

Record of Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: **China**
 Global Technical Committee: **HB-LED**
 TC Chapter Cochairs: **Yong Ji/GHTOT, Weizhi Cai/SANAN**
 Standards Staff: **Sophia Huang/ SEMI China**

	Scheduled in Background Statement	Actual
Date	10/14/2016	10/14/2016
Location	Dandong, Liaoning, China Friend Plaza Hotel Dandong	Dandong, Liaoning, China Friend Plaza Hotel Dandong
Reason for Change of Date and/or Location (if changed)		

Note: See Regulations ¶ 9.5 Exception for allowable reason to change.

I. Document Number and Title

Document Number	Document Title
Doc 5723A	New Standard: Specification for Single Crystal Sapphire Intended for Use for Manufacturing HB- LED Wafers

II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.1)

Voting Tally (with example values):

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes	Distribution	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	46	÷ 73	= 63.0%	≥ 60%
Intercommittee Ballot	14			
Voting Interest Reject(s)	1	Total Voters with Rejects		1
Voting Interest Accept(s)	28			

Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

III. Rejects

Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: Peter Wagner)

Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Peter Wagner Consulting)

Negative 1

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.	
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. The document attempts to specify basic properties of sapphire, but is inconsistent. It would be much better to include these specifications in a document specifying sapphire ingots or specifying wafers. In the latter case it is recommended to revise HB-1. Therefore it is requested that HB-1 is revised and the material in doc5723A is included in HB-1 or in doc5775. Doc5723A is then superfluous.	
TF input (optional)			
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.	GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.) GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)
	Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion		
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.	
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is not related.] < 2/3	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)
	Reason	Doc5723A specify properties and material defects of sapphire suitable for HB-LED and it does not define the physical shape or geometry of the sapphire. Doc5775A specify dimension and orientation for sapphire ingot. Standard HB-1 specifies the requirements for sapphire wafer. There is no any overlap and clash with them.	
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)	
Discussion	None		
Result of Vote	38 Y-0 N; Motion passed		

	(check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)				
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection				
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommendations							
	Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.							
	Technical Changes	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX					
			TO: Section/Paragraph xxx					
			Justification (if necessary)					
	Technical Changes	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX					
			TO: Section/Paragraph xxx					
			Justification (if necessary)					
	Motion		Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).					
	Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)					
Discussion								
Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.						
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).]				GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3				GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion		To incorporate the technical change(s).					
	Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)					
	Discussion							
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.					
		<input type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.]				GO TO "Final" subsection → (F)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Disagree to incorporate.] > 10%				GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
Significant Finding	This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)							
	Use of "Not significant"	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant".					GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)

	finding option” (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “significant”.	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Whether or not the Negative is “not significant” is decided by a vote.		
	Motion	The Negative is “not significant”.			
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)	
<input type="checkbox"/>		XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)		
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.		

This table is needed for each Negative.

Negative 2

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.		
		Section 3.1		
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. § 3.1: this sentence has no value and is in contrast to section 6 where diameter (of a wafer, I guess) is requested for ordering information. This belongs in a wafer specification document. The authors should finally decide what kind of specification they want to generate, for wafers or for ingots. In addition, what is the meaning of “the sapphire”?		
TF input (optional)				
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO “Related” subsection	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.	GO TO “Final” subsection → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	‘Related’ is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.) GO TO “Persuasive” subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)	
		Reason		
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			
Result of Vote	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.			

	(check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related.] < 2/3	GO TO “Persuasive” subsection		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]	GO TO “Final” subsection → (B)		
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)			
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)			
		Reason	Doc5723 is used to specify which kind sapphire materials are suitable for HB-LED wafers. It’s just focusing on material properties and defect. The shape of sapphire material is not specified here. It can be any shape such like 2inch ingots, 4inch wafers, or bricks and rectangle wafers. We have specified the document limitation in item 3.1.			
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)				
	Discussion	None				
	Result of Vote (check one)	38 Y-0 N; Motion passed				
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Y
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N	GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)			
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO “Not Significant Finding Option” subsection			
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommendations					
	Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in “FROM” and “TO” fields.					
	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX				
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx				
		Justification (if necessary)				
	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX				
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx				
Justification (if necessary)						
Motion		Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).				
Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)				
Discussion						
Result of Vote		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.				

	(check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).]	GO TO “Incorporation of the Technical Change” subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3	GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)	
	Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion	To incorporate the technical change(s).		
		Motion by/2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
		Discussion			
Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.				
	<input type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.]	GO TO “Final” subsection → (F)		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Disagree to incorporate.] > 10%	GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)		
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can be used only “if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)				
	Use of “Not significant finding option” (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “not significant”.	GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “significant”.	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Whether or not the Negative is “not significant” is decided by a vote.		
	Motion	The Negative is “not significant”.			
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)	
<input type="checkbox"/>		XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)		
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.		

Negative 3

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.
		Section 4
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.

		All test methods mentioned in section 4 are either general test methods or test methods for different materials and not test methods for sapphire wafers or ingots. Specifics for applying these test methods to sapphire are missing in the document. E.g. SEMI M36 requires etching of a test specimen for delineating the etch pits. I assume that etchant solution, temperature and etching time for sapphire are different as compared to GaAs.			
	TF input (optional)				
	Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.		GO TO "Related" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.		GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		Reason	XXXX		
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Discussion				
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.			
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is not related.] < 2/3		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]		GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)		
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		Reason	All test methods listed in section 4 are used to as a reference for sapphire testing. We have modified the testing condition for §7.2.2 EPD and §7.1.3FWHM.		
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)			
	Discussion	None			
	Result of Vote (check one)	38 Y-0 N; Motion passed			
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Y GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection			
Technical Change	Technical Change Recommendations Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.				

Technical Changes	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX		
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx		
		Justification (if necessary)		
	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX		
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx		
		Justification (if necessary)		
Motion		Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).		
Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
Discussion				
Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).] GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3 GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion		To incorporate the technical change(s).	
	Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.	
<input type="checkbox"/>			90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.] GO TO "Final" subsection → (F)	
<input type="checkbox"/>			[Disagree to incorporate.] > 10% GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)			
	Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant". GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "significant". GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote.	
	Motion		The Negative is "not significant".	
	Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Vote		<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)	
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A) Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B) Not related (counted under i in disposition)	

	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)
(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.	

Negative 4

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. Section 5.2.1	
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. The definition contains explanation or discussion, which are not allowed in definitions and have to be removed	
TF input (optional)			
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.	GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.) GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)
	Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion		
Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related.] < 2/3	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)
	Reason	Doc5723A uses bubble type, shape, usually detecting tooling in §5.2.1 to define the bubble defects. It's complete and suitable.	
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)	
	Discussion	None	
Result of Vote	38 Y-0N; Motion passed		

(check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Y	GO TO “Address by Technical Change Option” subsection	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N	GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)				
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO “Not Significant Finding Option” subsection				
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommendations						
	Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in “FROM” and “TO” fields.						
	Technical Changes	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX				
			TO: Section/Paragraph xxx				
			Justification (if necessary)				
	Technical Changes	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX				
			TO: Section/Paragraph xxx				
			Justification (if necessary)				
	Motion		Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).				
	Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)				
Discussion							
Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.					
<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).]	GO TO “Incorporation of the Technical Change” subsection					
<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3	GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)					
Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion		To incorporate the technical change(s).				
	Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)				
	Discussion						
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.				
<input type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.]	GO TO “Final” subsection → (F)					
<input type="checkbox"/>	[Disagree to incorporate.] > 10%	GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)					
Significant Finding	This option can be used only “if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)						
	Use of “Not significant”	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “not significant”.			GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)	

	finding option” (check one)	X	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “significant”.	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)
			Whether or not the Negative is “not significant” is decided by a vote.	
	Motion	The Negative is “not significant”.		
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Vote		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)
		XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)	
Final	(check if applicable)		(A) Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
			(B) Not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		X	(C) Related and not persuasive (significant)	
			(D) Not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
			(E) Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS
			(F) Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
	(check if applicable)		Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.	

Negative 5

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. Section 5.2.2			
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.			
		The definition contains explanation or discussion, which are not allowed in definitions and have to be removed.			
TF input (optional)					
Withdrawal (check one)	X	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.		GO TO “Related” subsection	
		Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.		GO TO “Final” subsection → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	X	‘Related’ is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)		GO TO “Persuasive” subsection
			Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
			Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Discussion				
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.		
		[Negative is not related.] < 2/3		GO TO “Persuasive” subsection	
		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]		GO TO “Final” subsection → (B)	

Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)			
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)			
		Reason	Doc 5723A defines inclusion defects through inclusion shape, generated cause and usually detecting tooling in §5.2.2. It's complete and suitable and needn't be revised.			
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)				
	Discussion	None				
	Result of Vote (check one)	38 Y-0N; Motion passed				
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)			
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection			

Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommendations					
	Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.					
	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX				
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx				
		Justification (if necessary)				
	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX				
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx				
		Justification (if necessary)				
	Motion		Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).			
	Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
Discussion						
Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.					
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).]				GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection
<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3				GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
☐ -	Motion	To incorporate the technical change(s).				

	Motion by/2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Discussion				
	Result of Vote (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.]		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Disagree to incorporate.] > 10%		
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)				
	Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant".		
		X	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "significant".		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote.		
	Motion	The Negative is "not significant".			
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)		
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		X	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.		

Negative 6

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.	
		Section 5.2.3	
Negative	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.	
		The definition contains explanation or discussion, which are not allowed in definitions and have to be removed.	
TF input (optional)			
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)

		Reason	XXXX			
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)				
	Discussion					
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.				
		[Negative is not related.] < 2/3	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection			
		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)			
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)		Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)			
		X	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)			
		Reason	Doc5723A defines grain boundary of sapphire through generated cause and appearance in §5.2.3. It's complete and suitable and needn't be revised.			
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)				
	Discussion	None				
	Result of Vote (check one)	38 Y-0N; Motion passed				
		[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)		Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection
[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3				N	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%		GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)				
X 90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]		GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection				
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommendations					
	Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.					
	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX				
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx				
		Justification (if necessary)				
	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX				
TO: Section/Paragraph xxx						
Justification (if necessary)						

	Motion	Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion		
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).] GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3 GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)
Technical Change	Motion	To incorporate the technical change(s).	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion		
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.	
<input type="checkbox"/>		90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.] GO TO "Final" subsection → (F)	
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Disagree to incorporate.] > 10% GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)		
	Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant". GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "significant". GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote.
	Motion	The Negative is "not significant".	
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)
<input type="checkbox"/>		XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)	
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A) Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B) Not related (counted under i in disposition)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C) Related and not persuasive (significant)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D) Not significant (counted under j in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(E) Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change DOCUMENT FAILS
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(F) Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)
	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.

Negative 7

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.
		Section 6

	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.			
		Again it is not clear, if the ordering information is for wafers or for ingots or for something else. All of the items in section 6 would belong in a sapphire wafer specification. In addition, hardness and light transmission, which are required properties, apparently are not required to be reported. That's strange.			
	TF input (optional)				
	Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.		GO TO "Related" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.		GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		Reason			
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Discussion				
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.			
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is not related.] < 2/3		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]		GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)		
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		Reason	Doc5723A just specifies properties and material defects of sapphire suitable for HB-LED. And it does not define the physical shape or geometry. Also we have declared in §6.2 that "ordering information shall include other specific requirements for specific goods".		
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)			
	Discussion	None			
	Result of Vote (check one)	38 Y-0N; Motion passed			
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Y GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)		
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection		

		Technical Change Recommendations		
		Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in “FROM” and “TO” fields.		
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Changes	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX	
			TO: Section/Paragraph xxx	
			Justification (if necessary)	
		2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX	
			TO: Section/Paragraph xxx	
			Justification (if necessary)	
Motion		Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).		
Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
Discussion				
Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).] GO TO “Incorporation of the Technical Change” subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3 GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)	
Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion		To incorporate the technical change(s).	
	Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.	
			<input type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.] GO TO “Final” subsection → (F)
<input type="checkbox"/>			[Disagree to incorporate.] > 10% GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)	
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can be used only “if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)			
	Use of “Not significant finding option” (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “not significant”. GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “significant”. GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Whether or not the Negative is “not significant” is decided by a vote.	
	Motion		The Negative is “not significant”.	
	Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Vote		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)	

			XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)
Final	(check if applicable)		(A) Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
			(B) Not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		X	(C) Related and not persuasive (significant)	
			(D) Not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
			(E) Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS
			(F) Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
	(check if applicable)		Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.	

Negative 8

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. 7.1.1 and 7.1.2		
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. 7.1.1 and 7.1.2: the words "should be" have to be replaced by "shall" in agreement with SEMI Standards' Procedural Manual and Style Manual.		
TF input (optional)				
Withdrawal (check one)	X	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection	
		Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.	GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	X	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
			Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)	
			Reason	XXXX
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.	
		[Negative is not related.] < 2/3	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)		Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)	
		X	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)	
		Reason	Refer to Style Manual Table 4 for correct usage of 'should' and 'shall'. We have revise 7.1.1 and 7.1.2 the words 'should' to 'shall'.	
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)		
Discussion	None			

		38 Y-0 N; Motion passed					
Result of Vote (check one)		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/> N	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)			
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection			
Technical Change Recommendations							
Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.							
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Changes	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX				
			TO: Section/Paragraph xxx				
			Justification (if necessary)				
	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX					
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx					
		Justification (if necessary)					
	Motion		Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).				
	Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)				
	Discussion						
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.				
<input type="checkbox"/>			2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).]	GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)			
Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion		To incorporate the technical change(s).				
	Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)				
	Discussion						
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.				
			<input type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (F)		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Disagree to incorporate.] > 10%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)				
nt Find	This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)						

	Use of “Not significant finding option” (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “not significant”.	GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “significant”.	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Whether or not the Negative is “not significant” is decided by a vote.		
	Motion	The Negative is “not significant”.			
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)	
<input type="checkbox"/>		XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)		
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)		
(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.			

Negative 9

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. Section 7.1.2, last sentence: The light transmission of single crystal sapphire should be similar to Figure 1.			
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. What is the meaning of “should be similar to figure 1”, which degree of deviation from figure 1 is allowed? This has to be defined more specifically.			
TF input (optional)					
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.		GO TO “Related” subsection	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.		GO TO “Final” subsection → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	‘Related’ is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)		GO TO “Persuasive” subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		Reason	XXXX		
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Discussion				
Result of Vote (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.			
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related.] < 2/3		GO TO “Persuasive” subsection	

			2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]			GO TO “Final” subsection → (B)	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)		Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)				
		X	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)				
		Reason	§7.1.2 has specified the light transmission requirement very clear. Figure1 is just a sampling curve. For improve accuracy of document, we have commened “A transmission map as a sample is show on Figure 1” in this section.				
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)					
	Discussion	None					
	Result of Vote (check one)	38 Y-0N; Motion passed					
			[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)		Y	GO TO “Address by Technical Change Option” subsection
		[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3			N	GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)	
		2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)				
X		90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO “Not Significant Finding Option” subsection				
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommendations						
	Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in “FROM” and “TO” fields.						
	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX					
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx					
		Justification (if necessary)					
	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX					
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx					
		Justification (if necessary)					
	Motion	Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).					
	Motion by/2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)					
Discussion							
Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.						
		2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).]	GO TO “Incorporation of the Technical Change” subsection				

		[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3	GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)	
Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion	To incorporate the technical change(s).		
	Motion by/2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.		
			90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.]	GO TO “Final” subsection → (F)
		[Disagree to incorporate.]>10%	GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)	
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can be used only “if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)			
	Use of “Not significant finding option” (check one)		It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “not significant”. GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)	
		X	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “significant”. GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)	
			Whether or not the Negative is “not significant” is decided by a vote.	
	Motion	The Negative is “not significant”.		
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Vote		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)
		XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)	
Final	(check if applicable)		(A) Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
			(B) Not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		X	(C) Related and not persuasive (significant)	
			(D) Not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
			(E) Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS
			(F) Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
	(check if applicable)		Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.	

Negative 10

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. Section 7.1.3
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. FWHM is not a material metric by itself; it is a characteristic of any bell-shaped curve. What is probably meant here is the FWHM of an X-ray diffraction reflex. This has to be changed. Again, sapphire specific information for the test method is missing, such as which reflex is to be used.
	TF input (optional)	

Withdrawal (check one)		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.		GO TO "Related" subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.		GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)			
		Reason	XXXX			
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)				
	Discussion					
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.				
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is not related.] < 2/3			GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]			GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)			
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)			
		Reason	FWHM is a very important parameter for specifying the single crystal. We have added the testing condition in the Doc5723A.			
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)				
	Discussion	None				
	Result of Vote (check one)	38 Y-0N; Motion passed				
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)			
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection				
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommendations					
	Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.					
	Technical Changes	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX			
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx				
		Justification (If necessary)				

	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX		
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx		
		Justification (if necessary)		
Motion		Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).		
Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
Discussion				
Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).] GO TO “Incorporation of the Technical Change” subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3 GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)	
Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion		To incorporate the technical change(s).	
	Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.	
<input type="checkbox"/>			90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.] GO TO “Final” subsection → (F)	
<input type="checkbox"/>			[Disagree to incorporate.] > 10% GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)	
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can be used only “if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)			
	Use of “Not significant finding option” (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “not significant”. GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “significant”. GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Whether or not the Negative is “not significant” is decided by a vote.	
	Motion		The Negative is “not significant”.	
	Motion by/ 2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Vote		<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)
<input type="checkbox"/>			XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)	
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change DOCUMENT FAILS
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)

(check if applicable)		Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.
------------------------------	--	---

Negative 11

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.				
		Section 7.2.1				
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.				
		A purity of 99.996 % (at-% or wt-%?) is required, leaving 40 ppm (ppma or ppmw?) for impurities. However, the upper limits for various foreign elements in Table 1 sum up only to 25 ppmw. This leaves 15 ppmw unexplained.				
TF input (optional)						
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.		GO TO "Related" subsection		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.		GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)		
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	‘Related’ is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)			
		Reason	XXXX			
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)				
	Discussion					
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.				
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related.] < 2/3		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]		GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)		
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)			
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)			
		Reason	Doc 5725A has commented the unit of purity is ppm wt. in Table1, and mark Table1 is just for "specific elements" and it is not included all elements.			
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)				
	Discussion	None				
	Result of Vote (check one)	38 Y-0 N; Motion passed				
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%		GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)		

		X	90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO “Not Significant Finding Option” subsection	
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommendations				
	Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in “FROM” and “TO” fields.				
	Technical Changes	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX		
			TO: Section/Paragraph xxx		
			Justification (if necessary)		
		2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX		
			TO: Section/Paragraph xxx		
			Justification (if necessary)		
	Motion		Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).		
	Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion				
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.		
			2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).]	GO TO “Incorporation of the Technical Change” subsection	
			[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3	GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)	
Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion		To incorporate the technical change(s).		
	Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion				
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.		
		90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.]	GO TO “Final” subsection → (F)		
		[Disagree to incorporate.] > 10%	GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)		
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can be used only “if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)				
	Use of “Not significant finding option” (check one)		It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “not significant”.	GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)	
		X	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “significant”.	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)	
			Whether or not the Negative is “not significant” is decided by a vote.		
	Motion		The Negative is “not significant”.		
Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)			

	Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)	
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.		

Negative 12

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. Figure 5.1			
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. The acronym OHT used in the caption of figure 5.1 is not explained or defined.			
TF input (optional)					
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.		GO TO "Related" subsection	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.		GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		Reason	XXXX		
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Discussion				
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.			
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is not related.] < 2/3		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]		GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)		
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		

		Reason	Doc.5723 missed the abbreviations of OHT in last vision. So we have added "OHT---optical homogeneity testing" in section4.1.			
Motion by/ 2nd by	Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)					
Discussion	None					
Result of Vote (check one)	38 Y-0N; Motion passed					
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Y GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)			
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection				
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommendations					
	Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.					
	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX				
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx				
		Justification (if necessary)				
	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX				
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx				
		Justification (if necessary)				
	Motion	Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).				
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)				
Discussion						
Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.					
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).]	GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection			
<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)				
Incorporation of	Motion	To incorporate the technical change(s).				
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)				
	Discussion					

		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.	
	Result of Vote (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.] GO TO “Final” subsection → (F)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Disagree to incorporate.]>10% GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can be used only “if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)		
	Use of “Not significant finding option” (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “not significant”. GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “significant”. GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)
		<input type="checkbox"/> Whether or not the Negative is “not significant” is decided by a vote.	
	Motion	The Negative is “not significant”.	
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A) Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B) Not related (counted under i in disposition)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C) Related and not persuasive (significant)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D) Not significant (counted under j in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(E) Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change DOCUMENT FAILS
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(F) Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.	

Negative 13

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.	
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. There is some redundancy in the specifications. Hardness, light transmission and color depend on the impurity and defect species and concentrations. The document has to show that these specifications are not in conflict with each other.	
TF input (optional)			
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO “Related” subsection
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.	GO TO “Final” subsection → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ‘Related’ is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)	GO TO “Persuasive” subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/> Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)	

		Reason	XXXX			
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)				
	Discussion					
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.				
		[Negative is not related.] < 2/3	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection			
		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)			
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)		Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)			
		X	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)			
		Reason	We can use sample to test the hardness, purity, light transmission, EPD, FWHM. And the color, bubble, inclusion, grain boundary can be checked by 100% cosmetic checking. These specifications can influence each other but can't replace each other because they can't be decided by the single factor. So we shall list all these parameter here to specify the sapphire for HB-LED.			
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)				
	Discussion	None				
	Result of Vote (check one)	38 Y-0N; Motion passed				
		[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)		Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection
[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3				N	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%		GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)				
X 90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]		GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection				
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommendations					
	Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.					
	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX				
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx				
		Justification (If necessary)				
2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX					
	TO: Section/Paragraph xxx					

		Justification (if necessary)	
	Motion	Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion		
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).] GO TO “Incorporation of the Technical Change” subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3 GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)
Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion	To incorporate the technical change(s).	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion		
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.] GO TO “Final” subsection → (F)
<input type="checkbox"/>	[Disagree to incorporate.] > 10% GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)		
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can be used only “if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)		
	Use of “Not significant finding option” (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “not significant”. GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “significant”. GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Whether or not the Negative is “not significant” is decided by a vote.
	Motion	The Negative is “not significant”.	
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)
<input type="checkbox"/>		XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)	
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A) Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B) Not related (counted under i in disposition)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C) Related and not persuasive (significant)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D) Not significant (counted under j in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(E) Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change DOCUMENT FAILS
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(F) Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)
	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.

Voting Interest Reject 1- Voter Reject 2 (Voter: Name and company)

- Negative 1
- Negative 2
- Negative 3
- Negative 4

Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 1

Check only when the Document has not been failed.

#	Original number (#) of Negatives	(g)
#	Number of Negatives withdrawn	(h)
#	Number of Negatives found not related	(i)
#	Number of Negatives found not significant	(j)
#	Number of Negatives addressed by technical change (Negative becomes not significant)	(k)
Final	$g - (h + i + j + k) = 0$	Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
	$g - (h + i + j + k) > 0$	Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
	Reject without a Negative	Not Valid

Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)

Voting Interest Reject 2 (Voting Interest Name: XXXXXX)

Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Name and company)

- Negative 1
- Negative 2

IV. Other Technical Issues

Note: TC Chapter may choose to address a technical issue that is not part of a Negative received on a Letter Ballot (i.e., a Comment or a reason not addressed by a Vote response) by handling it as a Negative and finding it related and technically persuasive. The TC Chapter may then fail the Document or address such technical issue by using the procedure defined in Regulations § 9.6.4.3 to make a technical change to the Document. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.4.5)

Technical Issue	Origin	*TF/TC Chapter to choose Comment # (Voter: Name and company) / A reason not addressed by a Vote response
	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in including text in the ballot as appropriate.

	Reason	*Original Comment text, if applicable, and problem statement, including justification and suggestion, should be copied.				
Handle technical issue identified above as a Negative.						
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)		‘Related’ is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)		GO TO “Persuasive” subsection	
			Negative is not related and assigned to TF. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)			
			Negative is not related and placed on agenda of current TC Chapter meeting as new business. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)			
		Reason	XXXX			
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)				
	Discussion					
Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.					
		[Negative is not related.] <2/3			GO TO “Persuasive” subsection	
		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related] and assigned to TF.			GO TO “Final” subsection → (B)	
		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related] and placed on agenda of current TC Chapter meeting as new business.				
Motion and Reason (check one)		Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)				
		Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)				
		Reason	XXXX			
Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)					
Discussion						
Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.					
		[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	Y	GO TO “Address by Technical Change Option” subsection	
		[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		N	GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)	
		2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%			GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)	
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommendations					
	Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in “FROM” and “TO” fields.					
	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX				
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx				
Justification (if necessary)						

2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX			
	TO: Section/Paragraph xxx			
	Justification (if necessary)			
Motion		Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).		
Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
Discussion				
Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.		
		<input type="checkbox"/> 2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).]	GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion		To incorporate the technical change(s).	
	Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.	
<input type="checkbox"/> 90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.]			GO TO "Final" subsection → (F)	
<input type="checkbox"/> [Disagree to incorporate.] >10%			GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
Final	(check one)	<input type="checkbox"/> (B)	Not related	
		<input type="checkbox"/> (C)	Related and not persuasive	
		<input type="checkbox"/> (E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS
		<input type="checkbox"/> (F)	Addressed by technical change	
	(check if applicable)	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.		

V. Comments

V- (i) Voters' Comments

Commenter 1 (Name/Company) - Comment 1

Comment	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph #, if necessary.		
	In Table 2, in the description of the Grade 2, it is necessary separate words. In the rows with Grade 3 an 4, please delete spaces. In subsection 7.2.6 separate words.		
Action	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.		
	*No motion is required in this step.		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #	

	X	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.
		Refer to the TF for more consideration.
		New Business
		Editorial Change
	Options for editorial change (check one)	Case 1: No vote in this section: To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V.
		Case 2: Voted in this section: Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.
Editorial Changes	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph xxx
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx
		Justification (If necessary)
	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph xxx
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx
		Justification (If necessary)
Motion	To approve no action was done for 5723A upon this comment	
Motion by/2 nd by	Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)	
Discussion	None	
Vote	38 Y-0 N; Motion passed	

This table is needed for each Comment.

Commenter 2 (Name/Company) - Comment 1

Commenter 3 (Name/Company) - Comment 1

V-(ii) Comments Created by Handling Negative

Comment (Created by Handling Negative) NC – 1

Comment	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in

		The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.	
		*No motion is required in this step.	
Action	<input type="checkbox"/>	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Refer to the TF for more consideration.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	New business	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Editorial change	
			<input type="checkbox"/>
		Case 1: No vote in this section:	
		To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V.	
		Case 2: Voted in this section:	
		Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.	
Editorial Changes	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph xxx	
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx	
		Justification (If necessary)	
	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph xxx	
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx	
		Justification (If necessary)	
Motion		To approve above editorial change(s)	
Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Discussion		XXXX	
Vote		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.	

Comment (Created by Handling Negative) NC – 2
Comment (Created by Handling Negative) NC – 3

VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.

1	Origin of this editorial change (Check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Commenter(s) / Comment(s) #
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Other []
	FROM: Under Section 5.1.4		
None			

	<p>To: Section 5.1.5 5.1.5 OHT— optical homogeneity testing</p> <p>Justification: (if necessary)</p>	
	<p>Origin of this editorial change (Check one)</p>	<p>Commenter(s) / Comment(s) #</p> <p>Other []</p>
2	<p>FROM: Section 7.1.1 7.1.1 Hardness— Vickers-hardness of single crystal sapphire should be \perp C-axis1800~2500HV, // C-axis1800-2300HV according to the method specified in ASTM E384</p> <p>To: Section 7.1.1 7.1.1 Hardness – Vickers-hardness of single crystal sapphire shall be \perp C-axis1800~2500HV, // C-axis1800-2300HV according to the method specified in ASTM E384</p> <p>Justification: (if necessary)</p>	
3	<p>Origin of this editorial change (Check one)</p> <p>FROM: Section 7.1.2 7.1.2 Light transmission — For HB-LED wafers, the light transmission should be >60% at 250~400nm wavelength, and more than 85% at 400~900nm wavelength according the test method specified in ASTM F1316. The light transmission of single crystal sapphire should be similar to Figure 1.</p> <p>To: Section 7.1.2 7.1.2 Light transmission — For HB-LED wafers, the light transmission shall be >60% at 250~400nm wavelength, and \geq85% at 400~900nm wavelength according the test method specified in ASTM F1316. A transmission map as a sample is show on Figure 1.</p>	
4	<p>Origin of this editorial change (Check one)</p> <p>FROM: Section 7.1.3 FWHM—The full width at half maximum (FWHM) of sapphire for HB-LED wafers shall be no more than 15" . According to the XRD test method specified in ASTM D5357, the X-Ray Diffraction FWHM chart similar to the shape as shown as in Figure 2. The curve should be bell shape, there should be only a single peak.</p> <p>To: Section 7.1.3 FWHM – The full width at half maximum (FWHM) of sapphire for HB-LED wafers shall be no more than 15" .</p> <p>7.1.3.1 The testing for FWHM shall be performed under the follow conditions: 7.1.3.1.1 Testing Sample — 0.1~10mm thickness double sides polished wafer. Roughness of polished surface shall be less than Ra0.3nm. Orientation < \pm0.5degree base on the requirement of the order. 7.1.3.1.2 Testing method — According to the XRD test method specified in ASTM D5357, the X-Ray Diffraction FWHM plot similar to the shape as shown as in Figure 2. The curve should be bell shape; there shall be only a single peak.</p>	
5	<p>Origin of this editorial change (Check one)</p> <p>FROM: Section 7.2.2 7.2.2 EPD — EPD for single crystal sapphire for HB-LED wafers must be less than 1000 according to the method specified in SEMI M36.</p> <p>To: Section 7.2.2 7.2.2 EPD — EPD for single crystal sapphire for HB-LED wafers must be less than 1000μm^2. 7.2.2.1 The testing for EPD shall be performed under the follow conditions : 7.2.2.1.1 Sample — 2" sapphire substrate with polished surface roughness Ra<0.3nm 7.2.2.1.2 Etching method — Soak into KOH which is heated to 320 °C for 15mins 7.2.2.1.3 Calculate the EPD according to the method specified in SEMI M36.</p>	
6	<p>Origin of this editorial change (Check one)</p>	

FROM: Section 7.2.6	
7.2.6 Color — Color can be introduced to the crystal by micro impurities or elements captured in the lattice structure during growth or by the oxygen vacancies. These phenomena can cause the sapphire to appear yellow, pink or others color. Sapphire with color is suitable for HB-LED production if the color is removed during the production process (typically during the annealing process).Single crystal sapphire for HB-LED does not allow colors if the color cannot be removed.	
To: Section 7.2.6	
7.2.6 Color — Color can be introduced to the crystal by micro impurities or elements captured in the crystal during growth or by the oxygen vacancies. These cause the sapphire to appear yellow, pink or other colors. Sapphire with color is suitable for HB-LED production if the color is removed during the production process (typically during the annealing process). Single crystal sapphire for HB-LED does not allow colors if the color cannot be removed.	
Motion	To approve the above editorial change(s).
Motion by/ 2nd by	Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)
Discussion	None
Vote	38 Y-0 N; Motion passed

VII. Approval Conditions Check

VII. - (i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.2)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.3)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)					
Approval Rate	=	28	/	29	=	96.6%		≥90%	

VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

Note: See Regulations § 9.7.2 for further information.

X	Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed): The Letter Ballot meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.
----------	--

Need a Ratification Ballot:

The Letter Ballot meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

VIII. Safety Check

Note: See *Regulations § 15* for further information.

Motion	X	This is not a Safety Document , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is still technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations ¶ 8.7.1</i>)
		This is a Safety Document , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is not technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations ¶ 8.7.2</i>)
		Safety Checklist (<i>Regulations ¶ 15.3</i>) is complete and has been included with the Document throughout the balloting process. (<i>Regulations ¶ 15.1.2</i>)
Motion by/2 nd by		Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)
Discussion		None
Vote		38 Y-0 N; Motion passed

IX. Intellectual Property (IP) Check

Note: This Letter Ballot may cover all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline. See *Regulations § 16* for further information.

X	The TC Chapter meeting chair asked those participating, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline. (<i>Regulations ¶ 8.8.1</i>)		
Motion	X	No potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known. GO TO SECTION X.	
		Potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known, but a Letter of Assurance (LOA) or copyright release letter for such items has been obtained or presented to the TC Chapter. GO TO SECTION X.	
		Potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known and use of such materials is technically justified by the TC Chapter, but an LOA or copyright release letter for some of the item(s) has NOT been obtained or presented to the TC Chapter.	
		Ask ISC for special permission to publish.	
		Quit activity.	
		Wait for LOA for patented technology or release of copyrighted items.	
	Motion by/2 nd by		Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)
	Discussion		None
	Vote		38 Y-0 N
	Final Action		X Motion passed Motion failed

* Note: Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this Letter Ballot.

X. Action for This Document

Motion	<input type="checkbox"/>	This Document passed TC Chapter review as balloted and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This Document passed TC Chapter review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This Document passed TC Chapter review with technical changes and with or without editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review. A Ratification Ballot will be issued to verify the technical changes.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This Document failed TC Chapter review and will be returned to the TF for rework.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This Document failed TC Chapter review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/ 2nd by	Liuyun Qi (GHTOT)/Xinhong Yang (AURORA)	
Discussion	None	
Vote	38 Y-0 N	
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed

Standards staff to record the result of the A&R procedural review here:

A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Approved for publication
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Approved pending acceptance of the Ratification Ballot
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
	Reason:	