## Record of Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: North America Global Technical Committee: Information & Control TC Chapter Cochairs: Brian Rubow (Cimetrix), Jack Ghiselli (Ghiselli Consulting), James Moyne (AMAT / University of Michigan) Standards Staff: Michelle Sun

	Scheduled in Background Statement	Actual
Date	4/5/2023	4/5/2023
Location	Milpitas, CA	Milpitas, CA
Reason for Change of Date and/or Location (if changed)		

Note: See *Regulations* ¶ 9.5 Exceptions for allowable reason to change.

### I. Document Number and Title

7002 Revision to SEMI E13	2-0922 Specification for
Equipment Client Aut and SEMI E132.2-042	thentication and Authorization 2e Specification for Protocol at Client Authentication and

### **II. Tally**

Standards staff to fill in.

### Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.6.2.1.1)

#### Voting Tally (with example values):

Voting Interest:	<b>Returned Votes</b>		Distribution		Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	90	÷	147	=	61.2%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	44	]				
Voting Interest Reject(s)	1		Total	Vote	rs with Rejects	1
Voting Interest Accept(s)	57	]				

Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

## **III. Rejects**

## Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: Doople) Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Hyungsu Kim) Negative 1

neg	ative 1								
	Referenced Section/	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in	, including text in the ballot if neo	cessary.					
	Paragraph	Table 34							
Negative		*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.							
tive	Negative Text	must include all parame That is, notificationReci (Since the result of the of Message, the Notification	on Attribute, parameters received eters except Password. ipient must also be included. change session must be confirm on Message has become a ther than an optional one.)						
TF	input (optional)								
	Withdrawal	x No Negative withdra	wal made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection					
	(check one)	Withdrawal documer MM/DD/YYYY.	nt received by Standards staff on	GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (A)					
	Motion and	x 'Related' is mutually	agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection					
	Reason	Negative is not relate	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)						
	(check one)	Reason	xxxx						
Related	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Name (Company)/Name	(Company)						
ated	Discussion								
		XX Y-XX N; Motion passe	ed/failed.						
	Result of Vote (check one)	[Negative is not relat	red.] < 2/3	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection					
		2/3 ≤ [Negative is no	t related.]	GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (B)					
		Negative is related a	nd persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes	to pass.)					
		x Negative is related a	x Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)						
Persuasive	Motion and Reason <mark>(check one)</mark>		The security admin agent gets the GetActiveSession() operation The security admin agent does n	n. ot need to know who is receiving					
sive		Reason	notification messages for the set This information is not required	by the security admin agent to					
	Motion by/		perform session management a session)	ctivities (e.g., decide to close a					
	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	By: Albert Fuchigami / PE Second: Brian Rubow / C							
-									

	Discussion	Non	e							
		11 Y	11 Y-0 N; Motion passed.							
	Result of Vote		[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3 change recommended?			Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection			
	(check one)		[Negative is related persuasive.] < 2/3		(check one)		Ν	GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (E)		
			2/3 ≤ [Negative is i and not persuasive	e.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" s	ubsec	ctio	n → (C)		
		x	90% ≤ [Negative is and not persuasive	ə.]	_			inding Option" subsection		
N			sed only "if the TC he persons voting					uasive by a vote equal to or 1.4.5.2)		
Not Significant Finding Option	Use of "Not significant finding option" <mark>(check one)</mark>	x	It is mutually agree significant".	ed upon to		GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)				
			It is mutually agree "significant".	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)						
Fin			Whether or not the	e Negative	is "not significant"	is deci	ideo	d by a vote.		
ding	Motion	The	Negative is "not sig	gnificant".						
	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Nam	ne (Company)/Nam	ie (Compar	ıy)					
	Vote		XX Y-XX N; Motior	n passed w	vith simple majority	/		GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (D)		
	Vole		XX Y-XX N; Motior	n failed wit	n simple majority			GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)		
			(A)	Withdrawn	(counted under	h in di	ispo	osition)		
			<b>(B)</b>	Not related	(counted under	i in di	spo	osition)		
	(check if		(C)	Related ar	nd not persuasive (	signifi	can	t)		
Final	applicable)	x	• •		cant <mark>(counted unc</mark>		n di	sposition)		
a			(E)	addressed	nd persuasive and by technical chan	ge		DOCUMENT FAILS		
			(F)	Addressed	by technical chan	ge <mark>(cc</mark>	oun	ted under k disposition)		
	(check if applicable) table is peeded f		Comment generate	ed. <mark>See Se</mark>	ection V-(ii) Comn	nent #	<b>X</b> .			

This table is needed for each Negative.

### Negative 2

N	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballo 13.2.6.6	ot if necessary.
Negative	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justif copied.	fication, suggestion) should be
		If operationalRecipient parameter is Consumer> the operationalRecipient parameter's value If operationalRecipient parameter is 'Consumer' ('	
TF	input (optional)		
Withdrawal (check one)		No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection

		x	Withdrawal doo 4/4/2023.	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on $4/4/2023$ . GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (A)						
		x	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in dis	position)					
			(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)						
	(check if		(C)	Related and not persuasive (significa	ant)					
Final	applicable)		(D)	Not significant (counted under j in c	lisposition)					
al	1al		<b>(E)</b>	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS					
		nted under k disposition)								
	(check if applicable)		Comment gene	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.						

This table is needed for each Negative.

### Negative 3

1109	ative 3								
	Referenced Section/ Paragraph		TC Chapter to fill in, ir le 20	ncluding text in the ballot if nec	essary.				
Negative	Negative Text	copi ♦R Tabl > Dep	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. Reject. 3 Table 20 Adding an ACLEntry Using a Salt Value from an Equipment Server > Depending on the implementation, in the process of adding a new entry for AddACL						
		in the U.I, the Client ID for the scheduled ACL Entry may be created in advance and transmitted. However, in a normal scenario, the ClientID cannot be sent because the ClientID is in a not assigned state in the process for AddACL.							
TFi	nput (optional)								
	Withdrawal		No Negative withdrawa	I made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection				
	(check one)		Withdrawal document r MM/DD/YYYY.	GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (A)					
	Motion and	x	'Related' is mutually ag	reed upon. (Needs no motion.)	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection				
	Reason		Negative is not related.	(Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)					
	(check one)		Reason	xxxx					
Reli	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Nam	ne (Company)/Name (Co	ompany)					
Related	Discussion								
		XX۱	/-XX N; Motion passed/	/failed.					
	Result of Vote (check one)		[Negative is not related	.] < 2/3	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection				
	(3)		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not re	GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)					
Persuas ve	Motion and Reason		Negative is related and	persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes 1	to pass.)				
Jasi	(check one)	not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 vot	es to pass.)						

	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by			Table 20 describes how GetNewSalt() and AddACLEntry() ar used to add a new ACL Entry. How the security admin agent gets the clientId to use for the ne ACL Entry is implementation specific (e.g. it may be through th 					
	Discussion	Non	-						
	Result of Vote	12 Y	7-0 <b>N</b> ; Motion pass [Negative is relate persuasive.] > 1/3	d and	Is a technical change recommended?		Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection	
	(check one)		[Negative is relate persuasive.] < 2/3		(check one)		Ν	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
			$2/3 \le$ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%		GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (C)				
		x	90% ≤ [Negative is and not persuasive		GO TO "Not Sig	ignificant Finding Option" subsection			
z		be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or $\frac{1}{2}$ of the persons voting on the action". ( <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 9.6.1.4.5.2)							
ot Sigr	Use of "Not	x	It is mutually agree significant".	ed upon to		GO TO "Final" subsection $\Rightarrow$ (D)			
Not Significant Find Option	significant finding option" (check one)		It is mutually agree "significant".	ed upon to	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)				
Find			Whether or not the	•	is "not significant"	is de	cide	d by a vote.	
ding	Motion	The	Negative is "not sig	gnificant".					
	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Nam	ne (Company)/Nam	ne (Compar	ıy)				
	Vote		XX Y-XX N; Motio	n passed w	ith simple majority	/		GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (D)	
			XX Y-XX N; Motio	n failed with	n simple majority			GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)	
			(A)	Withdrawn	(counted under	h in (	disp	osition)	
					(counted under		_		
-	(check if		(C)	Related and not persuasive (signif				,	
Final	applicable)	х	(D)	Ű	ant (counted und	-	in di	sposition)	
=			(E)	addressed	d persuasive and by technical chan	ge		DOCUMENT FAILS	
	(obset if		(F)	Addressed	by technical chan	ige <mark>(</mark>	coun	ited under k disposition)	
	(check if applicable)		Comment generat	ed. <mark>See Se</mark>	ection V-(ii) Comn	nent	<b># X</b> .		

Neg	ative 4	*TE/	TC Chapter to fill i	in i	ncluding text in the ballot if neo				
	Referenced Section/ Paragraph		2.6.9	,		,cssary.			
			ginal complete Ne ied.	gati	ve text (e.g., issue, justificatior	n, suggestion) should be			
Negative	Negative Text	Whe plai obta > Tha The Get Cha The inte How Orig	ntext ACL passwo ained using the Int t is, the client mus refore, it is approp EquipmentInforma IlengeToken? salt value is a key rface process? v about changing ( ginally, GetEquipme eive EquipmentID,	on, rd. <sup>1</sup> erfa at all oriat tior v att Get but	ablish a Session Client is assumed to know the The equipmentId can be aceDiscovery interface. ready know all the information e to omit to receive salt from each b. Why not just get the ribute used for encryption. Is it EquipmentInformationRequest Information was created for the since its purpose has to change the name to suit the	used in AddACL. quipment again through safe to expose it in the to 'GetNewToken'? e purpose of the interface to			
TF i	nput <mark>(optional)</mark>								
	Withdrawal		No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.			GO TO "Related" subsection			
	(check one)		Withdrawal docum MM/DD/YYYY.	ent	GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (A)				
	Motion and	x	'Related' is mutual	ly ag	greed upon. (Needs no motion.)	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection			
	Motion and Reason		Negative is not rela	ated	(Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)				
	(check one)		Reason		xxxx				
Relat	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Nam	ame (Company)/Name (Company)						
ated	Discussion								
		XX Y	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.						
	Result of Vote (check one)		[Negative is not rel	atec	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection				
			2/3 ≤ [Negative is r	2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]		GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (B)			
Persuasi ve	Motion and Reason		Negative is related	anc	l persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes	to pass.)			
suasi ve	(check one)	x	Negative is related	and	l not persuasive. <mark>(Needs ≥2/3 vo</mark>	tes to pass.)			

			Reason	and no to cald to be opera The s composecret The e using Don't GetNe client	eeds to get it from culate the correct e provided thre tion. alt value helps ma ute hashes for pas t value. It is OK expectation is that secure communic want to rer ewToken() since w	the Ec passw ough ake it l ssword to tra t the cations name re get l	quip vord th harc d att nsm Clie s to Q both	D does not know the salt value, ment Server in order to be able hashes. That is why it needs e GetEquipmentInformation() der to use lookup tables to pre- acks. It does not need to be a hit from the Equipment Server. ent and Equipment Server are protect this information. GetEquipmentInformation() to h the salt value (for the specified ill as the challengeToken from		
	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by		Albert Fuchigami / P ond: Brian Rubow / (							
	Discussion	Non								
		13 Y	-0 N; Motion passed	d.						
	Result of Vote	[Negative is related persuasive.] > 1/3		and	ld Is a technical change recommended?		Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection		
	(check one)		[Negative is related persuasive.] < 2/3	and not	(check one)		Ν	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)		
		2/3 ≤ [Negative is			GO TO "Final" subsect					
			and not persuasive. 90% ≤ [Negative is							
		X	and not persuasive.	]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or					
N			sed only "if the TC he persons voting							
Not Sign	Use of "Not	x	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant".					GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)		
nificant Finding Option	significant finding option" (check one)		It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "significant".					GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)		
Fin			Whether or not the	Negative i	s "not significant"	is dec	ide	d by a vote.		
ding	Motion	The	Negative is "not sigr	nificant".						
	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Nam	ne (Company)/Name	(Compan	y)					
	Vote		XX Y-XX N; Motion	passed w	ith simple majority	/		GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (D)		
			XX Y-XX N; Motion	failed with	simple majority			GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (C)		
			<b>(A)</b> V	Vithdrawn	(counted under	h in d	isp	osition)		
			<b>(B)</b> N	lot related	(counted under	i in di	ispo	osition)		
Final	(check if				d not persuasive (	<b>.</b>		,		
a	applicable)	x		0	ant (counted und	-	ו n di	sposition)		
			( <b>⊏)</b> a	ddressed	d persuasive and by technical chan	ge		DOCUMENT FAILS		
			(F) A	aaressed	by technical chan	ige <mark>(c</mark>	oun	ted under k disposition)		

(check if	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.
applicable)	

### Negative 5

	ative 5							
	Referenced Section/		ill in, including text in the bal	lot if necessary.				
	Paragraph	13.2.7						
Negative	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. 13.2.7 > Agree to 2 Step Endpoint Change due to implementation issues. However, the process of initiating is already included in the meaning of change as a service name. So, don't call InitiateChangeSessionEndpoint, just use ChangeSessionEndpoint. 13.2.7.43 InitiateChangeSessionEndpointComplete notification > If it is separated in 2 Steps, sending InitiateChangeSessionEndpointComplete again after sending the result with SessionEndPointChanged Notification makes only complicate communication, so I think it's right to get rid of it. and, SessionEndPointChanged Notification - I want the document to include information that it should be sent to a new session in case of						
TF i	nput <mark>(optional)</mark>		ssion in case of fail.					
	Withdrawal	No Negative wit	hdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection				
	(check one)	Withdrawal docu MM/DD/YYYY.	ument received by Standards s	taff on GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (A)				
	Motion and	x 'Related' is mut	ually agreed upon. <mark>(Needs no</mark> r	notion.) GO TO "Persuasive" subsection				
	Reason	Negative is not	related. <mark>(Needs ≥2/3 votes to</mark> p	bass.)				
	(check one)	Reason	xxxx					
Re	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Name (Company)/Na	ame (Company)					
Related	Discussion							
		XX Y-XX N; Motion	passed/failed.					
	Result of Vote	[Negative is not	related.] < 2/3	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection				
	(check one)	2/3 ≤ [Negative	is not related.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)				
Persuas ve	Motion and	Negative is relat	ted and persuasive. <mark>(Needs</mark> >1/	/3 votes to pass.)				
·suasi ve	Reason (check one)	x Negative is relat	ted and not persuasive. (Needs	s ≥2/3 votes to pass.)				

			Reason	The InitiateChangeSessionEndpoint() operation was modelled on the Remote Command functionality in SECS-II, where the S2F41 command comes back with HCACK code 4 – Will complete and signal with an event later. The operation name includes the 'Initiate' part to make it clear the process will not be done when the Equipment Server returns from the operation call. (It is a two-step process) The InitiateChangeSessionEndpointComplete and							
				and ca Once messa	annot be combined the session endpo	d. bint ha io nee	is chang d for a s	serve different purposes ged, the new endpoint gets specific message to say s.			
	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by		By: Albert Fuchigami / PEER Group Inc.								
	Discussion	Non	econd: Brian Rubow / Cimetrix Incorporated								
		12 Y-0 N; Motion passed.									
	Result of Vote		[Negative is related persuasive.] > 1/3		Is a technical change recommended?		Тес	TO "Address by chnical Change Option" psection			
	(check one)		[Negative is related persuasive.] < 2/3	and not	(check one)		N GO → (	TO "Final" subsection			
			2/3 ≤ [Negative is re and not persuasive	.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" s	ubsec					
		x	90% ≤ [Negative is and not persuasive		GO TO "Not Sigi	nifica	nt Findi	ng Option" subsection			
Not			sed only "if the TC he persons voting					ve by a vote equal to or 5.2)			
Sign	Use of "Not	x	It is mutually agreed significant".	d upon to t	→ (						
nificant Finding Option	significant finding option" (check one)		It is mutually agreed "significant".	d upon to t	GO → (	TO "Final" subsection C)					
Fin	,		Whether or not the	Negative i	s "not significant"	is dec	ided by	a vote.			
dinç	Motion	The	Negative is "not sig	nificant".							
g	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Nam	ne (Company)/Name	e (Compan	y)						
	Vote		XX Y-XX N; Motion	passed w	ith simple majority	/	→ (				
			XX Y-XX N; Motion	failed with	n simple majority		GO → (	TO "Final" subsection C)			
			<b>(A)</b>	Withdrawn	(counted under I	h in d	ispositi	on)			
			(B)	Not related	(counted under	i in di	spositi	on)			
Final	(check if		(C) Related and not persuasive (signif								
าล	applicable)	x			ant <mark>(counted und</mark>		dispo	sition)			
			(=)	addressed	d persuasive and by technical chan		OCUMENT FAILS				
			(F) A	Addressed	ige <mark>(co</mark>	ounted	under k disposition)				

### **Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 1**

### Check only when the Document has not been failed.

5	Original	num	ber (#) of Negatives	(g)					
1	Number	of N	egatives withdrawn		(h)				
0	Number	Number of Negatives found not related (i)							
4	Number of Negatives found not significant (j)								
0			egatives addressed by technic t significant)	al change <mark>(Negative</mark>	(k)				
		x	<b>g</b> - ( <b>h</b> + <b>i</b> + <b>j</b> + <b>k</b> ) = 0	Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check					
	Final		<b>g</b> - ( <b>h</b> + <b>i</b> + <b>j</b> + <b>k</b> ) >0	Reject is included in th Approval Conditions C					
			Reject without a Negative	Not Valid					

This table is needed for each Voting Interest Reject.

Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.4.3.3) Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.6.1.4.5.2)

## **IV. Other Technical Issues**

Note: TC Chapter may choose to address a technical issue that is not part of a Negative received on a Letter Ballot (i.e., a Comment or a reason not addressed by a Vote response) by handling it as a Negative and finding it related and technically persuasive. The TC Chapter may then fail the Document or address such technical issue by using the procedure defined in *Regulations* § 9.6.1.4.3 to make a technical change to the Document. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.6.1.4.2.5)

## **Technical Change #1 (1a-1d)**

Technical	Origin	*TF/TC Chapter to choose Comment #2-2 (Voter: Mochizuki, Tadashi (TEL)) / Comment to be addressed with Technical Changes
nica	Referenced	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in including text in the ballot as appropriate.
	Section/ Paragraph	12.3.2.3.4
lssue	Reason	*Original Comment text, if applicable, and problem statement, including justification and suggestion, should be copied.

Hand	Comment Text:         In background Statement, Revision Summary, the following sentence is written.         • Rework ACL passwords and security scenarios.         Allow more than one principal to have the Security Admin privilege assigned (while still restricting to only one active session with access to the SecurityAdmin functionality). The securityAdminPrivileges privilege still cannot be assigned to the reserved 'anyPrincipal'. (reflecting the direction from the Computing Device Security (CDS) Task Force to remove generic accounts.)         It recognizes that multiple Principals can be granted SecurityAdmin privileges.         However, 12.3.2.3.4 is the following sentence.         If the ACLEntry is a RoleAssignment or PrivilegeAssignment that would result in more than one Principal having the SecurityAdmin privilege (refer to ¶ 10.2.10.3), the Equipment Server shall return an error.         I think that it is conflicting because 12.3.2.3.4 says "cannot grant SecurityAdmin privileges to more than one Principal".         Discussion:         The intention is that there can be more than one Principal with the SecurityAdmin privilege, and there can only be one session active at a time with the SecurityAdmin Privilege, and there can only be one session active at a time with the SecurityAdmin Principal. (attempts to call EstablishSession that would result in a second session with SecurityAdmin privileges returns an error.)         This is a technical issue that needs to be addressed through a Ratification Ballot								
		x	'Related' is mutually ag	reed upon. (Needs no motion.)	GO TO "Persuasive"				
	<b>.</b>	~		and assigned to TF. (Needs ≥2/3 vo	subsection tes to pass )				
	Motion and Reason (check one)			and placed on agenda of current TC					
	, , ,		Reason	xxxx					
Related	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)							
ed	Discussion								
		XX	Y-XX N; Motion passed/	failed.					
	Result of Vote		[Negative is not related	.] <2/3	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection				
	(check one)			elated] and assigned to TF.	GO TO "Final"				
			2/3 ≤ [Negative is not current TC Chapter me	subsection → (B)					
	Motion and	x	Negative is related and	persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to p	ass.)				
Pe	Reason (check one)		Negative is related and	not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes	to pass.)				
Persuasive			Reason	Entry returns an error if more urityAdmin privilege.					
/e	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by		Albert Fuchigami / PEEF cond: Brian Rubow / Cime						
	Discussion	Nor	10						
		13	Y-0 N; Motion passed.						

								_						
				x	[Negative is related an persuasive.] > 1/3	nd	Is a technical change	x	Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection				
			of Vote		[Negative is related an	nd not	recommended? (check one)		Ν	GO TO "Final"				
	(011		,		persuasive.] < 2/3 2/3 ≤ [Negative is relat	tod				subsection $\rightarrow$ (E)				
					and not persuasive.] <		GO TO "Final" su	ibsed	ction	→ (C)				
	Technical Change Recommendations Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and fields.													
			FROM:	Sec	tion/Paragraph <mark>SEMI</mark> E	132, Se	ction 12.3.2.3.4							
					he ACLEntry is a RoleAs fined, the Equipment Serv			that d	oes n	ot have a PrivilegeAssignment				
			12.3.2.3.4 If the ACLEntry is a RoleAssignment or PrivilegeAssignment that would result in more than one Principal having the SecurityAdmin privilege (refer to $\P$ 10.2.10.3), the Equipment Server shall return an error.											
			TO: Se	ctio	n/Paragraph SEMI E13	2, 12.3.:	2.3.4							
Addre	T	1			he ACLEntry is a RoleAs fined, the Equipment Serv			that d	oes n	ot have a PrivilegeAssignment				
Address by Technical Change Option										would result in more than one nt Server shall return an error.				
chn	echi		Justifie	atio	n (If necessary)									
ical C	nical (		More th	an c	one Principal can have	the Se	curityAdmin Privile	ege.						
hange	Technical Changes				LEntry operation shou incipal having the Sec			he n	ew A	ACL Entry results in more				
Opti	S		FROM:	Sec	tion/Paragraph SEMI E	132, 13	.2.6.5							
on			ACLEnt using the	ry ar e esta	e read at the time the sess blished session will use the	sion is es he sessio	tablished and are assi n's Privileges for acce	gned ess ve	to the rifica	's assigned Privileges from its e session. Subsequent requests tion even if the corresponding ent as described in $\P$ 13.4.				
		2								session. (operationalRecipient SessionPing messages for the				
				essio						ational messages are to be sent an outgoing connection to the				

#### TO: Section/Paragraph SEMI E132, 13.2.6.5

13.2.6.4 A Client-shall have only one active session per ACLEntry. The Client's assigned Privileges from its ACLEntry are read at the time the session is established and are assigned to the session. Subsequent requests using the established session will use the session's Privileges for access verification even if the corresponding clientId's Privileges have changed since then. All sessions established are persistent as described in ¶ 13.4.

13.2.6.5 The Equipment Server shall have at most one session with SecurityAdmin privileges active at a time. If the Equipment Server already has an active session with SecurityAdmin privileges, the Equipment Server shall reject the EstablishSession() request with error 'There is already an established session with SecurityAdmin privilege'.

13.2.6.6 The Equipment Server may not send operational messages for this session. (operationalRecipient parameter is None.) In this scenario, the Equipment Server does not send any SessionPing messages for the session.

13.2.6.7 The operationalRecipient and endpoint parameters determine where operational messages are to be sent for the session being established, and if the Equipment Server needs to establish an outgoing connection to the Consumer:

Justification (If necessary)

Describe the requirement that the Equipment Server rejects the EstablishSession() operation if it will result in more than one active session with the SecurityAdmin privilege.

	Parameter	Description	Kind	Form						
	error	Specified ACL entry	error	Text, shall include						
		already has an active		the text 'Specified						
		session		ACL entry alread						
				has an active						
				session'.						
	TO: Section/Paragraph SEMI E132, Table 43 Add new row to define the new EstablishSession() error to Table 43 - EstablishSession Parameter Definitions									
	Parameter	Description	Kind	Form						
	error	Specified ACL entry	error	Text, shall includ						
		already has an active		the text 'Specifie						
		session		ACL entry alread						
				has an active						
;				session'.						
,	error	Already a session	error	Text, shall be the						
I		with SecurityAdmin		text 'There is						
		privilege		already an						
				established session						
				with SecurityAdr						
				privilege'						
				For security reas						
				no additional						
				information						
				describing the						
				session with						
				SecurityAdmin						
				privilege is requir						

			FROM	: Sec	tion	/Pa	ragraph S	SEMI E132.2, Table	4				
			SEMI	E12	2 Er				Common Error C	ada			
							expired		6023	ode			
			Chan	lenge	-101		expired		0023				
				E132	.2 - /	-	-	I E132.2, Table 4	EstablishSession()	) error to Table 4 SEMI E132			
		4	SEMI	E13	2 Er	or			Common Error C	ode			
			-				expired		6023				
			Alrea	idy a	n es	tab		ssion with	<u>6024</u>				
				be th he E	at ei stab	lish	Session(			nen the Equipment Server established session with the			
	Moti	on				Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).							
	Moti	Motion by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by					By: Albert Fuchigami / PEER Group Inc. Second: Brian Rubow / Cimetrix Incorporated						
	Disc	uss	ion			None							
						15 Y-0 N; Motion passed.							
			ult of Ve			x	2/3 ≤ [Ne change(s	egative is addressed s).]	GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection				
							[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3			GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)			
		Мо	otion			To incorporate the technical change(s).							
	Incorp Techr	Mo	otion by	/2 <sup>nd</sup>	by	By: Albert Fuchigami / PEER Group Inc. Second: Brian Rubow / Cimetrix Incorporated							
	orpora chnica	Di	scussio	n		None							
	tion I Cr					11	<b>Y-0 N</b> ; M	otion passed.					
	ooration of the nical Change	F	Result o			x	90% ≤ [A	Agree to incorporate.	]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (F)			
			(check	onej			[Disagre	e to incorporate.] >10	0%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)			
							(B)	Not related					
						(C)		Related and not p					
Final	(ch	eck	k one)			(E)		Related and persu addressed by tech	nnical change	DOCUMENT FAILS			
-			x				(F) Addressed by technical change						
			:k if able)		Co	mm	ent genera	ated. See Section V-	(ii) Comment # X.				

## **Technical Change #2**

Te	Origin	Cor Tec	<b>/TC Chapter to choose</b> mment #2-4 (Voter: Moc chnical Changes	hizuki, ⁻									
€ Ch	Referenced	*TF	/TC Chapter to fill in in	ncludin	g text in the ballot a	as ap	pro	oriate.					
nical	Section/ Paragraph		erenced Section/Parag										
Technical Issue	Reason	and	*Original Comment text, if applicable, and problem statement, including justification and suggestion, should be copied.										
	Reason	In p	mment Text: parameter =error, Desc ed to change from "cha					rdHash"					
Han	dle technical issu	le ide	entified above as a Neg	gative.									
		x	'Related' is mutually ag	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection									
	Motion and		Negative is not related	and as	signed to TF. (Need	ls ≥2/	3 vo						
	Reason (check one)		Negative is not related business. (Needs ≥2/3			urren	t TC	Chapter meeting as new					
			Reason										
Related	Motion by/ 2nd by	Nar	Name (Company)/Name (Company)										
ted	Discussion												
		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.											
	Result of Vote		[Negative is not related.] <2/3					GO TO "Persuasive" subsection					
	(check one)		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not r		GO TO "Final"								
			2/3 ≤ [Negative is not current TC Chapter me			genda	a of	subsection $\rightarrow$ (B)					
		x	Negative is related and	d persua	asive. <mark>(Needs &gt;1/3 v</mark>	votes	to p	bass.)					
	Motion and Reason						otes	to pass.)					
Pers	(check one)		Reason		ntication failure needs to be sh" to								
Persuasive	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by		Albert Fuchigami / PEE cond: Brian Rubow / Cim	R Grou									
e	Discussion	Nor											
		-	Y-0 N; Motion passed.										
	Result of Vote (check one)	x	[Negative is related an persuasive.] > 1/3	egative is related and			Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection					
			[Negative is related an persuasive.] < 2/3	d not	recommended? (check one)		Ν	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)					

					Negative is related	GO TO "Final" subsect	ion $\rightarrow$ (C)						
	<b>T</b> '				t persuasive.] < 90%								
		inal	al Change Reconsection/paragra			e full sentence are requ	ired in "FROM" and "TO"						
			FROM: Section/Paragraph SEMI E132 – Table 43 - EstablishSession Parameter Definitions										
			Table 43 EstablishSession Parameter Definitions										
			Paramete	er	Description	Kind	Form						
			error		Authentication failure This includes when	error	Text, shall be the text "ClientId failed authentication".						
					the clientId does r match an ACLEnt and guest session	try	For security reasons, no additional information						
					<ul><li>not supported</li><li>challengeHash val</li></ul>		describing why authentication failed is						
					does not match the expected value		required.						
					challenge token w     not requested	/as							
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Changes		TO: Section/Paragraph SEMI E132 – Table 43 - EstablishSession Parameter Definitions										
ess	al C	1	Table 43 Establ	lish	Session Parameter Defin								
9	ha		Paramete	er	Description	Kind	Form						
< T	nge		error		Authentication failure	error	Text, shall be the text "ClientId failed						
ech	S,				This includes when		authentication".						
nni					the clientId does r match an ACLEnt								
cal					and guest session		For security reasons, no additional information						
<u>Ω</u>					not supported		describing why						
าar					• challengeHash_	177	authentication failed is						
Dige					challengePasswor sh value does not		required.						
Ö					match the expecte								
pti					value								
on					challenge token w	/as							
					not requested								
			Justification (If necessary)										
			This change updates the authentication error description with the correct EstablishSession parameter when describing when an authentication failure could occur.										
	Moti	on			egative is addressed by th								
	Moti	on l	by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by	By: Albert Fuchigami / PEER Group Inc. Second: Brian Rubow / Cimetrix Incorporated									
	Disc	uss	ion	No	one								
				12	Y-0 N; Motion passed.								
			sult of Vote heck one)	x	2/3 ≤ [Negative is addre change(s).]	essed by the technical	GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection						
	(,				[Negative is not address	GO TO "Final"							
					change(s).] < 2/3		subsection $\rightarrow$ (E)						

		Motion by	/2 <sup>nd</sup> I	by			uchigami / PEER Group Inc. In Rubow / Cimetrix Incorporated				
		Discussion			None						
		Result of Vote			14	14 Y-0 N; Motion passed.					
				-	x 90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.]		gree to incorporate.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (F)			
		(check	one)		[Disagree to incorporate.] >10%			GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)			
					(B)		Not related				
					(C)		Related and not persuasive				
Final	(ch	(check one)			(E)		Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS			
=	X			(F)		(F)	Addressed by technical change				
	•	check if plicable)		Со	mment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.						

## Technical Change #3 (3a-3d)

-								
	Origin	* <b>TF/TC Chapter to choose</b> Comment #2-7, #2-8 (Voter: Mochizuki, Tadashi (TEL)) / Comme Technical Changes						
		*TF/TC Chapter to fill in including text in the ballot as approp	oriate.					
		Comment #2-7						
Technical Issue	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	Referenced Section/Paragraph: .proto files - message SessionUsageStreamRequest Comment Text: By deleting SessionPingQueryType SessionPingQueryToServer in Request, it is necessary to decrement the subsequent field number by 1. i.e., SessionPingAnswerFromReceiver = 1; Comment #2-8 Referenced Section/Paragraph: .proto files - message SessionUsageStreamResponse Comment Text: By deleting SessionPingAnswerType in Result, it is necessary to decrement the subsequent field number by 1. i.e., SessionEstablishedNotification = 1; SessionFrozenNotification = 2;						
		*Original Comment text, if applicable, and problem statement, including justification and suggestion, should be copied.						
	Reason	Discussion From a Protocol Buffers point of view, it is not required that field numbers are in sequential order without gaps. For example, if a field is depreciated and removed, you wouldn't change the field numbers as it would break backwards compatibility if someone was using an older .proto file. Since these .proto files have not been rolled out in production yet, and we already have a ratification ballot to address other technical changes, we can correct this issue now. (both the Complementary File and Supplemental File)						
Hane	dle technical issu	e identified above as a Negative.						
외	Motion and Reason	x 'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection					

	(ch	eck	one)		Negative is not related	and as	signed to TF (Need	s >2	/3 v	otes to pass )	
	(0		,			and pla	aced on agenda of c			C Chapter meeting as new	
					Reason	xxxx	XXXX				
		otior 2nd	ו by/ by	Nar	me (Company)/Name (C	ompany	/)				
	Dis	scus	sion								
				XX	Y-XX N; Motion passed	/failed.					
			of Vote		[Negative is not related	d.] <2/3				GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
	(ch	eck	one)		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not r					GO TO "Final"	
					2/3 ≤ [Negative is not current TC Chapter me			gend	a of	subsection → (B)	
				x	Negative is related and	l persua	asive. <mark>(Needs &gt;1/3 v</mark>	otes	s to	pass.)	
	F	Reas			Negative is related and	d not pe	rsuasive. <mark>(Needs</mark> ≥2	2/3 v	otes	to pass.)	
P	(check one)				Reason	yet, ar techni	Since these .proto files have not been rolled out in production yet, and we already have a ratification ballot to address other technical changes, we can correct this issue now. (both the Complementary File and Supplemental File)				
Persuasive		otior 2 <sup>nd</sup>	ו by/ by	By: Albert Fuchigami / PEER Group Inc. Second: Brian Rubow / Cimetrix Incorporated							
sive	Dis	scus	sion	None							
				10 Y-0 N; Motion passed.							
	Res	ult o	of Vote		[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	d	Is a technical change	x	Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection	
	(check one)				[Negative is related and persuasive.] < 2/3	d not	recommended? (check one)		Ν	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
					2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90% GO TO "Final" subsection					n <b>→ (C)</b>	
Ad		inal			ecommendations agraph number and at	least or	ne full sentence are	e rec	quire	ed in "FROM" and "TO"	
Address	neiu	<u>.</u>	FROM:	Sec	tion/Paragraph Comple	ementa	ry File - SEMIE132-	02-E	Ballo	t7002.proto	
ss					Iffers Message: Sessio					· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
by Techn	Techn		Sessior	Ping	AnswerType SessionPir	ngAnsw	erFromReceiver = 2	); ;;			
:hnica	ical Cl	1			n/Paragraph Complemo uffers Message: Sessio			-Ball	lot7(	002.proto	
by Technical Change	Technical Changes		Sessio	nPin	gAnswerType SessionPi	ingAnsw	verFromReceiver =	<mark>2<u>1;</u></mark>			
nge	S		Justifi	catio	on (If necessary)						

1		FROM: Section/Paragraph Supplemental File - SEMIE132-02-Ballot7002-helper.proto
		Protocol Buffers Message: SessionUsageStreamRequest
		Protocol Dullers Message. Sessionosagestreamicequest
		SessionPingAnswerType SessionPingAnswerFromReceiver = 2;
		TO: Section/Paragraph Supplemental File - SEMIE132-02-Ballot7002-helper.proto
	2	Protocol Buffers Message: SessionUsageStreamRequest
		SessionPingAnswerType SessionPingAnswerFromReceiver = <u>21;</u>
		Justification (If necessary)
		FROM: Complementary File - SEMIE132-02-Ballot7002.proto
		Protocol Buffers Message: SessionUsageStreamResponse
		SessionEstablishedNotificationType SessionEstablishedNotification = 2;
		SessionFrozenNotificationType SessionFrozenNotification = 3;
		SessionClosedNotificationType SessionClosedNotification = 4;
		SessionPingQueryType SessionPingQueryToReceiver = 5;
		InitiateChangeSessionEndpointCompleteNotificationType
		InitiateChangeSessionEndpointCompleteNotification = 6;
		SessionEndpointChangedNotificationType SessionEndpointChangedNotification = 7;
		AclPasswordChangedNotificationType AclPasswordChangedNotification = 8;
	3	Ton asswordentangearteineation ype from asswordentangearteineation = 0,
		TO: Complementary File - SEMIE132-02-Ballot7002.proto
		Protocol Buffers Message: SessionUsageStreamResponse
		SessionEstablishedNetificationTune SessionEstablishedNetification - 21;
		SessionEstablishedNotificationType SessionEstablishedNotification = $\frac{21}{3}$ ; SessionFrozenNotificationType SessionFrozenNotification = $\frac{32}{3}$ ;
		SessionClosedNotificationType SessionClosedNotification = 43;
		SessionPingQueryType SessionPingQueryToReceiver = <mark>54</mark> ;
		InitiateChangeSessionEndpointCompleteNotificationType InitiateChangeSessionEndpointCompleteNotification = 65;
		SessionEndpointChangedNotificationType SessionEndpointChangedNotification = <u>76</u> ; AclPasswordChangedNotificationType AclPasswordChangedNotification = <u>87</u> ;
		Act assumed that is a subscript the formula in the

	1												
								EMIE132-02-Ballot7002-helper.proto					
			FIUCUC		unef	з IVI	essaye: S	essionosayesneaninesponse					
			SessionEstablishedNotificationType SessionEstablishedNotification = 2;										
			SessionFrozenNotificationType SessionFrozenNotification = 3;										
				SessionClosedNotificationType SessionClosedNotification = 4; SessionPingQueryType SessionPingQueryToReceiver = 5;									
			Initiate	InitiateChangeSessionEndpointCompleteNotificationType									
								tCompleteNotification = 6;					
								<pre>icationType SessionEndpointChangedNo ionType AclPasswordChangedNotification</pre>					
		4	TO. C.			401							
								IE132-02-Ballot7002-helper.proto essionUsageStreamResponse					
			Sessio	nEsta	ablisł	nedl	Notification	Type SessionEstablishedNotification = 2	<u>1;</u>				
								e SessionFrozenNotification = $32$ ;					
								e SessionClosedNotification = 4 <u>3;</u> onPingQueryToReceiver = <u>54;</u>					
								htCompleteNotificationType					
			Initiate	Char	igeSe	essi	onEndpoin	tCompleteNotification = $\frac{65}{5}$ ;					
								ficationType SessionEndpointChangedNo					
			ACIFAS	5001	ucna	ange	eunolincal	ionType AclPasswordChangedNotification	$1 = \Theta_{\underline{I}},$				
	Moti	on				Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).							
	Moti	Motion by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by					By: Albert Fuchigami / PEER Group Inc. Second: Brian Rubow / Cimetrix Incorporated						
							None						
	Disc	uss	ion										
						10	Y-0 N; Mc	otion passed.					
		Dee		-1-			2/3 ≤ [Ne	gative is addressed by the technical	GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change"				
			sult of Vo heck on			X	change(s)	· ·	the Technical Change" subsection				
	(check one)						[Negative	is not addressed by the technical	GO TO "Final"				
							change(s)		subsection → (E)				
		Mo	otion					te the technical change(s).					
	Inco Tec	Мс	lotion by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by				By: Albert Fuchigami / PEER Group Inc. Second: Brian Rubow / Cimetrix Incorporated						
	rpoi	Di	iscussion			None							
	atio					12	Y-0 N; Mo	tion passed.					
	Incorporation of the Technical Change	F	Result o	f Vot	e	x	90% ≤ [Ag	gree to incorporate.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (F)				
	the ge		(check o						GO TO "Final"				
							lDisagree	to incorporate.] >10%	subsection → (E)				
							(B)	Not related					
							(C)	Related and not persuasive					
Final	(cr	IECK	one)			(	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS				
a				х			(F)	Addressed by technical change					
	((	chec	:k if	~	Car								
	ap	plic	able)			111116	ent genera	ted. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.					

## **V. Comments**

V- (i) Voters' Comments Commenter 1 (Hyungsu Kim / Doople) - Comment 1

Comment	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph #, if necessary.									
ment	How to change a password through SecurityAdmin? Is there no need for a password when deleting ACL?									
	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.									
	*No	*No motion is required in this step.								
A		Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #								
Action	х	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.								
٢		Refer to the TF for more consideration.								
		New Business								
		Editorial Change								

### Commenter 1 (Hyungsu Kim / Doople) - Comment 2

Comment	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph #, if necessary.									
nent	I recommend Terminology for Salt Value and Plaintext to be added.									
	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.									
	*No motion is required in this step.									
A		Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #								
Action	х	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.								
ſ		Refer to the TF for more consideration.								
		New Business								
		Editorial Change								

Cor	*TF	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in								
òmm	9.2.	9.2.3 and 9.2.4 are the same sentence								
	The	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.								
Þ	*Nc	*No motion is required in this step.								
Action	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #									
2		No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.								
		Refer to the TF for more consideration.								

		New busin	ess					
	х	Editorial ch	nang	e				
		Options for editorial		Case 1: No vote in this section: To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V.				
		change		Case 2: Voted in this section:				
		(check one)	х	Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.				
		FROM: Se	ectio	on/Paragraph 9.2.4				
				ordinate Standards capture when and how the SessionID should be hashed it when it is transmitted.				
Edito				ordinate Standards capture when and how the SessionID should be hashed it when it is transmitted.				
rial	1	TO: Section/Paragraph 9.2.4						
Editorial Changes	•	9.2.3 Subordinate Standards capture when and how the SessionID should be hashe to protect it when it is transmitted.						
s		9.2.4 Subordinate Standards capture when and how the SessionID should be has to protect it when it is transmitted.						
		Justificat	ion (	(If necessary)				
		Section 9.2	2.4 is	s a duplicate of Section 9.2.3				
M	otion	l	Т	To approve above editorial change(s)				
M	otion	n by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by		By: Albert Fuchigami / PEER Group Inc. Second: Brian Rubow / Cimetrix Incorporated				
Di	iscus	sion	N	lone				
Vo	ote		1	2 Y-0 N; Motion passed.				

	*TF	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in									
Con	Comment 2-3 Mochizuki, Tadashi (TEL)										
Comment	the	Referenced Section/Paragraph: 13.2.6.6 the end sentence of the first " • ".									
	Nee	ed to change from 'Specified endpoint is invalid' to 'The specified endpoint is invalid'									
	The	e TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.									
	*No motion is required in this step.										
Action		Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #									
ion		No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.									
		Refer to the TF for more consideration.									
		New business									

	х	Editorial cl	hang	e				
		Options		Case 1: No vote in this section:				
		for editorial		To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V.				
		change (check		Case 2: Voted in this section:				
		one)	х	Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.				
		FROM: S	ectio	on/Paragraph 13.2.6.7				
Edito		If the implementation is using a connection-oriented protocol, the connection to the endpoint shall be successful for the operation to be successful. Otherwise the requirejected with error 'Specified endpoint is invalid'						
rial		TO: Section/Paragraph 13.2.6.7						
Editorial Changes	1	If the implementation is using a connection-oriented protocol, the connection to the n endpoint shall be successful for the operation to be successful. Otherwise the request rejected with error 'The Sspecified endpoint is invalid'						
		Justification (If necessary)						
The error identifier is missing text 'The'. Spelling error.				ifier is missing text 'The'. Spelling error.				
M	otion	I	Т	o approve above editorial change(s)				
M	otion	n by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by		By: Albert Fuchigami / PEER Group Inc. Second: James Moyne / Applied Materials, Inc.				
Di	scus	sion	Ν	lone				
Vo	ote		1	2 Y-0 N; Motion passed.				

	*TF	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in								
Con	Сог	nment 2-5 Mochizuki, Tadashi (TEL)								
Comment	Sec	tion/Paragraph SEMI E132.2, Table 8								
t		Sessionidhash of MetaData.Key, etc. must all start with lowercase letters. (example, change from Sessionidhash to sessionidhash.)								
	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.									
	*Nc	*No motion is required in this step.								
A		Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #								
Action		No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.								
n		Refer to the TF for more consideration.								
		New business								
	х	Editorial change								

				Case 1: No vote in this section:								
		Options for		To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. Editorial Changes Other								
		editorial		than Those Voted on in § V.								
		change (check		Case 2: Voted in this section:								
		one)	х	Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.								
		Section/Paragraph SEMI E132.2, Table 8										
		From		То								
		Sessionic	lhas	h sessionidhash								
Ш		Clientidha	ash	clientidhash								
<b>Editorial Changes</b>		Source		source								
l Char	1	Code		code								
Iges		Descriptio		description								
		Extensior	١	extension								
		Justificat	lion	(If necessary)								
				keys need to be lower case. This is consistent how other metadata keys for mation is defined.								
M	otion		Г	o approve above editorial change(s)								
M	otion	by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by		By: Albert Fuchigami / PEER Group Inc. Second: Brian Rubow / Cimetrix Incorporated								
Di	iscus	sion	Ν	lone								
Vo	ote		1	2 Y-0 N; Motion passed.								

	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph #, if necessary.									
Com	Comment 2-6 Mochizuki, Tadashi (TEL)									
Comment	Referenced Section/Paragraph: SEMI E132.2, Related Information 3, R3-8.7									
	The first " $\cdot$ " sentence has the text "notifcationRecipient = ClientSessionOnly". Is this sentence correct?									
A	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.									
Action	*No motion is required in this step.									
n	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #									

х	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.
	Refer to the TF for more consideration.
	New Business
	Editorial Change

### Commenter 3 (Tomoko Suzuki / Daifuku) - Comment 1

Comment	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph #, if necessary.						
nent	There are some numbers for sections (or notes) not updated.						
	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.						
	*No motion is required in this step.						
A	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #						
Action	х	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.					
ſ		Refer to the TF for more consideration.					
		New Business					
		Editorial Change					

## Commenter 4 (Sehoon Kim / Wonik) - Comment 1

Com	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph #, if necessary.						
Comment	I don't think Freeze3 needs more security-related checks than Freeze2. Most Interface-A operates in the intranet						
	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.						
	*No motion is required in this step.						
A	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #						
Action	х	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.					
ſ		Refer to the TF for more consideration.					
		New Business					
		Editorial Change					

### Commenter 5 (Mitch Sakamoto / Zama Consulting) - Comment 1

\*TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph #, if necessary.

	Ref	erenced Section/Paragraph: 13.2.3.4.3						
Comment Text: Reference: 13.2.3.4.3 If the specified equipmentId and clientId do not correspond Entry and guest session is not supported, a new salt value is created for this co and returned. Subsequent calls to this operation with this equipmentId an combination shall return the same salt value (at least until the Equipment restarted) to avoid informing the caller that the equipmentId and clientId combina valid. Comment: The paragraph describes; (1) When no guest session is allowed and there is no client ID on the ACL (2) The client requested Get-Equipment-Information to get the salt value and the taken (3) The equipment generates a new salt value S1 to send to the client, while the token is not defined to be generated. (4) The client requests again (5) The equipment sends the salt value S1 The equipment does not indicate that the request is denied. So the client understand that error. Why the error has not been defined for this?								
	The	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.						
	*Nc	motion is required in this step.						
A		Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #						
Action	х	x No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.						
Γ		Refer to the TF for more consideration.						
		New Business						
		Editorial Change						

## Commenter 5 (Mitch Sakamoto / ZAMA Consulting) - Comment 2

	*TF	/TC Chapte	er to	fill in				
S	Comment 5-2 Sakamoto, Mitsune (Zama Consulting)							
Comment	Cor Ref Cor	Referenced Section/Paragraph: 13.2.3.5 Comment Text: Reference: 13.2.3.5 Change ACL Password Comment: Should be renumbered as 13.2.4 to align the paragraph level to the other operations						
	The	e TC Chapt	er ag	greed to do one of the following actions.				
	*Nc	*No motion is required in this step.						
A		Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #						
Action		No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.						
C		Refer to the TF for more consideration.						
		New business						
	х	Editorial c	hang	e				
		Ontiona		Case 1: No vote in this section:				
		Options for editorial		To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V.				
			Х	Case 2: Voted in this section:				

		change (check one)	Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.						
		Section/P	ragraph SEMI E132						
Editorial Changes	1	From: 13.2.3.5 ChangeACLPassword To: 13.2.3.5 <u>13.2.4</u> ChangeACLPassword							
har		Justification (If necessary)							
nges		ChangeACLPassword is an operation on the SessionManager interface and should be at the same section numbering level as other SessionManager interface operations.							
		The rest of the numbered items related to ChangeACLPassword will be updated accordingly.							
Μ	otion	l	To approve above editorial change(s)						
м	otion	by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by	By: Albert Fuchigami / PEER Group Inc. Second: Brian Rubow / Cimetrix Incorporated						
Di	iscus	sion	None						
Vo	ote		13 Y-0 N; Motion passed.						

# V-(ii) Comments Created by Handling Negative None

### VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V None

## **VII. Approval Conditions Check**

### VII. - (i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.6.2.1.2)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.6.2.1.3)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)			
Approval Rate	=	57	/	57	=	100.0%	≥90%

## VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

Note: See Regulations § 9.6.2 for further information.

x

### Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):

The Letter Ballot meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.

### **Need a Ratification Ballot:**

The Letter Ballot meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

## **VIII. Safety Check**

### Note: See Regulations § 15 for further information.

	x	Th is s	This is not a Safety Document, when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is still technically sound and complete. ( <i>Regulations</i> $\P$ 8.7.1)							
Motion			This is a Safety Document, when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is not technically sound and complete. ( <i>Regulations</i> $\P$ 8.7.2)							
			Safety Checklist ( <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 15.3) is complete and has been included with the Document throughout the balloting process. ( <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 15.1.2)							
I	Motion by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by			By: Albert Fuchigami / PEER Group Inc. Second: Brian Rubow / Cimetrix Incorporated						
	Discussion			None						
	Vote			14 Y-0 N; Motion passed						

## IX. Intellectual Property (IP) Check

Note: This Letter Ballot may cover all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. Regardless of the coverage, this IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline\*. See *Regulations* § 16 for further information.

x	The TC Chapter meeting chair asked those participating, if they were aware of any patented technology that might be relevant (see <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 16.3.1.1) to the Standard or Safety Guideline; or, any copyrighted items or trademarks that are used/reproduced (see <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 16.4.1.2) in the Standard or Safety Guideline. (Also see, <i>Regulations</i> § 8.8)							
		The question is NOT answered in affirmative (No potentially material patented technology or use/reproduction of copyrighted items/trademarks is known.)	ntially nology or GO TO SECTION X. opyrighted					
	x	The question is answered in affirmative	Is any of the known IPs a patented technology?	x	Yes, at least one of them is a patented technology	GO TO IX (a) "Patented Technology" subsection		

					No	GO TO IX (b) "Copyright items" subsection
--	--	--	--	--	----	---

### IX(a) Patented Technologies subsection IX(a1) Total numbers of Patented Technologies to be dealt with

1	(I) Known Patented Technology that might be relevant to	Fill	technologies first became known to the TC Chapter on or after the day	Postpone assessment of such patented technologies to be performed at the next scheduled TC Chapter meeting.
umber the Standard/Safety Guideline	' Fill	(n) Number of patented technologies first became known to the TC Chapter before the day of the issuance of this Letter Ballot	GO TO IX (a2)	

### IX(a2) Assessment of disclosed patented technologies

Disclosed patented technology #1 Asyst Patent Application Mutli-protocol multi-client equipment server Automation Job Management Automated tool management in a multi-protocol environment Apparatus and method for web-based tool management NON-ASSERTION AGREEMENT (LOA) between SEMI and Asyst Technologies has been signed with for US Patents #11/340101, #11/107508, #09/899833, and 09/496009, in				Date of Assessment (If different from the date of Letter Ballot adjudication) 12/1/2007			
Is disclosed patented technology #1 found to be "might be material" to the Standard/Safety Guideline?	X	YES (It is a PMPT)	Is the us PMPT te justified?	echnically	x	YES NO	PROCEED to assess NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(a3) The Document is failed and returned to the TF
the table is presided for each a		NO			ded f	or patente	d technology #1

This table is needed for each disclosed patented technology.

### IX(a3) LOA status check of PMPT of which inclusion assessed to be justified

LOA Status of PMPT #1								
Has an LOA for this	x	YES		PROCEED to check NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(b)				
patented technology been received from		NO	M		Ask ISC for spe	ecial permission to publish.		
every owner ?			IOTIO		Quit activity.	The Document is failed and returned to the TF		

			Wait for LOA	PROCEED to check NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(b1)		
	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by			Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion Vote		ion	XXXX		
				XX Y-XX N; Motion passed (or failed)		

This table is needed for each PMPT of which inclusion assessed to be justified.

### IX(b1) Total numbers of copyrighted items to be dealt with

0 Fill	(o) Known copyrighted items that are used or reproduced to the		<b>o</b> > <b>0</b> There is at least one known copy righted items that might be relevant to the Standard/Safety Guideline	GO TO IX (b2)	
numbe	r Standard/Safety Guideline	x	<b>o = 0</b> There is no disclosed copyrighted item	GO TO IX (c)	

### IX(b2) Assessment of disclosed copyrighted items

Disclosed copyrighted item #1 (Brief description of its use in the Document):						
Is disclosed copyrighted item #1 used or reproduced in the Standard/Safety Guideline?	YES	YES	Is the use/reproduction of this copyrighted item technically justified?		YES	PROCEED to assess NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(b3)
					NO	The Document is failed and returned to the TF
		NO	No further action is nee	ded f	or copyrig	hted item #1

This table is needed for each disclosed copyrighted item.

## IX(b3) Copyright release status check of copyrighted item of which inclusion assessed to be justified

Copyright release Status of copyrighted item #1								
		YES		PROCEED to assess NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(c)				
Has the copyright release been received from its owner ?.		NO	MO		Ask ISC for special p	ermission to publish.		
			DTION	DTION	Quit activity.	The Document is failed and returned to the TF		
					Wait for copyright release letter	PROCEED to check NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(c)		
			Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by			Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
			Discussion			XXXX		
			Vote			XX Y-XX N; Motion passed (or failed)		

This table is needed for each copyrighted item of which use/reproduction assessed to be justified.

 C Assessment of disclose		dentined)	trademark			
	X		Is every instance of trademark use technically justified?	x	YES	GO TO IX(d)
Is there any trademark in the Standard/Safety Guideline?		YES				The Document is failed and returned to the TF
		NO	GO TO IX(d)			

### IX(c) Assessment of disclosed (identified) trademark

### IX(d) IP check completion condition check

The co-chair checks if any Patented Technologies first become known to the TC Chapter on or after the day of the issuance of this Letter Ballot? i.e., m>0 in IX(a1)		YES	Sections IX(a2) and IX(a3) shall be completed and recorded for such patented technologies at next scheduled meeting of the TC Chapter. Until then, the TC Chapter shall NOT go to X (making motion to pass/fail this Document) (see <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 16.4.1.2) Until then this Letter Ballot Review is on hold.
	x	NO	GO TO X

## X. Action for This Document

			ment passed TC Chapter review as balloted and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R ocedural review.							
This Document passed TC Chapter review with editorial changes and will be forwarded ISC A&R SC for procedural review.										
<ul> <li>ISC A&amp;R SC for procedural review.</li> <li>This Document passed TC Chapter review with technical changes and with or without editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&amp;R SC for procedural review. A Ratification Ballot will be issued to verify the technical changes.</li> </ul>										
		This Docu	ment failed TC Chapter review and will be returned to the TF for rework.							
		This Docu	ment failed TC Chapter review and work will be discontinued.							
Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by			By: Albert Fuchigami / PEER Group Inc. Second: Brian Rubow / Cimetrix Incorporated							
Discussion			None							
Vote			13 Y-0 N							
F	Final Action		x Motion passed							
			Motion failed							

Note: If the use of PMPT or copyrighted item is justified by the TC Chapter, LOA or release form must be received before publication can proceed.