

Record of Line-item Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: [Japan](#)
 Global Technical Committee: [Information & Control](#)
 TC Chapter Cochairs: [Takayuki Nishimura/ SCREEN Semiconductor Solutions, Mitsuhiro Matsuda/ Hitachi Kokusai Electric](#)
 Standards staff: [Chie Yanagisawa](#)

	Scheduled in Background Statement	Actual
Date	12/16/2016	12/16/2016
Location	Tokyo Big Sight Conference Tower	Tokyo Big Sight Conference Tower

[Document Information](#)

I. Document Number, Title, Lists of Line Items

Document Number 5973		Document Title Line Item Revision to SEMI E170-0416 "SPECIFICATION FOR SECURED FOUNDATION OF RECIPE MANAGEMENT SYSTEM (SFORMS)"
List of Line Items	Line Item 1	Line Item Title Revise the format of 'Service Message Description Table'.
	Line Item 2	Line Item Title Correct editorial errors in 'Table 46 Compliance Statement'.
	Line Item 3	Line Item Title Add a section 'Required Items for Each Implementation Step' which provides a checklist of required items for each implementation step in Related Information.

Line Item 1 Adjudication

II. Tally (Standards staff to fill in)

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.1)

Voting Tally:

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes		Distribution		Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	65	÷	105	=	61.9%	>=60%
Intercommittee Ballot	8					
Voting Interest Reject(s)	0				Total Voters with Rejects	0
Voting Interest Accept(s)	35					

III. Rejects

There is no reject vote to Line Item 1 of #5973.

IV. Other Technical Issues

There is no Other Technical Issue to Line Item 1 of #5973.

V. Comments

V- (i) Voters' Comments

Commenter 1 (Tadashi Mochizuki / Tokyo Electron Limited) - Comment 1

Comment	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, if necessary.
	This comment is not related to this Line Item ballot, but the 'Req' column in Table 39 is used to 'Y'. 'R' is correct.
Action	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.
	*No motion is required in this step.
	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #

		No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.	
	X	Refer to the TF for more consideration.	
		New Business	
		Editorial Change	
	Options for Editorial Change (check one)	Case 1: No vote in this section : To be included and voted on in § VI. Summary of Editorial Changes.	
		Case 2: Voted in this section : Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.	
Editorial Change		1	FROM: Section/Paragraph xxx
			TO: Section/Paragraph xxx
	Justification (If necessary)		
	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph xxx	
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx	
		Justification (If necessary)	
Motion		To approve above editorial change(s)	
Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Discussion		XXXX	
Vote		XX-XX; Motion passed/failed.	

V-(ii) Comments Created by handling Negative

There is no comment created by handling negative to Line Item 1 of #5973.

VI. Editorial Changes other than those dealt with in Section V.

There is no Editorial Changes other than those dealt with in Section V. to Line Item 1 of #5973.

VII. Approval Conditions Check

VII-(i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a Technical Change. (*Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.2*)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (*Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.3*)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

			Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)				
	Approval Rate	=	35	/	35	=	100.0%		

VII-(ii). Approval Level (check one)

See § 9.7.2 of the *Regulations* for further information

- Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot Approval Conditions for the global technical committee
- Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot Approval Conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to verify Technical Changes

Line Item 2 Adjudication

II. Tally (Standards staff to fill in)

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.1)

Voting Tally:

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes		Distribution		Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	65	÷	105	=	61.9%	>=60%
Intercommittee Ballot	8					
Voting Interest Reject(s)	0		Total Voters with Rejects		0	
Voting Interest Accept(s)	35					

III. Rejects

There is no reject vote to Line Item 2 of #5973.

IV. Other Technical Issues

There is no Other Technical Issues to Line Item 2 of #5973.

V. Comments

There is no comment to Line Item 2 of #5973.

V-(ii) Comments Created by handling Negative

There is no comment created by handling negative to Line Item 2 of #5973.

VI. Editorial Changes other than those dealt with in Section V

There is no Editorial Changes other than those dealt with in Section V to Line Item 2 of #5973.

Line Item 3 Adjudication

II. Tally (Standards staff to fill in)

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.1)

Voting Tally:

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes		Distribution	=	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	65	÷	105	=	61.9%	>=60%
Intercommittee Ballot	8					
Voting Interest Reject(s)	1		Total Voters with Rejects			1
Voting Interest Accept(s)	31					

III. Rejects

Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: PEER Group, Inc.)

Voting Interest Reject 1- Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Albert Fuchigami / PEER Group, Inc.)

Negative 1 of Voting Interest Reject 1- Voter Reject 1

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in including text in the ballot if necessary.		
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. The Checklist should not have a Compliance column since this checklist is part of Related Information and not the Standard, and it should not imply fulfilling an implementation step meets a compliance requirement. Linking the implementation step and fundamental requirement implemented is fine.		
TF input (optional)				
Withdrawal (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection	
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on 12/09/2016.	GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)	
at	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no Motion.)	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection

	(check one)	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)			
		Reason	XXXX		
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Discussion				
Result of Vote (check one)		[Negative is not related.] <2/3	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection		
		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)		
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)			
		Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)			
		Reason	XXXX		
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Discussion				
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX-XX; Motion passed/failed.			
		[Negative is related and persuasive.] >1/3	Is a Technical Change Recommended	Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection
		[Negative is related and not persuasive.] <2/3	?	N	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)
		2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] <90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)		
	90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection			
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommended by the TF				
	Note: Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.				
	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX			
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx			
		Justification (if necessary)			
	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX			
TO: Section/Paragraph xxx					
Justification (if necessary)					
Motion	Negative is addressed by the Technical Change.				

	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion		
	Result of Vote one (check one)	XX-XX; Motion passed/failed.	
		<input type="checkbox"/> 2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the Technical Change.]	GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Negative is not addressed by the Technical Change.] < 2/3	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)
Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion	To incorporate the Technical Change.	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion		
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX-XX; Motion passed/failed.	
<input type="checkbox"/> 90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.]		GO TO "Final" subsection → (F)	
	<input type="checkbox"/> [Disagree to incorporate.] > 10%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)		
	Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/> It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant".	GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)
		<input type="checkbox"/> It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "significant".	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)
		<input type="checkbox"/> Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote.	
	Motion	The Negative is "not significant".	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Vote	<input type="checkbox"/> XX-XX; Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)
<input type="checkbox"/> XX-XX; Motion failed with simple majority		GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)	
Final	(check if applicable)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> (A) withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/> (B) not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/> (C) related and not persuasive (significant)	
		<input type="checkbox"/> (D) not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/> (E) related and persuasive and not addressed by Technical Change	DOCUMENT FAILS
	<input type="checkbox"/> (F) addressed by Technical Change (counted under k disposition)		
(check if applicable)	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.		

Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 1

1	Original number of Negatives	(g)	
1	# of Negatives withdrawn	(h)	
0	# of Negatives found not related	(i)	
0	# of Negatives found not significant	(j)	
0	# of Negatives addressed by Technical Change (Negative becomes not significant)	(k)	
Final	X	$g - (h + i + j + k) = 0$	Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VII. <i>Approval Conditions Check</i>
		$g - (h + i + j + k) > 0$	Reject is included in the denominator of § VII. <i>Approval Conditions Check</i>
		Reject without a Negative	Not Valid

Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (*Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3*)

Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2*)

IV. Other Technical Issues

Note: TC Chapter may choose to address a technical issue that is not part of a Negative received on a Letter Ballot (i.e., a Comment or a reason not addressed by a Vote response) by handling it as a Negative and finding it related and technically persuasive. The TC Chapter may then fail the Document or address such technical issue by using the procedure defined in § 9.6.4.3 to make a technical change to the Document. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.6.2.4.5)

Technical Issue	Origin	*TF/TC Chapter to choose If this line item passes, committee approval of the amendment of the table won't be done until the result of this line item is published. So, Mr. Matsuda rephrases the negative from Fuchigami-san and propose to fail this line item.			
	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in including text in the ballot as appropriate. Table R1-2 in LI 3			
	Reason	*Original Comment text if applicable, problem statement including justification and suggestion should be copied. The Checklist should not have a Compliance column since this checklist is part of Related Information.			
Handle technical issue identified above as a Negative					
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no Motion.)	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
			Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Discussion				
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX-XX; Motion passed/failed.			
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is not related.] <2/3	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection		
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3≤ [Negative is not related.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)		
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
			Reason		
	Motion by/2nd by	Yoshihisa Takasaki (SCREEN Semiconductor Solutions) / Naoko Murata (Tokyo Electron)			
	Discussion	None			
	Result of Vote (check one)	9-0; Motion passed/failed.			
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and persuasive.] >1/3	Is a Technical Change Recommended? (Y/N)	Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and not persuasive.] <2/3		N	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)
<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] <90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)			

Technical Change Recommended by the TF					
Note: Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.					
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX		
			TO: Section/Paragraph xxx		
			Justification (if necessary)		
	Technical Change	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX		
			TO: Section/Paragraph xxx		
			Justification (if necessary)		
Motion		Negative is addressed by the Technical Change.			
Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
Discussion					
Result of Vote (check one)		XX-XX; Motion passed/failed.			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the Technical Change.]	GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not addressed by the Technical Change.] < 2/3	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion		To incorporate the Technical Change.		
	Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion				
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX-XX; Motion passed/failed.		
<input type="checkbox"/>			90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (F)	
<input type="checkbox"/>			[Disagree to incorporate.] > 10%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
Final	(check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	not related	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(C)	related and not persuasive	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(E)	related and persuasive and not addressed by Technical Change	DOCUMENT FAILS
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(F)	addressed by Technical Change	
	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.		

V. Comments

There is no comment to Line Item 3 of #5973.

V-(ii) Comments Created by handling Negative

There is no Comments Created by handling Negative to Line Item 3 of #5973.

VI. Editorial Changes other than those dealt with in Section V.

There is no Editorial Changes other than those dealt with in Section V. to Line Item 3 of #5973.

VII. Approval Conditions Check

VII-(i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a Technical Change. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.7.1.2)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.7.1.3)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

			Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)				
	Approval Rate	=	31	/		=	#DIV/0!		

VII-(ii). Approval Level (check one)

See § 9.7.2 of the *Regulations* for further information

Line Item 3 meets the Letter Ballot Approval Conditions for the global technical committee

Line Item 3 meets the Letter Ballot Approval Conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to verify Technical Changes

Checks for Entire Document Including All Approved Line Items

VIII. Safety Check

This Safety check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items. See § 15 of the Regulations for further information.

Motion:	X	This is not a Safety Document , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is still technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations ¶ 8.7.1</i>)
		This is a Safety Document , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is not technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations ¶ 8.7.2</i>)
		Safety Checklist (<i>Regulations ¶ 15.3</i>) is complete and has been included with the Document throughout the balloting process. (<i>Regulations ¶¶ 15.1.2</i>)
Motion by/2nd by		Yoshihisa Takasaki (SCREEN Semiconductor Solutions) / Naoko Murata (Tokyo Electron)
Discussion		None
Vote		9-0; Motion passed

IX. Intellectual Property (IP) Check

Note: This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items. See § 16 of the Regulations for further information.

X	The TC Chapter meeting chair asked those participating, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline. (<i>Regulations ¶ 8.8.1</i>)	
	X	No potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items are known. GO TO SECTION IX
		Potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items are known, but a Letter of Assurance (LOA) or copyright release letter for such items has been obtained or presented to the TC Chapter. GO TO SECTION IX
		Potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items are known and use of such materials is technically justified by the TC Chapter, but an LOA or copyright release letter for some of the item(s) has NOT been obtained or presented to the TC Chapter.
MOTION		Ask ISC for special permission to publish.
		Quit activity.
		Wait for LOA for patented technology or release of copyrighted items.
Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)
Discussion		XXXX
Vote		XX-XX
Final Action		

* Note: Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this Letter Ballot.

X. Action for this document

Motion (Check all applicable items)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [1], and [2] passed TC Chapter review as balloted and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] passed TC Chapter review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] passed TC Chapter review with Technical Changes and with or without editorial changes and will be forwarded to the A&R SC for procedural review. A Ratification Ballot will be issued to verify the Technical Changes.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] failed TC Chapter review and will be returned to the task force for rework.
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [3] failed TC Chapter review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/ 2nd by	Yoshihisa Takasaki (SCREEN Semiconductor Solutions) / Naoko Murata (Tokyo Electron)	
Discussion	The TC Chapter confirmed the approval process for publishing Related Information without ballot process.	
Vote	9-0	
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed

Standards staff to record the result of the A&R procedural review here:

A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are approved for publication
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are approved pending for acceptance of the Ratification Ballot
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are Not approved
	Reason:	