

Responses and Review Form for SEMI Draft Document #4683H Line Item Revision to SEMI S2-0715, Environmental, Health, and Safety Guideline for Semiconductor Manufacturing Equipment. Delayed Revisions Related to Chemical Exposure

Line Item 1 – Delayed Revisions Related to Chemical Exposure Criteria

Tallies at Close of Voting

<i>Voting Interest Returns</i>	55	<i>Voting Interest Accept Votes (VIAccept)</i>	36
<i>Total Voting Interests</i>	87	<i>Interest Reject Votes (IReject)</i>	4
<i>Voting Interest Return %</i>	63.22%	<i>Approval % [VIAccept / (VIAccept + IReject)]</i>	90.00%
<i>Other Returns (Intercommittee, etc.)</i>		<i># of Interest Rejects that Need to be not found Valid for</i>	
	15	<i>Final Approval % >= 90%</i>	0
<i>Total Votes</i>	92		
<i>Total Votes with Comments</i>	2		
<i>Total Reject Votes</i>	4		

Rejects/Negatives

Summary: 17 Total Items Submitted

<i>Company: Submitter</i>	<i>ID</i>	<i>Negs</i>	<i>Disp</i>	<i>Company: Submitter</i>	<i>ID</i>	<i>Negs</i>	<i>Disp</i>
KLA-Tencor: Lauren Crane	KT	4		ASML: Bert Planting	ASML	2	
Safety Guru: Eric Sklar	SG	8		Applied Materials: Ed Karl	AMAT	3	

Details:

NOTICE: SEMI Staff must receive copies of ALL withdrawals of negative votes.

Table 1 Negatives from < KLA-Tencor: Lauren Crane >

<i>W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant</i>					
#	Ref.	Negative <u>including</u> Justification	TF Finding and Reason	Motion and Reason in Committee:	Final
KT-1	23.5.1.2. Bullet 1	<p><u>Perceived Problem:</u> Negative Several aspects of this bullet are unclear. “Integrated sampling including calibrated diaphragm pumps and passive dosimeters used in combination with a validated method.”</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. What does “integrated sampling” mean in this case? – integrated into the equipment, integrated over a certain sampling period, etc... ? 2. What is a “calibrated diaphragm pump”? - i.e., calibrated with regard to what? 3. It is ambiguous whether “used in combination with a validated method” applies only the passive dosimeters, or to “integrated sampling” <p><u>Proposed Solution:</u> Revise the text to clarify these points and help ensure consistent and common interpretation. Such as the following:</p> <p>23.5.1.1 When available for the substance of concern (SOC) (also known as “analyte”) and concentration being evaluated, one of the following methods should be used:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> · A sample collected by a time-integrated sampling means (e.g. a diaphragm pump with an calibrated flowrate or a passive charcoal-capture dosimeter) analyzed Integrated sampling including calibrated diaphragm pumps and passive dosimeters used in combination with a validated method. · Direct reading instrumentation (real-time / instantaneous) as used per the manufacturer’s specification and guidance. · Collection of a stable SOC (analyte) in a calibrated (i.e., known sample collection rate) vacuum canister and laboratory analysis using a validated method. 	<p>(Select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not related <input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related) <input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive</p> <p>Reason: Motion Holbrook / Barsky TF motion for accepting as editorial. Y – 9 N - 0</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: __)</p> <p>Move to find this negative: (select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow) <input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business <input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____ <input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason) <input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive (ballot fails)</p> <p>Reason: By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p> <p>Significance finding/method: (select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%) <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion</p> <p>By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p>	

W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant

#	Ref.	Negative <u>including Justification</u>	TF Finding <u>and Reason</u>	Motion <u>and Reason</u> in Committee:	Final
KT-2	23.5.1.2 bullet 2	<p>Perceived Problem: Negative This bullet does not have any aspect related to validation. In other words there is not a requirement that the technology of the instrument be based on a validated analysis method (which is present in the other two bullets) nor any requirement that the direct reading instrument conform to any other particular criteria (e.g., certified). (real-time / instantaneous) is not necessarily a restatement of 'direct reading'</p> <p>Proposed Solution: Change to the effect of · <u>A direct reading, instrumentation (real-time / instantaneous) instrument using a validated method of analysis and as used per the instrument manufacturer's specification and guidance.</u></p>	<p>(Select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not related <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related) <input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive</p> <p>Reason: TF show of hands on accepting inserted note under bullet 2 to clarify. Y 7 N 0</p> <p>Motion: Holbrook / Barsky Based on the inserted note and the concern was adequately addressed. Y 6 N 1</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: __)</p> <p>Move to find this negative: (select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow) <input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business <input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____ <input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason) <input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive (ballot fails)</p> <p>Reason: By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p> <p>Significance finding/method: (select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%) <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion</p> <p>By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p>	

W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant

#	Ref.	Negative <u>including Justification</u>	TF Finding <u>and Reason</u>	Motion <u>and Reason</u> in Committee:	Final
KT-3	23.5.1.2 bullet 3	<p><u>Perceived Problem:</u> Negative Bullet three, as worded, is not robustly differentiated from the first bullet, which may lead to confusion. The inclusion of “a stable SOC (analyte)” is not parallel with the other bullets, and I imagine it is meant to be – which also has the potential to confuse.</p> <p><u>Proposed Solution:</u> Change to the effect of “A sample collected Collection of a stable SOC (analyte) in a calibrated (i.e., known sample collection rate) vacuum canister and laboratory analysis using a validated method.</p>	<p>(Select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not related <input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive</p> <p>Reason: Withdrawn via email from Lauren C.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: __)</p> <p>Move to find this negative: (select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow) <input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business <input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____ <input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive (ballot fails)</p> <p>Reason: By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p> <p>Significance finding/method: (select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%) <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion</p> <p>By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p>	

W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant

#	Ref.	Negative <u>including Justification</u>	TF Finding <u>and Reason</u>	Motion <u>and Reason</u> in Committee:	Final
KT-4	Note XX following 23.5.3	<p>Perceived Problem: Negative</p> <p>“is to be selected.” Gives the impression of a conformance criterion, which is inappropriate for a note.</p> <p>Proposed Solution: Delete the note or change to the effect of “Selection of the lowest OEL, based on the target SOC and exposure duration, published by a professional or governmental agency and with consideration of the appropriate category of OEL [e.g., time-weighted average, ceiling and short-term exposure limits (STELs)] is the recommended approach in order to cover all installations and end-user locations. The appropriate OEL based on the target SOC and exposure duration is to be selected. OEL selection includes consideration of the appropriate category of OEL [e.g., time-weighted average, ceiling and short-term exposure limits (STELs)]. Two online resources that can help initially identify OELs around the world are:”</p>	<p>(Select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive</p> <p>Reason:</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: __)</p> <p>Move to find this negative: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive (ballot fails)</p> <p>Reason:</p> <p>By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p> <p>Significance finding/method: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion</p> <p>By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p>	

Final disposition of this reject:

- Valid (includes at least one significant negative)
- Not Valid (all negatives withdrawn, found not related, or found not significant)

Table 2 Negatives from < Safety Guru: Eric Sklar >

W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant					
#	Ref.	Negative including Justification	TF Finding and Reason	Motion and Reason in Committee:	Final
SG1-1	DX-1 5.1	<p><i>Negative:</i> Add "LFL" to the Abbreviations and Acronyms list.</p> <p><i>Reason/Justification:</i> This ballot proposes changing "lower explosive limit" to "lower flammable limit (LFL)" in 5.2 but does not propose adding ":LFL" to 5.1.</p>	<p>(Select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive</p> <p>Reason:</p>	<p>Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: _____)</p> <p>Move to find this negative: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive (ballot fails)</p> <p>Reason:</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i></p> <p><i>Disc:</i></p> <p><i>Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</i></p> <p>Significance finding/method: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i></p> <p><i>Disc:</i></p> <p><i>Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</i></p>	

W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant

#	Ref.	Negative <u>including Justification</u>	TF Finding <u>and Reason</u>	Motion <u>and Reason</u> in Committee:	Final
SG1-2	DX-1 5.1.x	<p><i>Negative:</i> Italicize "SOC".</p> <p><i>Reason/Justification:</i> Conform to the mandated style.</p>	<p>(Select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive</p> <p>Reason:</p>	<p>__ Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: _____)</p> <p>Move to find this negative: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive (ballot fails)</p> <p>Reason:</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i></p> <p><i>Disc:</i></p> <p><i>Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</i></p> <p>Significance finding/method: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i></p> <p><i>Disc:</i></p> <p><i>Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</i></p>	

W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant

#	Ref.	Negative <u>including Justification</u>	TF Finding <u>and Reason</u>	Motion <u>and Reason</u> in Committee:	Final
SG1-3	DX-1 5.2.x	<p><i>Negative:</i> Qualify the use of the term “validated method”, such as by specifying that this definition is specific to IH.</p> <p><i>Reason/Justification:</i> The term “validated method” is applicable to many disciplines, but the definition is specific to IH. The SEMI Style Guide specifies a means of limiting the applicability of a definition within a document.</p>	<p>(Select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive</p> <p>Reason:</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: _____)</p> <p>Move to find this negative: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive (ballot fails)</p> <p>Reason:</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i></p> <p><i>Disc:</i></p> <p><i>Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</i></p> <p>Significance finding/method: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i></p> <p><i>Disc:</i></p> <p><i>Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</i></p>	

W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant

#	Ref.	Negative <u>including Justification</u>	TF Finding <u>and Reason</u>	Motion <u>and Reason</u> in Committee:	Final
SG1-4	DX-2.1 23.5	<p><i>Negative:</i> Change "All measurements should be made using a method..." to "All measurements should be made using methods..."</p> <p><i>Reason/Justification:</i> The proposed change would mandate using the same method (singular) for all measurements (plural).</p>	<p>(Select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive</p> <p>Reason:</p> <p><u>Ballot w/ edits:</u> All measurements should be taken made using recognized methods a method in accordance with § 23.5.1 with documented sensitivities and accuracy.</p>	<p>__ Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: _____)</p> <p>Move to find this negative: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive (ballot fails)</p> <p>Reason:</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i> <i>Disc:</i> Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p> <p>Significance finding/method: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i> <i>Disc:</i> Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p>	

W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant

#	Ref.	Negative <u>including Justification</u>	TF Finding <u>and Reason</u>	Motion <u>and Reason</u> in Committee:	Final
SG1-5	DX-2.3 NOTE after 23.5.3	<p><i>Negative:</i> Move "The appropriate OEL...(STELs)." to a numbered paragraph.</p> <p><i>Reason/Justification:</i> Selection of the appropriate OELs is sufficiently important to me a normative criterion, rather than a suggestion.</p>	<p>(Select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related)</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive</p> <p>Reason:</p> <p>Motion: Holbrook / Crane Y 5 N 0 SG1-5 based on not providing sufficient guidance on selection of OEL.</p>	<p>__ Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: _____)</p> <p>Move to find this negative: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason)</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> x Related & persuasive (ballot fails)</p> <p>Reason:</p> <p>By/2nd: Visty/Karl Disc: Vote: #-#-#. 9-0 Motion passed failed</p> <p>Significance finding/method: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion</p> <p>By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p>	

W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant

#	Ref.	Negative <u>including Justification</u>	TF Finding <u>and Reason</u>	Motion <u>and Reason in Committee:</u>	Final
SG1-6	DX-2.3 23.5.6 Exception	Negative: Change "utilize" to "use". Reason/Justification: Correct usage error.	<p>(Select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive</p> <p>Reason:</p>	<p>__ Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: _____)</p> <p>Move to find this negative: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive (ballot fails)</p> <p>Reason:</p> <p>By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p> <p>Significance finding/method: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion</p> <p>By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p>	

W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant

#	Ref.	Negative <u>including Justification</u>	TF Finding <u>and Reason</u>	Motion <u>and Reason</u> in Committee:	Final
SG1-7	DX-2.3 23.5.6 Exception	<p><i>Negative:</i> Delete "furnaces for anneal, ".</p> <p><i>Reason/Justification:</i> Most annealing is done in atmospheres of low reactivity. There are other processes, such as oxide deposition, for which combustion is routinely used. However, exhaust treatment is a sufficient example.</p>	<p>(Select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive</p> <p>Reason:</p>	<p>__Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: _____)</p> <p>Move to find this negative: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive (ballot fails)</p> <p>Reason:</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i></p> <p><i>Disc:</i></p> <p><i>Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</i></p> <p>Significance finding/method: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i></p> <p><i>Disc:</i></p> <p><i>Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</i></p>	

W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant

#	Ref.	Negative <u>including Justification</u>	TF Finding <u>and Reason</u>	Motion <u>and Reason</u> in Committee:	Final
SG1-8	DX-4 R16-6.3.3	<p><i>Negative:</i> Change "above their lower flammable limit" to "above 25% of their lower flammable limits".</p> <p><i>Reason/Justification:</i> a) State a numerical criterion consistent with the remainder of the document. b) Correct an error in number.</p>	<p>(Select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not related <input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related) <input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive</p> <p>Reason:</p> <p>Ballot text: Enclosures for pyrophoric or flammable gases should be designed to ensure adequately uniform dilution (i.e., prevent "pocketing") and to prevent accumulation of pyrophoric and flammable gases above their lower Explosive flammable limit. Uniform dilution can generally be verified through exhaust vapor visualization techniques. Ventilation flow rate should be adequate to maintain concentrations below 25% of the lower explosive flammable limit for the gas with the lowest LEL LFL that is used in the enclosure.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: _____)</p> <p>Move to find this negative: (select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow) <input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business <input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____ <input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason) <input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive (ballot fails)</p> <p>Reason:</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i> <i>Disc:</i> Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p> <p>Significance finding/method: (select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%) <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i> <i>Disc:</i> Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p>	
<p>Final disposition of this reject: <input type="checkbox"/> Valid (includes at least one significant negative) <input type="checkbox"/> Not Valid (all negatives withdrawn, found not related, or found not significant)</p>					

Table 3 Negatives from < ASML: Bert Planting >

<i>W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant</i>					
#	Ref.	Negative <i>including Justification</i>	TF Finding <i>and Reason</i>	Motion <i>and Reason in Committee:</i>	Final
ASM L-1	23.5.3	Reject 1 Please include DNEL values of ECHA as OEL source	(Select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not related <input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related) <input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive Reason:	<input type="checkbox"/> Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: __) Move to find this negative: (select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow) <input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business <input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____ <input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason) <input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive (ballot fails) Reason: <i>By/2nd:</i> <i>Disc:</i> <i>Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</i> Significance finding/method: (select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%) <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion <i>By/2nd:</i> <i>Disc:</i> <i>Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</i>	

W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant

#	Ref.	Negative <u>including Justification</u>	TF Finding <u>and Reason</u>	Motion <u>and Reason</u> in Committee:	Final
ASM L-2	23.5.1	Reject 2: Consider to include modelling programmes (Advanced REACH Tool) for exposure estimation of new processes. As these models give an over estimation, the exposure modelled should be < 25% of OEL	(Select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not related <input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related) <input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive Reason:	<input type="checkbox"/> Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: __) Move to find this negative: (select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow) <input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business <input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____ <input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason) <input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive (ballot fails) Reason: By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed Significance finding/method: (select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%) <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed	

Final disposition of this reject:

- Valid (includes at least one significant negative)
 Not Valid (all negatives withdrawn, found not related, or found not significant)

Table 4 Negatives from < AMAT: Ed Karl >

<i>W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant</i>					
#	Ref.	Negative <i>including Justification</i>	TF Finding <i>and Reason</i>	Motion <i>and Reason in Committee:</i>	Final
AMA T-1	23.5.3, NOTE XX	<p>Negative</p> <p>The sentence, "Selection of the lowest OEL published by a professional or governmental agency is the recommended approach in order to cover all installations and end-user locations." is problematic because it causes ambiguity to the normative portion of Section 23.5.3 which states "applicable", not "lowest".</p> <p><u>Proposed Solution:</u> Delete the sentence as it adds no value (only confusion) to the normative portion of Section 23.5.3.</p>	<p>(Select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive</p> <p>Reason:</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: __)</p> <p>Move to find this negative: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive (ballot fails)</p> <p>Reason:</p> <p>By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p> <p>Significance finding/method: (select 1)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion</p> <p>By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p>	

W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant

#	Ref.	Negative <u>including Justification</u>	TF Finding <u>and Reason</u>	Motion <u>and Reason</u> in Committee:	Final
AMA T-2	23.5.4	Negative "at the lowest practical level" is not an improvement to "minimized". How does 25% of the applicable OEL(s) equate to "at the lowest practical level"? Proposed Solution: Rephrase the paragraphs so that the words "minimized" and "at the lowest practical level" are removed, similar to the format used Section 23.5.6."	(Select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not related <input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related) <input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive Reason:	<input type="checkbox"/> Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: __) Move to find this negative: (select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow) <input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business <input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____ <input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason) <input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive (ballot fails) Reason: By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed Significance finding/method: (select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%) <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed	

W = Withdrawn, NR = Not Related, NP = Not Persuasive, RP = Related and Persuasive, NS = Not Significant, S = Significant

#	Ref.	Negative <u>including Justification</u>	TF Finding <u>and Reason</u>	Motion <u>and Reason</u> in Committee:	Final
AMA T-3	23.5.5	Negative "at the lowest practical level" is not an improvement to "minimized". How does 25% of the applicable OEL(s) equate to "at the lowest practical level"? Proposed Solution: Rephrase the paragraphs so that the words "minimized" and "at the lowest practical level" are removed, similar to the format used in Section 23.5.6.	(Select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not related <input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (assumes related) <input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive Reason:	<input type="checkbox"/> Withdrawn by Subm. (Date: __) Move to find this negative: (select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not related (requires reason, follow) <input type="checkbox"/> Committee new business <input type="checkbox"/> Assigned to: _____ <input type="checkbox"/> Not persuasive (requires reason) <input type="checkbox"/> Related & persuasive (ballot fails) Reason: By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed Significance finding/method: (select 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Not significant by motion <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by % of NP vote (>10%) <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by agreement <input type="checkbox"/> Significant by motion By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed	

Final disposition of this reject:

- Valid (includes at least one significant negative)
 Not Valid (all negatives withdrawn, found not related, or found not significant)

Comments

Summary: 3 Total Items Submitted

<i>Company: Submitter</i>	<i>ID</i>	<i>#</i>	<i>Company: Submitter</i>	<i>ID</i>	<i>#</i>
AMAT: Ed Karl	AMAT	2	ASML: Bert Planting	ASML	1

Details:

NOTICE: Items from “Reject” votes that are clearly marked by the voter as comments can be reviewed here.

<i>#</i>	<i>Ref.</i>	<i>Comment</i>	<i>TF Response</i>	<i>Committee Action:</i>
ASM L-1		is there a need to how to deal with SVHC substances.		<p>(Select one) <input type="checkbox"/> No further action <input type="checkbox"/> Refer to TF for further review <input type="checkbox"/> New Business <input type="checkbox"/> Editorial Change: #__ in ECs below <input type="checkbox"/> Other:</p> <p>(Select one) <input type="checkbox"/> Committee agrees (no motion nec.) <input type="checkbox"/> Motion to act as indicated above:</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i> <i>Disc:</i> <i>Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</i></p>
AMAT- 4	23.5.3. NOTE XX	<p>Comment “PEL” is used in the first bullet without definition.</p> <p>Proposed Solution: Replace “PEL” with “Permissible Exposure Limits” instead.</p>		<p>(Select one) <input type="checkbox"/> No further action <input type="checkbox"/> Refer to TF for further review <input type="checkbox"/> New Business <input type="checkbox"/> Editorial Change: #__ in ECs below <input type="checkbox"/> Other:</p> <p>(Select one) <input type="checkbox"/> Committee agrees (no motion nec.) <input type="checkbox"/> Motion to act as indicated above:</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i> <i>Disc:</i> <i>Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</i></p>
AMAT- 5	23.5.3. NOTE XX	<p>Comment Note XX references GESTIS International Limit Values, but Section 4.11 does not reflect this additional reference.</p>		<p>(Select one) <input type="checkbox"/> No further action <input type="checkbox"/> Refer to TF for further review <input type="checkbox"/> New Business <input type="checkbox"/> Editorial Change: #__ in ECs below <input type="checkbox"/> Other:</p> <p>(Select one) <input type="checkbox"/> Committee agrees (no motion nec.) <input type="checkbox"/> Motion to act as indicated above:</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i> <i>Disc:</i> <i>Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</i></p>

Summary of Editorial Changes

NOTICE: TF leaders have the option of addressing editorial changes prior to addressing negatives, if they believe that their editorial changes will render some or all of the submitted negatives non-persuasive.

NOTICE: It is only necessary to approve each editorial change separately if someone objects to one or more of the suggested changes.

#	Ref.	Before	After	Object? (Y/N)	Motion to Approve: (if necessary)
					By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed
					By/2nd: Disc: Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed

Move to approve **all** editorial changes as shown above:

By/2nd:

Disc:

Vote: #-#-#. **Motion passed failed**

Forwarding Motions

<i>Documents Passing Review</i>	<i>Documents Failing Review</i>
<p>Safety Check Move to find that this document: <input type="checkbox"/> Is NOT a safety document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is still technically sound and complete. <input type="checkbox"/> IS a safety document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is not technically sound and complete. <input type="checkbox"/> The Safety Checklist (Regulations 13.3) for this document is complete and has accompanied the document through the balloting process.</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i> <i>Disc:</i> Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p> <p>Intellectual Property Check The meeting chair asked those present in person or by electronic link, if they were aware of any patented or copyrighted material in the Standard or Guideline. (Note: Such material might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this ballot.) <input type="checkbox"/> No patented or copyrighted material is known to exist in the Standard or Guideline. (no motion needed) <input type="checkbox"/> Patented or copyrighted material is known to exist in the Standard or Guideline but release for such material has been obtained or presented to the committee. (no motion needed) <input type="checkbox"/> Patented or copyrighted material is known to exist in the Standard or Guideline but release for some of the material(s) has NOT been obtained or presented to the committee. The committee moves to: <input type="checkbox"/> Ask the ISC for special permission to publish the standard without release <input type="checkbox"/> Quit the activity <input type="checkbox"/> Wait for the release of the patented or copyrighted material.</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i> <i>Disc:</i> Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p> <p>Final Action Move to: <input type="checkbox"/> Pass this document as balloted and forward to the A&R for procedural review. <input type="checkbox"/> Pass this document with editorial changes and forward to the A&R for procedural review.</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i> <i>Disc:</i> Vote: #-#-#. Motion passed failed</p>	<p>Followup Activity Authorization Move to: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Return ballot to the originating task force for rework <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> and authorize a follow-up ballot <input type="checkbox"/> Transfer ballot to the (name) task force for rework <input type="checkbox"/> and authorize a follow-up ballot <input type="checkbox"/> Discontinue work on ballot.</p> <p><i>By/2nd:</i> Visty/Planting <i>Disc:</i> Vote: #-#-#. 9-0 Motion passed failed</p>