

## Record of Line-item Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: **North America**

Global Technical Committee: **EHS**

TC Chapter Cochairs: **Bert Planting (ASML), Chris Evanston (Salus Engineering), Sean Larsen (Lam Research)**

Standards Staff: **Kevin Nguyen**

	Scheduled in Background Statement	Actual
Date	4/7/2016	4/7/2016 and 7/14/2016
Location	SEMI HQ, San Jose, CA	SEMI HQ, San Jose, CA and San Francisco Marriott, CA
Reason for Change of Date and/or Location (if changed)		

Note: See Regulations ¶ 9.5 Exception for allowable reason to change.

### Document Information

#### I. Document Number, Title, Lists of Line Items

<b>Document Number</b> 5970		<b>Document Title</b> Line Item Revisions to SEMI S14, Safety Guidelines for Fire Risk Assessment and Mitigation for Semiconductor Manufacturing Equipment
<b>Lists of</b>	Line Item 1	<b>Line Item Title</b> Changes to Terminology to Align with SEMI S10.

## Line Item 1 Adjudication

### II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

**Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period**

**Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.1)**

**Voting Tally:**

Voting Interest:	Returned Vote		Distributio		Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	55	÷	87	=	63.2%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	15					
Voting Interest Reject(s)	0		Total Voters with Rejects			0
Voting Interest Accept(s)	44					

**Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.**

### III. Rejects

None

### IV. Other Technical Issues

None

## V. Comments

### V- (i) Voters' Comments

#### Commenter 1 (Larry Hartsough (UA Associates))- Comment 1

<p>Abstain with comment</p> <p>The Title of SEMI S14 needs to be corrected. See latest (Feb 2016) version of the Procedure Manual, Appendix 4, Table A4 1 20. S14 was not listed in prior version. Otherwise, this ballot would have failed.</p> <p><b>TF Response:</b></p> <p>The entry to which the submitter refers asserts that "Guidelines" must be changed to "Guideline" because the former is "Not a Subtype" and refers to Regulations ¶ 4.2.5. That paragraph defines "Safety Guideline" as "A Type of Document that is advisory in nature and meets all of the requirements for approval for a Standard (see §§9, 10, 11, and 16) as well as the additional requirements of §15.". It therefore appears that "Not a Subtype" is not a valid "Reason Nonconforming", as Safety Guideline is a Type, and only Standards have Subtypes. Furthermore, ¶A4-1.3 of the Procedure Manual, which prescribes the "correction" of titles, explicitly permits title changes to "provide grammatical correctness" to be part of the LI "correcting" a title. Therefore, if the EHS Committee agrees that there is more than one "guideline" in S14, the EHS Committee could issue a Letter Ballot Line Item to change the title to "Safety Guidelines..." on the grounds that it is grammatically incorrect to have a singular name for a plural entity. However, that is the present title, so it would be a ballot to change nothing.</p> <p>If, however, the EHS Comm believes there is only one "guideline" in S14, then it should issue a Line Item, in the next S14 Letter Ballot, to change the title to "Safety Guideline...".</p> <p>Alternatively, the EHS Comm can, as part of this ballot review, make an editorial change to the title from "Guidelines" to "Guideline".</p>		
<p><b>The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.</b></p>		
<p><b>*No motion is required in this step.</b></p>		
Action	<input type="checkbox"/>	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #
	<input type="checkbox"/>	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Refer to the TF for more consideration.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	New Business
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Editorial Change
	<p><b>Options for editorial change (check one)</b></p>	
Editorial Changes	1	<p><b>Case 1: No vote in this section:</b></p> <p><b>To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V.</b></p>
		<p><b>Case 2: Voted in this section:</b></p> <p><b>Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.</b></p>
		<p><b>FROM: Remove "s" from Guidelines in the Title of S14</b></p> <p>SEMI S14, Safety Guidelines for Fire Risk Assessment and Mitigation for Semiconductor Manufacturing Equipment</p>
		<p><b>TO:</b></p> <p>SEMI S14, Safety Guidelines for Fire Risk Assessment and Mitigation for Semiconductor Manufacturing Equipment</p>

		<b>Justification (If necessary)</b>
<b>Motion</b>	To approve above editorial change	
<b>Motion by/2<sup>nd</sup> by</b>	Eric Sklar (Safety Guru)/Ed Karl (Applied Materials)	
<b>Discussion</b>	Supika Mashiro: Making change to the title is not considered editorial. Sean Larsen: Proposed change is requested by Procedure Manual for title conformance. There is no technical change.	
<b>Vote</b>	11 Y-1 N; Motion passed	

### Readjudicated at SEMICON West meeting of 2016

Action	Abstain with comment The Title of SEMI S14 needs to be corrected. See latest (Feb 2016) version of the Procedure Manual, Appendix 4, Table A4 1 20. S14 was not listed in prior version. Otherwise, this ballot would have failed.  TF response: The title will be corrected via line item ballot in the future.	
	<b>The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.</b>	
	<b>*No motion is required in this step.</b>	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #
	<input type="checkbox"/>	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Refer to the TF for more consideration.
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	New Business
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Editorial Change
	Options for editorial change (check one)	<b>Case 1: No vote in this section:</b>
		To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V.

### V-(ii) Comments Created by Handling Negative None

## VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

See section V-(i) above.

## VII. Approval Conditions Check

### VII. - (i). Approval Rate

**APPROVAL CONDITION 1:** All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (*Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.2*)

**APPROVAL CONDITION 2:** At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (*Regulations ¶ 9.7.1.3*)

**Note:** If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)			
Approval Rate	=	44	/	44	=	100.0%	≥90%

## VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

**Note:** See *Regulations § 9.7.2* for further information.

☒

**Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):**

Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.

☐

**Need a Ratification Ballot:**

Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

---

## Checks for Entire Document Including All Approved Line Items

### VIII. Safety Check

**Note:** This Safety check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items. See § 15 of the *Regulations* for further information.

Motion		This is not a <b>Safety Document</b> , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is still technically sound and complete. ( <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.7.1)
	x	This is a <b>Safety Document</b> , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is not technically sound and complete. ( <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.7.2)
	x	Safety Checklist ( <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 15.3) is complete and has been included with the Document throughout the balloting process. ( <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 15.1.2)
Motion by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by		Eric Sklar (Safety Guru)/Bert Planting (ASML)
Discussion		None
Vote		8 Y-0 N; Motion <b>passed</b>

### IX. Intellectual Property (IP) Check

**Note:** This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items. See § 16 of the *Regulations* for further information.

x	The TC Chapter meeting chair asked those participating, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline. ( <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.8.1)	
Motion	x	No potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known. <b>GO TO SECTION X.</b>
		Potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known, but a Letter of Assurance (LOA) or copyright release letter for such items has been obtained or presented to the TC Chapter. <b>GO TO SECTION X.</b>
		Potentially material patented technology or reproduction of copyrighted items is known and use of such materials is technically justified by the TC Chapter, but an LOA or copyright release letter for some of the item(s) has NOT been obtained or presented to the TC Chapter.
		Ask ISC for special permission to publish.
		Quit activity.
		Wait for LOA for patented technology or release of copyrighted items.
	Motion by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion XXXX	
	Vote XX Y-XX N	
	Final Action	
		Motion passed
		Motion failed

\* **Note:** Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this Letter Ballot.

## X. Action for This Document

Motion (Check all applicable items)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] passed TC Chapter review as balloted and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [1] passed TC Chapter review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] passed TC Chapter review with technical changes and with or without editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review. A Ratification Ballot will be issued to verify the technical changes.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] failed TC Chapter review and will be returned to the TF for rework.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] failed TC Chapter review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/ 2nd by		Eric Sklar (Safety Guru)/Bert Planting (ASML)
Discussion		None
Vote		7 Y - 0 N
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed

## Readjudicated at SEMICON West meeting of 2016

Motion (Check all applicable items)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [1] passed TC Chapter review as balloted and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [1] passed TC Chapter review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] passed TC Chapter review with technical changes and with or without editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review. A Ratification Ballot will be issued to verify the technical changes.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] failed TC Chapter review and will be returned to the TF for rework.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] failed TC Chapter review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/ 2nd by		Eric Sklar (Safety Guru)/Ed Karl (Applied Materials)
Discussion		None
Vote		7 Y - 0 N
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed

Standards staff to record the result of the A&R procedural review here:

A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are Approved for publication
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are Approved pending acceptance of the Ratification Ballot
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] are Not approved
	Reason:	