject 1

1	Original number of Negatives	(g)	
1	# of Negatives withdrawn	(h)	
0	# of Negatives found not related	(i)	
0	# of Negatives found not significant	(j)	
Final	X	$g-(h+i+j)=0$	Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
		$g-(h+i+j)>0$	Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
		Reject without a Negative	Not Valid

Note: If all of the negative material included with a reject vote is withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the reject vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

A&R	Not approved		
	Reason:		

Reject 2 (Huang, Der-Ray / Dong Hwa University)

Negative 1 of Reject 2

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	Reason	No direct relationship with the photovoltaics.	
Withdrawal	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX	GO TO "Final" → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.	
		*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)	
		Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
	Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Discussion			
Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related] < 2/3	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Final" → (B)
<input type="checkbox"/>			
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)
	Reason	Multi-wire saws is an important process in the photovoltaic industry, and the ability of controlling wire tension is the core index of Multi-wire Saws, which directly determines the stability of the device and cutting quality, thus affects the quality of photovoltaic cells. We think the test method has direct relationship related to photovoltaic.	
	Motion by/2nd by	Honglin Sui (CETC-48th)/ Zhixin Li (Linton)	
	Discussion	None	
Result of Vote (check ONE)	32-0		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO "Final" → (E)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	
<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (C)	

		X	90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used "if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.3.2)			
		X	It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "not significant"	GO TO → (D)
			It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "significant"	GO TO → (C)
	Motion		The negative is "not significant".	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
Vote		XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)	
		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (C)	
Final	Negative is:			
		(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
		(B)	not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)	
	X	(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
		(E)	related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
	Comment generated. See comment #x			
A&R		Not approved		
	Reason:			

Disposition of Reject 2

1	Original number of Negatives	(g)	
0	# of Negatives withdrawn	(h)	
0	# of Negatives found not related	(i)	
1	# of Negatives found not significant	(j)	
Final	X	$g-(h+i+j)=0$	Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
		$g-(h+i+j)>0$	Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
		Reject without a Negative	Not Valid

Note: If all of the negative material included with a reject vote is withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the reject vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

A&R		Not approved
	Reason:	

IV. Comments

Comment 1

Comment	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary		
	From	Vargas-Bernal, Rafael (ITSdl)		
	Comment	Accept Comments : In subsection 4.2.6, separate 'Tpl' of 'when'. In subsections 6.1.2, 6.1.3, 7.1.1, and 9.2, separate symbols and values.		
	Discussion	The document was reviewed carefully and revised to meet the SEMI editor's requirement.		
Action proposed	Editorial Change	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The committee agreed to do one of the following actions.	
			*No motion is required in this step.	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	No further action was taken by the committee.	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Refer to the task force for more consideration.	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Other	
Action proposed	Editorial Change		Case 1: No vote in this section :	
			To be included and voted on in § 5. Summary of Editorial Changes.	
			Case 2: Voted in this section :	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in “FROM” and “TO” fields.	
		1	FROM: Section 4.2.1	The i^{th} set value of the wire tension ($i= 1, 2, 3 \dots n$).
			To: Section 4.2.1	The i^{th} set value of the wire tension ($i= 1, 2, 3 \dots n$).
Justification (If necessary)				
2	FROM: Section 6.1.1	Ambient temperature: 18°C~28°C.		
	To: Section 6.1.1	Ambient temperature: 18°C~28°C.		
	Justification (If necessary)			
3	FROM: Section 6.1.2	Relative humidity <75%.		

	<p>To: Section 6.1.2</p> <p>Relative humidity < 75%.</p> <p>Justification (If necessary)</p>
4	<p>FROM: Section 6.1.3</p> <p>Voltage fluctuations do not exceed rating of $\pm 10\%$.</p>
	<p>To: Section 6.1.3</p> <p>Voltage fluctuations do not exceed rating of $\pm 10\%$.</p> <p>Justification (If necessary)</p>
	<p>FROM: Section 7.1.1</p> <p>Strain-gauge tensionmeter with wire diameter compensator (accuracy better than 0.5%, the maximum wire speed $\geq 1000\text{m / min}$)</p>
5	<p>To: Section 7.1.1</p> <p>Strain-gauge tensionmeter with wire diameter compensator (accuracy better than 0.5%, the maximum wire speed $\geq 1000\text{m / min}$)</p> <p>Justification (If necessary)</p>
	<p>FROM: Section 8.3.1</p> <p>Select T_{low} as the first set value T_{s1}, $T_{s1} = T_{low}$.</p>
	<p>To: Section 8.3.1</p> <p>Select T_{low} as the first set value T_{s1}, $T_{s1} = T_{low}$.</p> <p>Justification (If necessary)</p>
7	<p>FROM: Section 8.3.2</p> <p>The rest set values can be calculated by the formula $T_{si} = T_{s1} + (i-1) \times 2$ (2N is the recommended increase step size).</p>
	<p>To: Section 8.3.2</p> <p>The rest set values can be calculated by the formula $T_{si} = T_{s1} + (i-1) \times 2$ (2N is the recommended increase step size).</p> <p>Justification (If necessary)</p>
	<p>FROM: Section 8.3.3</p> <p>The selection for T_{sn}: When $T_{si} = T_{s1} + (i-1) \times 2 \geq T_{up}$, set $n=i$, $T_{sn} = T_{up}$.</p>
8	<p>To: Section 8.3.3</p> <p>The selection for T_{sn}: When $T_{si} = T_{s1} + (i-1) \times 2 \geq T_{up}$, set $n=i$, $T_{sn} = T_{up}$.</p> <p>Justification (If necessary)</p>

9	FROM: Section 8.4 Set the wire speed of the multi-wire saws to process speed. When the set value is T_{si} , $T_{pi}(j=1,2,3\dots m)$ should be recorded every few seconds, the test procedure of T_{pi} is shown in Figure 3 (recommended interval time is 10s, $m = 5$, $\Delta T=0.3N$).
	To: Section 8.4 Set the wire speed of the multi-wire saws to process speed. When the set value is T_{si} , $T_{pi}(j=1,2,3\dots m)$ should be recorded every few seconds, the test procedure of T_{pi} is shown in Figure 3 (recommended interval time is 10s, $m = 5$, $\Delta T=0.3N$).
	Justification (If necessary)
10	FROM: Section 9.2 According to Figure 4, the range of T_{pi} between T_{min_i} and T_{max_i} is $[T_{s2}, T_{s21}]$, which is the effective control range of wire tension (recommended $T_{max_i}=T_{si}+1$, $T_{min_i}=T_{si}-1$).
	To: Section 9.2 According to Figure 4, the range of T_{pi} between T_{min_i} and T_{max_i} is $[T_{s2}, T_{s21}]$, which is the effective control range of wire tension (recommended $T_{max_i}=T_{si}+1$, $T_{min_i}=T_{si}-1$).
	Justification (If necessary)
Motion by/2nd	Honglin Sui (CETC-48th)/ Zhixin Li (Linton)
Vote	34-0 Motion passed
A&R	Not approved
	Reason:

Comment 2

Comment	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary
	From	Gan, Yang (Harbin Institute of Technology)
	Comment	Abstain Comments : Strongly recommend polishing English carefully.
	Discussion	The document was reviewed carefully and revised to meet the SEMI editor's requirement.
Action proposed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The committee agreed to do one of the following actions.
		*No motion is required in this step.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	No further action was taken by the committee.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Refer to the task force for more consideration.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	New Business
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Other
	Editorial Change	

	Case 1: No vote in this section :
	To be included and voted on in § 5. Summary of Editorial Changes .
X	Case 2: Voted in this section : Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in “FROM” and “TO” fields.
1	FROM: Section 4.2.4 The allowable deviation of practical value.
	To: Section 4.2.4 The allowable deviation of the practical value.
	Justification (If necessary)
2	FROM: Section 4.2.7 Tup--The upper limit value of the control range for wire tension, determined by the performance parameters of equipment.
	To: Section 4.2.7 Tup--The upper limit value of the control range for wire tension, determined by the performance parameters of equipments.
	Justification (If necessary)
3	FROM: Section 5.1 The test method uses a single-point measurement. Schematic diagram is shown in Figure 1. Select a point between the winding wheel and the main roller, than wire tension values can be measured with a strain-gauge tension meter.
	To: Section 5.1 The test method uses a single-point measurement. Schematic diagram is shown in Figure 1. Select a point between the winding wheel and the main roller, then wire tension values can be measured with a strain-gauge tension meter.
	Justification (If necessary)
Motion by/2nd	Honglin Sui (CETC-48th)/ Zhixin Li (Linton)
Vote	34-0 Motion passed
A&R	Not approved
	Reason:

V. Summary of Editorial Changes

Note: Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in “FROM” and “TO” fields.

1	FROM: Section 2.2 The document is applicable to tension test of brick master and other wire cutting equipments.
	TO: Section 2.2 The document is applicable to tension test of brick cutter and-other wire cutting equipments.
	Justification: (If necessary)

Motion	To approve the above editorial changes
Motion by/2nd by	Honglin Sui (CETC-48th)/ Zhixin Li (Linton)
Discussion	The above editorial changes are appropriate.
Vote	34-0 Motion passed
A&R	Not approved
	Reason:

VI. Approval Conditions Check

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, or not persuasive. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of the valid accept and reject votes must be accept. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.3)

Note: if both approval conditions are not satisfied, the document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid)		
Approval Rate	=	<input type="text" value="41"/>	/	<input type="text" value="41"/>	=	<input type="text" value="100.0%"/> >=90%

A&R	Not approved
	Reason:

VII. Safety Check

See § 14 of the Regulations for further information

Motion:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This is not a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is still technically sound and complete.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This is a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is not technically sound and complete.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Safety Checklist (Regulations ¶ 14.3) is complete and has been included with the document throughout the balloting process.
Motion by/2nd by	Honglin Sui (CETC-48th)/ Zhixin Li (Linton)	
Discussion	None	
Vote	34-0 Motion passed	
A&R	Not approved	
	Reason:	

VIII. Intellectual Property Check

Note: This ballot may be all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline. See § 15 of the Regulations for further information

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The meeting chair asked those present in person or by electronic link, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline.	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known	GO TO SECTION IX
<input type="checkbox"/>	Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but a Letter of Assurance (LOA) or copyright release for such material has been obtained or presented to the committee.	GO TO SECTION IX
<input type="checkbox"/>	Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but an LOA or copyright release for some of the material(s) has NOT been obtained or presented to the committee	
MOTION	<input type="checkbox"/>	Ask ISC for special permission to publish
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Quit activity
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Wait for LOA for patented technology or release of copyrighted items.
Motion by/2nd by		
Discussion		
Vote		
Final Action	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion Passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion Failed
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Reason:

* Note: Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this ballot.

IX. Action for this document

Motion	<input type="checkbox"/>	This document passed committee review as balloted and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.	
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This document passed committee review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This document failed committee review and will be returned to the task force for rework.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This document failed committee review and work will be discontinued.	
Motion by/2nd by		Honglin Sui (CETC-48th)/ Zhixin Li (Linton)	
Discussion		None	
Vote		34-0	
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed	
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Approved	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved	

Reason: