

Record of Line-item Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: [North America](#)
 Global Technical Committee: [Information and Control](#)
 TC Chapter Cochairs: [Brian Rubow \(Cimetrix\)](#); [Jack Ghiselli \(Ghiselli Consulting\)](#); [James Moyne \(Applied Materials, University of Michigan\)](#)
 Standards Staff: [Inna Skvortsova](#)

	Scheduled in Background Statement	Actual
Date	Wednesday, November 8, 2017	Wednesday, November 8, 2017
Location	SEMI HQ	SEMI HQ
Reason for Change of Date and/or Location (if changed)		

Note: See [Regulations ¶ 9.5](#) Exception for allowable reason to change.

[Document Information](#)

I. Document Number, Title, Lists of Line Items

Document Number 6005	Document Title Line Item Revision to SEMI E30-0717 SPECIFICATION FOR THE GENERIC MODEL FOR COMMUNICATIONS AND CONTROL OF MANUFACTURING EQUIPMENT (GEM)	
List of Line Items	Line Item 1	Line Item Title Enhancement to the SEMI E30 with SMN for documenting messages in an equipment supplier's GEM documentation

[Line Item 1 Adjudication](#)

II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: [As-cast tally after close of voting period](#)

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. ([Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.1](#))

Voting Tally (with example values):

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes	Distribution	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	72	÷ 119	= 60.5%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	23			
Voting Interest Reject(s)	2	Total Voters with Rejects		2
Voting Interest Accept(s)	47			

Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

III. Rejects

Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: Nishimura, Takayuki)

Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Nishimura, Takayuki, SCREEN)

Negative 1

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. Section 11.5.1			
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. The additional description for SMN is not necessary. If description for SMN is needed to add, description for SML should be added in equal measure.			
TF input (optional)		Adding context information for SML is out of scope for this ballot.			
Withdrawal (check one)		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)		
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
	Reason		No technical objection was raised. The concern is resolved with an Editorial Change.		
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Brian Rubow (Cimetrix) / Nishimura, Takayuki (SCREEN)			
	Discussion	NONE			
	Result of Vote (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>

		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N	GO TO “Final” subsection → (E)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)			
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO “Not Significant Finding Option” subsection			
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can be used only “if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)						
	Use of “Not significant finding option” (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “not significant”.	GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)			
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “significant”.	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Whether or not the Negative is “not significant” is decided by a vote.				
	Motion	The Negative is “not significant”.					
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)					
	Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N ; Motion passed with simple majority				GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)
<input type="checkbox"/>		XX Y-XX N ; Motion failed with simple majority				GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)	
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)			
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change			DOCUMENT FAILS
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)				
(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.					

Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 1

Check only when the Document has not been failed.

1	Original number (#) of Negatives	(g)	
0	Number of Negatives withdrawn	(h)	
0	Number of Negatives found not related	(i)	
0	Number of Negatives found not significant	(j)	
0	Number of Negatives addressed by technical change (Negative becomes not significant)	(k)	
Final	<input type="checkbox"/>	$g - (h + i + j + k) = 0$	Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	$g - (h + i + j + k) > 0$	Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Reject without a Negative	Not Valid

Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)
 Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)

Voting Interest Reject 2 (Voting Interest Name: Matsuda, Mitsuhiro)
Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Matsuda, Mitsuhiro, HitachiLtd)
Negative 1

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. Section 11.5.1			
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. This proposal is not needed. ¶11.5.1 requires message documentation itself to equipment supplier. Documentation method is written at ¶11.5.3.			
TF input (optional)		Content of this reject is identical to reject #1.			
Withdrawal (check one)		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.		GO TO "Related" subsection
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)		
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		Reason	No technical objection was raised. The concern is resolved with the same Editorial Change proposed for Reject #1.		
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Brian Rubow (Cimetrix) / Chris Maloney (INTEL)			
	Discussion	NONE			
	Result of Vote (check one)	7 Y-0 N; Motion passed			
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Y GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection			
Not Sign	This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)				

	Use of “Not significant finding option” (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “not significant”.	GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative “significant”.	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Whether or not the Negative is “not significant” is decided by a vote.		
	Motion	The Negative is “not significant”.			
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)	
<input type="checkbox"/>		XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)		
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X		

IV. Other Technical Issues

NONE

V. Comments

V- (i) Voters' Comments

Commenter 1 (Name/Company) - Comment 1

Comment	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph #, if necessary.	
	<i>In Chapter 11 of SEMI E5, there is no description about the type of language used for documentation. I think it seems inappropriate to describe only SMN (and not describe SML).</i>	
Action	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.	
	*No motion is required in this step.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #
	<input type="checkbox"/>	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Refer to the TF for more consideration.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	New Business
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Editorial Change
Options for editorial change (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Case 1: No vote in this section: To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Case 2: Voted in this section: Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.

VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.

Origin of this editorial change (Check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Commenter(s) / Comment(s) #
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Other [Reject #1-1 Nishimura, Takayuki (SCREEN) and reject #2-1 Matsuda, Mitsushiro (Hitachi Kokusai)]
1	FROM: Section/Paragraph Section 11.5.1	
	11.5.1 Message Documentation — The equipment supplier shall provide message documentation in conformance with Chapter 11 (Message Documentation) of SEMI E5. The messages can be documented and logged using E173 XML SECS-II Message Notation (SMN).	
	TO: Section/Paragraph Proposal 1.2, in section 11.5.1	
11.5.1 Message Documentation — The equipment supplier shall provide message documentation in conformance with Chapter 11 (Message Documentation) of SEMI E5. The messages can be documented and logged using E173 XML SECS-II Message Notation (SMN).		

	Justification: (If necessary)
Motion	To approve the above editorial change(s).
Motion by/ 2nd by	Brian Rubow (Cimetrix) / Frank Summers (Industrial-Strength Graphics)
Discussion	NONE
Vote	7 Y-0 N; Motion passed

VII. Approval Conditions Check

VII. - (i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (*Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.2*)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (*Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.3*)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)				
Approval Rate	=	47	/	49	=	95.9%		≥90%

VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

Note: See *Regulations § 9.7.2* for further information.

Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):

Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.

Need a Ratification Ballot:

Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

Checks for Entire Document Including All Approved Line Items

VIII. Safety Check

Note: This Safety check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items. See § 15 of the Regulations for further information.

Motion	X	This is not a Safety Document, when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is still technically sound and complete. (Regulations ¶ 8.7.1)	
		This is a Safety Document, when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is not technically sound and complete. (Regulations ¶ 8.7.2)	
		Safety Checklist (Regulations ¶ 15.3) is complete and has been included with the Document throughout the balloting process. (Regulations ¶ 15.1.2)	
Motion by/2 nd by		Chris Malooney (Intel) / Brian Rubow (Cimetrix)	
Discussion		NONE	
Vote		7 Y-0 N; Motion passed	

IX. Intellectual Property (IP) Check

Note: This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items. See § 16 of the Regulations for further information.

X	The TC Chapter meeting chair asked those participating, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline. (Regulations ¶ 8.8.1)	
X	No potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known.	GO TO SECTION X.

* Note: Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this Letter Ballot.

X. Action for This Document

X	Line item(s) [1] passed TC Chapter review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.	
Motion by/ 2 nd by		Brian Rubow (Cimetrix) / Frank Summers (Industrial Strength Graphics)
Discussion		NONE
Vote		7 Y-0 N
Final Action	X	Motion passed
		Motion failed

Standards staff to record the result of the A&R procedural review here:

A&R		Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are Approved for publication
		Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are Approved pending acceptance of the Ratification Ballot
		Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are Not approved
	Reason:	