## Record of Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: North America

**Global Technical Committee: Silicon Wafer** 

TC Chapter Cochairs: Noel Poduje/SMS, Dinesh Gupta/STA

Standards Staff: Kevin Nguyen

	Scheduled in Background Statement	Actual
Date	07/12/2016	07/12/2016
Location	San Francisco Marriott Marquis	San Francisco Marriott Marquis
Reason for Change of Date and/or Location (if changed)		

Note: See *Regulations* ¶ 9.5 Exception for allowable reason to change.

## **Document Information**

# I. Document Number and Title

Document	Document Title
Number	Revision of SEMI MF1391-1107, Test Method for
5737A	Substitutional Atomic Carbon Content of Silicon by
	Infrared Absorption

# II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.7.1.1)

#### **Voting Tally**

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes		Distribution		Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	58	÷	93	=	62.4%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	20	]_				
Voting Interest Reject(s)	2	1	Total	Vote	rs with Rejects	2
Voting Interest Accept(s)	26					

Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

# III. Rejects

Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: TEL)
Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Supika Mashiro (TEL))

Negative 1
------------

	Referenced Section/	*TF/	TC Chapter to fill in, in	ıcludi	ng text in the ballot	if nec	essary.				
Nec	Paragraph	2.1									
Negative	Negative Text	cop Neg	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.  Negative/ The second sentence of 2.1 should be moved to the Limitation section.								
TF	input (optional)										
	Withdrawal	x	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.		GO TO "Related" subsection						
	(check one)		Withdrawal document i MM/DD/YYYY.	GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)							
	Mation and		'Related' is mutually ag	reed (	upon. <mark>(Needs no mot</mark>	tion.)	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection				
	Motion and Reason		Negative is not related	(Nee	ds ≥2/3 votes to pas	s.)					
	(check one)		Reason	XXXX	<						
Rel	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)									
Related	Discussion										
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX '	<b>Y</b> -XX <b>N</b> ; Motion passed	/failed							
			[Negative is not related	.] < 2/	3		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection				
			2/3 ≤ [Negative is not re	elated	.]		GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)				
			Negative is related and	persu	uasive. (Needs >1/3 v	otes t	to pass.)				
	Motion and Reason (check one)	х	Negative is related and	not p	ersuasive. (Needs ≥2	2/3 vot	tes to pass.)				
Persu	(careers care)		Reason	Thes	e are scope sections	of the	document				
suasive	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Dine	esh Gupta (STA)/Kurt H	aller (I	KLA-Tencor)						
Ve	Discussion	Non	е								
		7 Y-	0 <b>N</b> ; Motion passed								
	Result of Vote (check one)		[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	d 	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection				

							e is related and not ve.] < 2/3			N GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)				
				X			egative is related persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" s	ubse	ction → (C)				
					90%	6 ≤ [Negative is related pot persuagive 1]  GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection								
	Tech	nic	al Chanc	ie Re		d not persuasive.]								
		nal						one full sentence	are r	equired in "FROM" and "TO"				
			FROM:	Sect	ion/P	ara	graph XXX							
	_	1	TO: Sec	ction	n/Paragraph xxx									
	echni		Justific	atio	n (If n	(If necessary)								
Ad	Technical Changes		FROM:	Sect	ion/P	ara	aragraph XXX							
dress	nges	2	TO: Sec	ction	/Para	ragraph xxx								
Address by Technical Change Option			Justification (If necessary)											
nnica	Motic	n			1	Neg	ative is addressed by	the technical cha	ınge(s	).				
다 다	Motion by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by					Nam	e (Company)/Name	(Company)						
ange	Discu	ıss	ion											
စ္စ					)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.								
tion	Result of Vote (check one)						2/3 ≤ [Negative is ad change(s).]	ddressed by the te	chnic	GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection				
			•				[Negative is not add change(s).] < 2/3	ressed by the tech	nnical	GO TO "Final" subsection  → (E)				
	_	Mo	otion		-	To incorporate the technical change(s).								
	nco Tec	Mo	tion by/	2 <sup>nd</sup> k	y I	Name (Company)/Name (Company)								
	rpora hnica	Dis	scussion	)										
	itior				)	XX Y	/-XX <b>N</b> ; Motion pass	ed/failed.						
	ncorporation of the Technical Change		Result o				90% ≤ [Agree to inco	orporate.]		GO TO "Final" subsection  → (F)				
			(check				[Disagree to incorpo	-		GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)				
Not S							"if the TC Chapter ons voting on the ac			ersuasive by a vote equal to or 9.6.4.4.2)				
Not Significant Finding Option			f "Not		It is r signi		ually agreed upon to ant".	term the Negative	"not	GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)				
icant otion	significant finding option" (check one)				It is r "sign		ually agreed upon to nt".	term the Negative		GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)				

			Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote.								
	Motion	The	The Negative is "not significant".								
	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Nan	Name (Company)/Name (Company)								
	Voto		XX Y-XX N; Mo	otion passed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)						
	Vote		XX Y-XX N; Mo	tion failed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)						
			(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in dis	disposition)						
			(B)	Not related (counted under i in disp	position)						
	(check if	X	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significa	iicant)						
Final	applicable)			Not significant (counted under j in disposition)							
a			(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS						
			(F)	Addressed by technical change (cou	ınted under k disposition)						
	(check if applicable)		Comment gene	erated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # >	(.						

This table is needed for each Negative.

## **Negative 2**

		*TF	TC Chanter to fill in in	ncluding text in the ballot if neo	egesary				
	Referenced								
Nec	Section/ Paragraph	2.5							
Negative	No motive Tout	*Ori cop		ve text (e.g., issue, justification	, suggestion) should be				
	Negative Text		ative/ second sentence of 2.	.5 should be moved to the Limi	tation section 9.				
TF	input (optional)								
	Withdrawal (check one)		No Negative withdrawa	l made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection				
			Withdrawal document r MM/DD/YYYY.	GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)					
	Motion and Reason (check one)		'Related' is mutually ag	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection					
			Negative is not related.						
			Reason	xxxx					
Rel	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Nan	ne (Company)/Name (Co						
Related	Discussion								
		XX '	Y-XX <b>N</b> ; Motion passed/	/failed.					
	Result of Vote (check one)		[Negative is not related	.] < 2/3	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection				
	(3110011 0110)		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not re	2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]					
	Motion and Reason		Negative is related and	persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes	to pass.)				

_											
	(cl	neck	one)	x Neg	gative	e is related and	d not p	ersuasive. (Needs	≥2/3	votes to pass.)	
				Rea	These are scope sections of the document						
	M	otio 2 <sup>nd</sup>	n by/ by	Dinesh (	Gupta (STA)/Kurt Haller (KLA-Tencor)						
٦	Di	scu	ssion	None							
ers				7 Y-0 N;	Motion passed						
Persuasive			of Vote	per	egative is related and rsuasive.] > 1/3			Is a technical change recommended? (check one)		Y GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection  N GO TO "Final" subsection	
	(CI	1eci	( one)			ve.] < 2/3	u not	(encont enc)		→ (E)	
				x 2/3 and	≤ [Ne l not	≤ [Negative is related I not persuasive.] < 90%		GO TO "Final" s	l" subsection → (C)		
						≤ [Negative is related not persuasive.]  GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" s				ant Finding Option" subsection	
	Tech	nica	al Chanc			ndations					
	Origi field:		section/	paragra	ph n	umber and at	least	one full sentence	are i	required in "FROM" and "TO"	
			FROM:	Section/	Para	graph XXX					
			TO: 80	ction/Pa	ragra	nh vvv					
	1 Techn	1	10. 360	Clion/Fa	aragraph xxx						
Ą			Justific	ation (If	nece	essary)					
Address by Technic	Technical Changes		FROM:	Section/	n/Paragraph XXX						
оу Тес	nges	2	TO: Sec	ction/Pa	ragra	ragraph xxx					
			Justific	ation (If	nece	essary)					
Chan	Moti	on			Neg	ative is addres	sed b	y the technical cha	inge(s	s).	
ge	Moti	on b	y/2 <sup>nd</sup> by	,	Name (Company)/Name (Company)						
al Change Option	Disc	ussi	on								
<sup>n</sup>					XX '	Y-XX N; Motion	n pass	sed/failed.			
		_	sult of V			change(s).]		ddressed by the te		subsection	
						[Negative is n change(s).] <		lressed by the tech	nical	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
	_	Мо	tion		To i			nical change(s).		· (-)	
	tio	Mo	tion by/	2 <sup>nd</sup> bv	<del>                                     </del>	ne (Company)/		<b>3</b> ( )			
	Incorpora tion of		cussion			( ) //		V 1 37			
	l 80										

			XX Y-XX N	I; Motion passed/failed.							
	Result o		90% ≤	[Agree to incorporate.]	GO TO "Final" subsection  → (F)						
	(check	one)	[Disag	ree to incorporate.]>10%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)						
Z	This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". ( <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)										
ot Siç	Use of "Not		s mutually aç nificant".	greed upon to term the Negative "not	GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)						
Not Significant Finding	significant finding option" (check one)		s mutually aç gnificant".	greed upon to term the Negative	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)						
t Fi		Wh	Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote.								
indir	Motion	The Ne	gative is "no	t significant".							
ng Op	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Name (	Company)/N	lame (Company)							
Option	Vote	XX	Y-XX N; Mo	otion passed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)						
	Vote	XX	Y-XX N; Mo	otion failed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)						
			(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disp	oosition)						
			(B)	Not related (counted under i in disp	osition)						
	(check if	Х	(C)	Related and not persuasive (significa	nt)						
Final	applicable)		(D)	Not significant (counted under j in d	isposition)						
<u>a</u>			(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS						
			(F)	Addressed by technical change (cou	nted under k disposition)						
	(check if applicable)	Co	Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.								

Negative 3

1109	ative 5										
	Referenced Section/	*TF/	/TC Chapter to fill in, ir	ncluding text in the ballot if ned	essary.						
Neg	Paragraph	2.6									
Negative	Negative Text		iginal complete Negati <sup>,</sup> ied.	ve text (e.g., issue, justification	, suggestion) should be						
	Negative Text	_	egative/ his paragraph does not describe the scope but specify a condition for the apparatus								
TFi	input (optional)										
	Withdrawal		No Negative withdrawa	GO TO "Related" subsection							
ı	(check one)		Withdrawal document r MM/DD/YYYY.	GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)							
R	<b>⊘</b> Motion and		'Related' is mutually ag	reed upon. (Needs no motion.)	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection						
Related	Reason		Negative is not related.	(Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)							
ed	(check one)		Reason	xxxx							

		otion b 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	y/	Nam	ne (Company)/Name	(Compa	ny)			
	Di	scussi	on							
				XX Y	Y-XX N; Motion pass	ed/failed				
		ult of V			[Negative is not relat	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection				
	(6:	100K 01	,		2/3 ≤ [Negative is no	ot related	.]		GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)	
					Negative is related a	and persi	uasive. (Needs >1/	/3 votes	to pass.)	
	Motion and Reason (check one)		1	X	Negative is related a	and not p	tes to pass.)			
	(0.		,		Reason	son These are scope sections of the		ns of the	document	
ק		otion b 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	y/	Dine	esh Gupta (STA)/Kurt	t Haller (I	KLA-Tencor)			
Persuasive	Di	scussi	on	Non	е					
uas				7 Y-	0 <b>N</b> ; Motion passed					
ive	pε				[Negative is related a persuasive.] > 1/3	gative is related and suasive.] > 1/3		Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection	
		Result of Vote (check one)			[Negative is related a persuasive.] < 2/3	and not	(check one)	N	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)	
				X	2/3 ≤ [Negative is rel and not persuasive.]		ubsectio	on <b>→</b> (C)		
					90% ≤ [Negative is read not persuasive.]		GO TO "Not Sig	nificant l	Finding Option" subsection	
Add		inal sec			ecommendations		one full sentence	are requ	uired in "FROM" and "TO"	
		FR	OM:	Sect	ion/Paragraph XXX					
ss by		1 TC	): Sec	ction/Paragraph xxx						
Techn	echni				n (If necessary)					
ical Ch	Technical Changes	FR	OM: S	Sect	ion/Paragraph XXX					
ress by Technical Change Option	nges	2	): Se	ction	on/Paragraph xxx					
ption		Ju	stific	atio	n (If necessary)					
	Motic	on			Negative is addr	ressed by	y the technical cha	inge(s).		
	Motion by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by				Name (Company)/Name (Company)					

	Discu	ussion								
				X	XX <b>Y</b> -XX <b>N</b> ; Motion passed/failed.					
		Result of V			2/3 ≤ [N change	legative is addressed by the technical (s).]	GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection			
						ve is not addressed by the technical (s).] < 2/3	GO TO "Final" subsection  → (E)			
		Motion			To incorporate the technical change(s).					
	Inc.	Motion by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by			Name (Com	pany)/Name (Company)				
	orpoi	Discussion		-						
	ratio cal C				XX Y-XX N;	Motion passed/failed.				
	Incorporation of the Technical Change	Result o				Agree to incorporate.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (F)			
		(check			[Disagre	ee to incorporate.]>10%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)			
Not	greater than 90% of the p				only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)  s mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not GO TO "Final" subsection					
Sig		e of "Not	!	signif	icant".		→ (D)			
Not Significant Finding Option	findi	gnificant ng option" leck one)	ı		nutually agr ificant".	eed upon to term the Negative	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)			
Ŧ	( -	,		Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote.						
ndi	ı	Motion	The	Nega	gative is "not significant".					
ng Op		otion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Nam	e (Co	mpany)/Na	me (Company)				
tion	Vote			XX Y	-XX N; Moti	on passed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)			
				XX Y	-XX N; Moti	ion failed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)			
Final					(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disp	oosition)			
					(B)	Not related (counted under i in disp	related (counted under i in disposition)			
	(0	check if	X		(C)	Related and not persuasive (significa	ant)			
		plicable)			(D)	Not significant (counted under j in d	isposition)			
					(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS			
		ala a ala M			(F)	Addressed by technical change (cou	nted under k disposition)			
		(check if applicable)			mment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.					

# Voting Interest Reject 2 (Voting Interest Name: PWC) Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Peter Wagner (Self)) Negative 1

<u> </u>	alive i	_							
Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.  1.1							
ive	Negative Text	сор	ied. 1, second sentence: A	t in this sentence has to be					
TF	input (optional)								
	Withdrawal (check one)		No Negative withdrawa	GO TO "Related" subsection					
			Withdrawal document re						
	Mation and		'Related' is mutually ag	reed ι	upon. (Needs no r	notio	On.) GO TO "Persuasive" subsection		
	Motion and Reason		Negative is not related.	(Nee	ds ≥2/3 votes to p	oass.)	)		
	(check one)		Reason						
Re	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)							
Related	Discussion								
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX <b>Y</b> -XX <b>N</b> ; Motion passed/failed.							
			[Negative is not related	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection					
			2/3 ≤ [Negative is not re	GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)					
		x Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)							
	Motion and Reason (check one)	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)							
_	(onesit ener		Reason						
Persuasive	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Dine	esh Gupta (STA)/Peter V						
Vise	Discussion	None							
P		7 Y	-0 <b>N</b> ; Motion passed						
	Result of Vote (check one)	X	x [Negative is related an persuasive.] > 1/3		Is a technical change recommended?		Y GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection		
			[Negative is related and persuasive.] < 2/3	l not	(check one)	Х	N GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)		

	and					egative is related persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)				
						Negative is related persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection				
	Tech	nic	al Chang	je Reco	commendations							
	Origi field:		al section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO"									
		1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX									
			TO: Sec	TO: Section/Paragraph xxx								
	Гесһп		Justific	ation (I	f nec	essary)						
Ad	Technical Changes	2	FROM:	M: Section/Paragraph XXX								
dress	nges		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx									
Address by Technical Change Option			Justification (If necessary)									
hnica	Moti	on			Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).							
al CI	Moti	on k	oy/2 <sup>nd</sup> by	,	Name (Company)/Name (Company)							
nang	Disc	uss	ion									
၂ ဝ					XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.							
otion			sult of V			2/3 ≤ [Negative is a change(s).]	ddressed by the technical	GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection				
						[Negative is not add change(s).] < 2/3	GO TO "Final" subsection  → (E)					
	  -		otion		To incorporate the technical change(s).							
	Incor Tech		otion by/		Nan	ne (Company)/Name	(Company)					
	pora	Dis	scussion	ssion								
	poration of the hnical Change				XX	Y-XX <b>N</b> ; Motion pass	ed/failed.					
			Result of Vo			90% ≤ [Agree to inc	orporate.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (F)				
	Φ	L	•			[Disagree to incorpo	-	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)				
Not S						only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or persons voting on the action". ( <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 9.6.4.4.2)						
ignifi Op	Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one)				s mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not cynificant". GO TO "Final" subcyclificant". → (D)							
Not Significant Finding Option				"si	is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative ignificant". GO TO "Final" subsectio → (C)							
ndin				Wł	Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote.							
g	Motion The Ne				gative is "not significant".							

	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Nar	lame (Company)/Name (Company)					
	Vote		XX Y-XX N; Mo	otion passed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (D)			
	vote		XX Y-XX N; Mo	otion failed with simple majority	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)			
	(check if applicable)		(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in d	isposition)			
			(B) Not related (counted under i in disposition)					
			(C)	Related and not persuasive (signif	e (significant)			
Final			(D)	Not significant (counted under j in	n disposition)			
<u>a</u>		x (1		Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS			
			(F)	Addressed by technical change (c	ounted under k disposition)			
	(check if applicable)		Comment gene	erated. See Section V-(ii) Comment #	X.			

# IV. Other Technical Issues

None

#### V. Comments

# V- (i) Voters' Comments

None

# V-(ii) Comments Created by Handling Negative

None

# VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

None

# VII. Approval Conditions Check

## VII. - (i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.7.1.2)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.7.1.3)

# X. Action for This Document

a			The Document passed TC Chapter review as balloted and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC f procedural review.						
M (Ch			The Document passed TC Chapter review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISO A&R SC for procedural review.						
Motion (Check all applicable items)		chang	The Document passed TC Chapter review with technical changes and with or without editorial hanges and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review. A Ratification Ballot will be issued to verify the technical changes.						
is)	X	The I	e Document failed TC Chapter review and will be returned to the TF for rework.						
		The I	e Document failed TC Chapter review and work will be discontinued.						
Motion by	y/ 2nd by		Kurt Haller (KLA-Tencor)/ Peter Wagner (Self)						
Discu	ıssion		None						
Vo	ote		7 Y-0 N						
Einal A	al Action		x Motion passed						
rinai A			Motion failed						

### Standards staff to record the result of the A&R procedural review here:

		The Document is Approved for publication
A&R		The Document is Approved pending acceptance of the Ratification Ballot
AON		The Document is Not approved
	Re	eason: