

Record of Line-item Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: **North America**

Global Technical Committee: **EHS**

TC Chapter Cochairs: **Bert Planting (ASML), Chris Evanston (Salus Engineering), Sean Larsen (Lam Research)**

Standards Staff: **Kevin Nguyen**

	Scheduled in Background Statement	Actual
Date	4/7/2016	4/7/2016
Location	SEMI HQ, San Jose, CA	SEMI HQ, San Jose, CA
Reason for Change of Date and/or Location (if changed)		

Note: See *Regulations* ¶ 9.5 Exception for allowable reason to change.

Document Information

I. Document Number, Title, Lists of Line Items

Document Number 5969	Document Title Line Item Revisions to SEMI S2-0715, Environmental, Health, and Safety Guideline for Semiconductor Manufacturing Equipment (Re: Fire Protection)	
List of Line	Line Item 1	Line Item Title Addition of criteria to determine which method of assessing fire risk is to be used.
	Line Item 2	Restructuring of portions of Section 14

Line Item 1 Adjudication

II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: **As-cast tally after close of voting period**

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.7.1.1)

Voting Tally:

Voting Interest:	Returned Vote		Distributio	=	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	55	÷	87	=	63.2%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	15					
Voting Interest Reject(s)	4		Total Voters with Rejects		4	
Voting Interest Accept(s)	36					

Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

III. Rejects

Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: Lam Research)

Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Brian Claes: Lam Research)

Negative 3

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.			
	Negative Text	<p>*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.</p> <p>NEGATIVE The second bullet (“the decision path...”) seems contradictory to the initial qualifying sentence in the clause. This clause deals with requirements applicable if one declines to conduct an S14 assessment yet the second bullet has language that speaks to the flowchart leading to use of S14 (“the decision path through the flowchart that lead to using SEMI S14, and...”)</p> <p>Suggestion / Justification Revise the test to read: “the decision path through the flowchart that leads to waiving use of SEMI S14” (or something to that effect)</p>			
TF input (optional)					
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.		GO TO “Related” subsection	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.		GO TO “Final” subsection → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	‘Related’ is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)		GO TO “Persuasive” subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		Reason	XXXX		
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
Discussion					

	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.					
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related.] < 2/3	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)			
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)				
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)				
		Reason	XXXX				
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Eric Sklar (Safety Guru)/Bert Planting (ASML)					
	Discussion						
		Result of Vote (check one)	10 Y-1 N; Motion passed				
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> N		GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection			
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)			
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)			
	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.				

Line Item 2 Adjudication

II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.1)

Voting Tally:

Voting Interest:	Returned Vote	÷	Distributio	=	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	55		87		63.2%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	15					
Voting Interest Reject(s)	1		Total Voters with Rejects		1	
Voting Interest Accept(s)	38					

Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

III. Rejects

Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: SCREEN)

Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Ryosuke Imamiya: SCREEN)

Negative 1

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. Line Item 2, Part A		
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. Please explain what is licensed. Add examples of the licenses.		
TF input (optional)				
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.	GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)	
	Reason	XXXX		
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			

	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.				
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related.] < 2/3		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]		GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)			
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)			
			Reason	Not an objection to the restructuring, so the use of "licensed" is not being changed.		
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Eric Sklar (Safety Guru)/Bert Planting (ASML)				
	Discussion	None				
	Result of Vote (check one)	9 Y-0 N; Motion passed				
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Y GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)			
<input type="checkbox"/>		90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection			
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)		
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)		
	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.			

Negative 2

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.			
	Negative Text	Line Item 2, Part B 14.5.1.12 *Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. The requirements should be in the front of the sentence, exemptions should not in the front. I recommend starting from the requirements. Shutdown or failure of a fire detection or suppression system should prevent additional processing			
TF input (optional)					
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.	GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)		
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		Reason	XXXX		
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Discussion				
	Result of Vote (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related.] < 2/3		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]		GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)		
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		Reason	Paragraph is proposed to be moved, not changed. Negative is request for an editorial change.		
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Eric Sklar (Safety Guru)/Ed Karl (Applied Materials)			
	Discussion	None			
	Result of Vote (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)		

			90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO “Not Significant Finding Option” subsection	
Final	(check if applicable)		(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
			(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		x	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)	
			(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
			(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS
			(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
	(check if applicable)		Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.		

Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 1

Check only when the Document has not been failed.

2	Original number (#) of Negatives	(g)	
#	Number of Negatives withdrawn	(h)	
#	Number of Negatives found not related	(i)	
#	Number of Negatives found not significant	(j)	
#	Number of Negatives addressed by technical change (Negative becomes not significant)	(k)	
Final		$g - (h + i + j + k) = 0$	Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
	x	$g - (h + i + j + k) > 0$	Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
		Reject without a Negative	Not Valid

Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)

IV. Other Technical Issues

None

V. Comments

None

VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

None

VII. Approval Conditions Check

VII. - (i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (*Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.2*)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (*Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.3*)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)					
Approval Rate	=	38	/	39	=	97.4%		≥90%	

VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

Note: See *Regulations § 9.7.2* for further information.

Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):

Line Item 2 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.

Need a Ratification Ballot:

Line Item 2 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

Checks for Entire Document Including All Approved Line Items

VIII. Safety Check

Note: This Safety check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items. See § 15 of the *Regulations* for further information.

Motion		This is not a Safety Document, when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is still technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.7.1)
	x	This is a Safety Document, when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is not technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.7.2)
	x	Safety Checklist (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 15.3) is complete and has been included with the Document throughout the balloting process. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 15.1.2)
Motion by/2 nd by		Eric Sklar (Safety Guru)/Bert Planting (ASML)
Discussion		None
Vote		8 Y-0 N; Motion passed

IX. Intellectual Property (IP) Check

Note: This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items. See § 16 of the *Regulations* for further information.

x	The TC Chapter meeting chair asked those participating, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.8.1)	
Motion	x	No potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known. GO TO SECTION X.
		Potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known, but a Letter of Assurance (LOA) or copyright release letter for such items has been obtained or presented to the TC Chapter. GO TO SECTION X.
		Potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known and use of such materials is technically justified by the TC Chapter, but an LOA or copyright release letter for some of the item(s) has NOT been obtained or presented to the TC Chapter.
		Ask ISC for special permission to publish.
		Quit activity.
		Wait for LOA for patented technology or release of copyrighted items.
	Motion by/2 nd by	
Discussion		XXXX
Vote		XX Y-XX N
Final Action		Motion passed
		Motion failed

* Note: Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this Letter Ballot.

X. Action for This Document

Motion (Check all applicable items)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [2] passed TC Chapter review as balloted and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [x] passed TC Chapter review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] passed TC Chapter review with technical changes and with or without editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review. A Ratification Ballot will be issued to verify the technical changes.
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [1] failed TC Chapter review and will be returned to the TF for rework.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] failed TC Chapter review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/ 2nd by	Eric Sklar (Safety Guru)/Bert Planting (ASML)	
Discussion	None	
Vote	8 Y - 0 N	
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed

Standards staff to record the result of the A&R procedural review here:

A&R		Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are Approved for publication
		Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are Approved pending acceptance of the Ratification Ballot
		Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are Not approved
		Reason: