

Record of Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: **North America**
 Global Technical Committee: **Silicon Wafer**
 TC Chapter Cochairs: **Noel Poduje/SMS, Dinesh Gupta/STA**
 Standards Staff: **Kevin Nguyen**

	Scheduled in Background Statement	Actual
Date	07/12/2016	07/12/2016
Location	San Francisco Marriott Marquis	San Francisco Marriott Marquis
Reason for Change of Date and/or Location (if changed)		

Note: See *Regulations* ¶ 9.5 Exception for allowable reason to change.

Document Information

I. Document Number and Title

Document Number 5737A	Document Title Revision of SEMI MF1391-1107, Test Method for Substitutional Atomic Carbon Content of Silicon by Infrared Absorption
---------------------------------	---

II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.7.1.1)

Voting Tally

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes	Distribution	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	58	÷ 93	= 62.4%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	20			
Voting Interest Reject(s)	2	Total Voters with Rejects		2
Voting Interest Accept(s)	26			

Note: See *Regulations* § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

III. Rejects

Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: TEL)

Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Supika Mashiro (TEL))

Negative 1

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.			
		2.1			
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. Negative/ The second sentence of 2.1 should be moved to the Limitation section.			
TF input (optional)					
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.		GO TO "Related" subsection	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.		GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		Reason	XXXX		
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Discussion				
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.			
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related.] < 2/3		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]		GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)		
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		Reason	These are scope sections of the document		
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Dinesh Gupta (STA)/Kurt Haller (KLA-Tencor)			
	Discussion	None			
	Result of Vote (check one)	7 Y-0 N; Motion passed			
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Y GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection

			[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		N	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
		x	2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)			
			90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection			
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommendations						
	Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.						
	Technical Changes	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX				
			TO: Section/Paragraph xxx				
			Justification (if necessary)				
		2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX				
			TO: Section/Paragraph xxx				
			Justification (if necessary)				
	Motion		Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).				
	Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)				
	Discussion						
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.				
				2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).]	GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection		
			[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)			
Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion		To incorporate the technical change(s).				
	Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)				
	Discussion						
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.				
				90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (F)		
	[Disagree to incorporate.] > 10%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)					
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)						
	Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one)		It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant".			GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)	
			It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "significant".			GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)	

		Whether or not the Negative is “not significant” is decided by a vote.			
	Motion	The Negative is “not significant”.			
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (D)	
<input type="checkbox"/>		XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO “Final” subsection → (C)		
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.		

This table is needed for each Negative.

Negative 2

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. 2.5			
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. Negative/ The second sentence of 2.5 should be moved to the Limitation section 9.			
	TF input (optional)				
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.		GO TO “Related” subsection	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.		GO TO “Final” subsection → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	‘Related’ is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)		GO TO “Persuasive” subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Discussion				
	Result of Vote (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.		
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is not related.] < 2/3		GO TO “Persuasive” subsection	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]		GO TO “Final” subsection → (B)	
	Motion and Reason	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)			

Persuasive	(check one)		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)			
	Reason		These are scope sections of the document				
	Motion by/ 2nd by		Dinesh Gupta (STA)/Kurt Haller (KLA-Tencor)				
	Discussion		None				
	Result of Vote (check one)		7 Y-0 N; Motion passed				
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection			
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommendations						
	Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.						
	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX					
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx					
		Justification (if necessary)					
	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX					
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx					
		Justification (if necessary)					
	Motion		Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).				
	Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)				
Discussion							
Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.					
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).]	GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection			
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)			
Incorporation of	Motion		To incorporate the technical change(s).				
	Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)				
	Discussion						

		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.	
	Result of Vote (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.]
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Disagree to incorporate.] > 10%
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)		
	Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant".
		<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "significant".
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote.
	Motion	The Negative is "not significant".	
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A) Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B) Not related (counted under i in disposition)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C) Related and not persuasive (significant)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D) Not significant (counted under j in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(E) Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(F) Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.	

Negative 3


Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.	
		2.6	
Negative	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.	
		Negative/ This paragraph does not describe the scope but specify a condition for the apparatus	
TF input (optional)			
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)
		Reason	XXXX

	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Discussion				
	Result of Vote (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related.] < 2/3	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)		
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		Reason	These are scope sections of the document		
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Dinesh Gupta (STA)/Kurt Haller (KLA-Tencor)			
	Discussion	None			
	Result of Vote (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input type="checkbox"/>	N GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)		
<input type="checkbox"/>		90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection		
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommendations				
	Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.				
	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX			
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx			
		Justification (if necessary)			
	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX			
TO: Section/Paragraph xxx					
Justification (if necessary)					
Motion	Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).				
Motion by/2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)				

Discussion				
Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.		
		<input type="checkbox"/> 2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).]	GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion	To incorporate the technical change(s).		
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.	
<input type="checkbox"/> 90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.]			GO TO "Final" subsection → (F)	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Disagree to incorporate.] > 10%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)			
	Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one)		<input type="checkbox"/> It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant".	GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)
			<input type="checkbox"/> It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "significant".	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)
			<input type="checkbox"/> Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote.	
	Motion	The Negative is "not significant".		
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Vote		<input type="checkbox"/> XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)
<input type="checkbox"/> XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority			GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)	
Final	(check if applicable)		<input type="checkbox"/> (A) Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
			<input type="checkbox"/> (B) Not related (counted under i in disposition)	
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> (C) Related and not persuasive (significant)	
			<input type="checkbox"/> (D) Not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
			<input type="checkbox"/> (E) Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS
			<input type="checkbox"/> (F) Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
	(check if applicable)	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.		

**Voting Interest Reject 2 (Voting Interest Name: PWC)
Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Peter Wagner (Self))**

Negative 1

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	 5737A comment from Peter.pdf *TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. 1.1			
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. § 1.1, second sentence: A reference for the statement in this sentence has to be given.			
TF input (optional)					
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.		GO TO "Related" subsection	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.		GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		Reason	XXXX		
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Discussion				
Result of Vote (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.			
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related.] < 2/3		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]		GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		Reason			
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Dinesh Gupta (STA)/Peter Wagner (Self)			
	Discussion	None			
Result of Vote (check one)	7 Y-0 N; Motion passed				
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Y GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	N GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)

		<input type="checkbox"/> $2/3 \leq$ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] $< 90\%$	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)	
		<input type="checkbox"/> $90\% \leq$ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection	
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommendations			
	Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.			
	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX		
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx		
		Justification (if necessary)		
	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX		
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx		
		Justification (if necessary)		
	Motion	Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).		
	Motion by/2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	$2/3 \leq$ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).]	GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] $< 2/3$	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)
	Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion	To incorporate the technical change(s).	
Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
Discussion				
Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	$90\% \leq$ [Agree to incorporate.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (F)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Disagree to incorporate.] $> 10\%$	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)			
	Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant".	GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "significant".	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote.	
Motion	The Negative is "not significant".			

	Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)
<input type="checkbox"/>		XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)	
Final	(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A) Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(B) Not related (counted under i in disposition)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(C) Related and not persuasive (significant)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(D) Not significant (counted under j in disposition)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(E) Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change DOCUMENT FAILS
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(F) Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)	
(check if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.	

IV. Other Technical Issues

None

V. Comments

V- (i) Voters' Comments

None

V-(ii) Comments Created by Handling Negative

None

VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

None

VII. Approval Conditions Check

VII. - (i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.2)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.3)

X. Action for This Document

Motion (Check all applicable items)	<input type="checkbox"/>	The Document passed TC Chapter review as balloted and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	The Document passed TC Chapter review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	The Document passed TC Chapter review with technical changes and with or without editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review. A Ratification Ballot will be issued to verify the technical changes.
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The Document failed TC Chapter review and will be returned to the TF for rework.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	The Document failed TC Chapter review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/ 2nd by	Kurt Haller (KLA-Tencor) / Peter Wagner (Self)	
Discussion	None	
Vote	7 Y-0 N	
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed

Standards staff to record the result of the A&R procedural review here:

A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	The Document is Approved for publication
	<input type="checkbox"/>	The Document is Approved pending acceptance of the Ratification Ballot
	<input type="checkbox"/>	The Document is Not approved
	Reason:	