## Record of Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: North America
Global Technical Committee: Information and Control
TC Chapter Cochairs: Brian Rubow (Cimetrix) Jack Ghiselli (Ghiselli Consulting), James Moyne (Applied Materials, University of Michigan)
Standards Staff: Inna Skvortsova

|  | Scheduled in Background Statement | Actual |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Date | 07/10/2019 | 07/10/2019 |
| Location | Moscone, San Francisco CA | Moscone, San Francisco CA |
| Reason for <br> Change of Date <br> and/or Location <br> (if changed) |  |  |

Note: See Regulations || 9.5 Exceptions for allowable reason to change.

## I. Document Number and Title

| Document Number | Document Title |
| :--- | :--- |
| 6348B | Revision to SEMI E30-0418 |
|  | SPECIFICATION FOR THE GENERIC MODEL FOR |
|  | COMMUNICATIONS |
|  | AND CONTROL OF MANUFACTURING EQUIPMENT <br>  <br>  <br> (GEM) |

## II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.
Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

Note: A minimum of $60 \%$ of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations $\mathbb{\|}$ 9.6.2.1.1)

Voting Tally (with example values):


## III. Rejects

Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: AFF_SCREEN) Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Nishimura, Takayuki, Screen) Negative 1

| $\begin{aligned} & \text { Z } \\ & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{0} \\ & \stackrel{0}{\otimes} \\ & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{\gtrless} \end{aligned}$ | Referenced Section/ Paragraph | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | 5.1.3 |  |  |  |
|  | Negative Text | *Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. |  |  |  |
|  |  | 5.1.3 'might be' is not appropriate term for Terminology |  |  |  |
| TF input (optional) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Withdrawal (check one) |  | X ${ }^{\text {No }}$ Negative withdrawal made by Voter. |  |  | GO TO "Related" subsection |
|  |  | Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY. |  |  | $\underset{\rightarrow}{\rightarrow} \rightarrow$ (A) |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { ग्ण } \\ & \frac{\stackrel{1}{0}}{\stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{2}} \end{aligned}$ | Motion and Reason (check one) | $X$ 'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.) |  |  | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  | Negative is not related. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |
|  |  | Reason XXXX |  |  |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion |  |  |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed. |  |  |  |
|  |  | [Negative is not related.] < 2/3 |  |  | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is not related.] |  |  | $\underset{\substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (B) }}}{ }$ |
|  | Motion and Reason (check one) | Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs $>1 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |
|  |  | X Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |
|  |  | Reason $\quad \|$The word "might" is <br> described in an English lang <br> The word accurately descri <br> the possibility of being signi <br> a host can disable colle |  |  | "used to express possibility" as uage dictionary. bes how a collection event has cant to a host. For this reason, ction event notification using |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \hline \begin{array}{c} \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \mathrm{by} \end{array} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimetrix) |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion | Voter's explanation: <br> Because this text in not definition o the event, definition ca be improved in the future ballot |  |  |  |
|  |  | 20 Y-0 N; Motion passed. |  |  |  |




This table is needed for each Negative.

## Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 1

Check only when the Document has not been failed.

| 1 | Original number (\#) of Negatives |  |  |  | (g) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0 | Number of Negatives withdrawn |  |  |  | (h) |
| 0 | Number of Negatives found not related |  |  |  | (i) |
| 1 | Number of Negatives found not significant |  |  |  | (j) |
| 0 | Number of Negatives addressed by technical change (Negative becomes not significant) |  |  |  | (k) |
|  | Final | X | $\mathbf{g}-(\mathbf{h}+\mathbf{i}+\mathbf{j}+\mathbf{k})=0$ | Reject is Not Valid denominator of § | is not included in the pproval Conditions Check |
|  |  |  | $\mathbf{g}-(\mathbf{h}+\mathbf{i}+\mathbf{j}+\mathbf{k})>0$ | Reject is included Approval Conditio | e denominator of § VI. heck |
|  |  |  | Reject without a Negative | Not Valid |  |

This table is needed for each Voting Interest Reject.
Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (Regulations $\mathbb{T}$ 9.4.3.3)
Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant.
(Regulations $\uparrow$ 9.6.1.4.5.2)

Voting Interest Reject 2 (Voting Interest Name: AFF_Hitachi Ltd) Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Yuko Toyoshima, Hitachi Ltd)
Negative 1

| $\begin{aligned} & \mathbf{Z} \\ & \underset{\sim}{0} \\ & \stackrel{0}{0} \\ & \underset{\sim}{\gtrless} \end{aligned}$ | Referenced Section/ Paragraph | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | 5.2 |  |  |  |  |
|  | Negative Text | *Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | 5.2 Variable Definitions <br> - Variable(s) are not defined in E5. <br> - Only class is defined in 9.4 of E5. <br> - 'The definition of the variable in E30' should be described exactly in E30. |  |  |  |  |
| TF input (optional) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Withdrawal (check one) |  | X ${ }^{\text {No }}$ Negative withdrawal made by Voter. |  |  |  | GO TO "Related" subsection |
|  |  | Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY. |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ & \rightarrow \text { (A) } \end{aligned}$ |
| $\begin{aligned} & \underset{\sim}{D} \\ & \frac{\mathbb{N}}{0} \\ & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{\mathbb{Q}} \end{aligned}$ | Motion and Reason (check one) | X | 'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.) |  |  | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  | Negative is not related. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | Reason XXXX |  |  |  |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |  |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed. |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | [Negative is not related.] < 2/3 |  |  |  | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is not related.] |  |  |  | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow \text { (B) }$ |
| $\begin{aligned} & \mathbb{D} \\ & \frac{\mathbb{N}}{\boldsymbol{N}} \\ & \mathbf{N} \\ & \mathbf{N} \\ & \mathbb{O} \end{aligned}$ | Motion and Reason (check one) | $X$ Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs $>1 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | Reason |  |  |  |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimetrix) |  |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion | - Propose change \#1 in a ratification ballot |  |  |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) | 18 Y-0 N; Motion passed. |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | [Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3 |  | Is a technical change recommended? (check one) | X $\quad$ Y | GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection |
|  |  | [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < $2 / 3$ |  |  | N | $\begin{aligned} & \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ & \rightarrow \text { (E) } \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90\% |  | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (C) |  |  |


|  |  |  |  | $90 \% \leq$ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] |  | GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Technical Change Recommendations <br> Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields. |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | FROM: Section/Paragraph Section 5 <br> - 5.1.24 user - a human or humans who represent the factory and enforce the factory operation model and. A user is considered to be responsible for many setup and configuration activities that cause the equipment to best conform to factory operations practices. <br> - 5.2 Variable Definitions <br> - See SEMI E5 for full definitions. <br> - 5.3 data variable (DVVAL) - a variable where the value is only valid upon occurrence of one or more associated collection events. <br> - 5.4 status variable (SV) - a variable where the value is always valid. <br> - 5.5 equipment constant (ECV) - a variable where the value is always set by the host or operator. <br> - 5.6 Variable Data (V) - A data item containing a status variable (SV), data variable (DVVAL), or equipment constant (ECV) value. <br> - 5.7 Variable Data ID (VID) - A unique identifier of a variable data item. The set of VIDs is the union of all SVIDs, ECIDs, and IDs for DVVALs. |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | TO: Section/Paragraph Section 5 <br> - 5.1.24 user - a human or humans who represent the factory and enforce the factory operation model and . A user is considered to be responsible for many setup and configuration activities that cause the equipment to best conform to factory operations practices. <br> - 5.1.25 Variable Data (V) - A data item containing a status variable (SV), data variable (DVVAL), or equipment constant (ECV) value. <br> - 5.1.26 Variable Data ID (VID) - A unique identifier of a variable data item. The set of VIDs is the union of all SVIDs, ECIDs, and IDs for DVVALs. |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Justification (lif necessary) <br> - Delete the controversial definitions <br> - Move non-controversial definitions into section 5.1 Definitions section. 5.1.24 is unchanged inserted alphabetically and renumbered. <br> - The section is not necessary since, as one voter points out, the classes are defined in SEMI E5. <br> - DVVAL is defined in E5, section 9.7. Usage of DVVAL is consistent with E5. |  |  |  |  |
|  | Motion |  |  | Negative is addressed by the technical change(s). |  |  |  |
|  | Motion by/2 ${ }^{\text {nd }}$ by |  |  | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimterix) |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion |  |  | Matsuda Mtisuhiro asked to follow ballot review template for correct verbiage of the motion. Motion repeated per this request. |  |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) |  |  | 18 Y-1 N; Motion passed |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  | X | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is change(s).] | addressed by the technical | GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection |
|  |  |  |  |  | [Negative is not ad change(s).] < 2/3 | dressed by the technical | $\begin{aligned} & \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ & \rightarrow \text { (E) } \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  | Motion |  | To incorporate the technical change(s). |  |  |  |
|  |  | Motion by/2 ${ }^{\text {nd }}$ by |  | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimterix) |  |  |  |
|  |  | Discussion |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  | Y-1 N; Motion passe |  |  |


|  | Result of Vote (check one) |  |  | 90\% $\leq$ [Agree to incorporate.] |  | $\begin{aligned} & \substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (F) }} \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | [Disagree to incorporate.]>10\% |  | $\begin{aligned} & \substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (E) }} \end{aligned}$ |
| This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or <br> $z$ greater than $90 \%$ of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations \\| 9.6 .1 .4 .5 .2 ) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one) |  | It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant". |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ & \rightarrow \text { (D) } \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  | It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "significant". |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \underset{\rightarrow \text { (C) TO "Final" subsection }}{\rightarrow \rightarrow} \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  | Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote. |  |  |  |
|  | Motion | The Negative is "not significant". |  |  |  |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \hline \begin{array}{c} \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \end{array} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |  |  |  |  |
|  | Vote | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (D) }} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  | XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (C) }} \end{aligned}$ |
| $\begin{aligned} & \underline{7} \\ & \underline{\underline{2}} \end{aligned}$ | (check if applicable) |  | (A) |  | Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition) |  |
|  |  |  | (B) |  | Not related (counted under i in disposition) |  |
|  |  |  | (C) |  | Related and not persuasive (significant) |  |
|  |  |  | (D) |  | Not significant (counted under j in disposition) |  |
|  |  |  | (E) |  | Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change | DOCUMENT FAILS |
|  |  | X | (F) |  | Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition) |  |
|  | (check if applicable) |  | Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment \# |  |  |  |

This table is needed for each Negative.
Negative 2

|  | Referenced Section/ Paragraph | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | 5.2 |  |  |
|  | Negative Text | *Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. |  |  |
|  |  | 5.3 data variable (DVVAL) <br> 5.4 status variable (SV) <br> 5.5 equipment constant (ECV) <br> The above are not definitions. <br> - They describe only characteristic (such as the behavior) |  |  |
| TF input (optional) |  |  |  |  |
| Withdrawal (check one) |  | X | No Negative withdrawal made by Voter. | GO TO "Related" subsection |
|  |  |  | Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY. | $\begin{aligned} & \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ & \rightarrow \text { (A) } \end{aligned}$ |
| $\otimes$ | Motion and Reason (check one) | X | 'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.) | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  |  | Negative is not related. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |


TO: Section/Paragraph Section 5

- 5.1.24 user - a human or humans who represent the factory and enforce the factory operation model and. A user is considered to be responsible for many setup and configuration activities that cause the equipment to best conform to factory operations practices.
- 5.1.25 Variable Data (V) - A data item containing a status variable (SV), data variable (DVVAL), or equipment constant (ECV) value.
- 5.1.26 Variable Data ID (VID) - A unique identifier of a variable data item. The set of VIDs is the union of all SVIDs, ECIDs, and IDs for DVVALs.


## Justification (lif necessary)

## - Delete the controversial definitions

- Move non-controversial definitions into section 5.1 Definitions section. 5.1.24 is unchanged; inserted alphabetically and renumbered.
- The section is not necessary since, as one voter points out, the classes are defined in SEMI E5. - DVVAL is defined in E5, section 9.7. Usage of DVVAL is consistent with E5.

| Motion | Negative is addressed by the technical change(s). |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Motion by/2 ${ }^{\text {nd }}$ by | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimterix) |

This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than $90 \%$ of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations $\mathbb{\|}$ 9.6.1.4.5.2)

| Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one) | It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant". | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow \text { (D) }$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "significant". | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow \text { (C) }$ |
|  | Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote. |  |
| Motion | The Negative is "not significant". |  |
| $\begin{gathered} \hline \begin{array}{c} \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \end{array} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |  |
| Vote | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority | $\underset{\substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (D) }}}{ }$ |
|  | XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority | $\xrightarrow{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection }} \rightarrow$ |


| $\begin{aligned} & 710 \\ & \vdots \\ & \end{aligned}$ | (check if applicable) |  | (A) | Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition) |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | (B) | Not related (counted under i in disposition) |  |
|  |  |  | (C) | Related and not persuasive (significant) |  |
|  |  |  | (D) | Not significant (counted under j in disposition) |  |
|  |  |  | (E) | Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change | DOCUMENT FAILS |
|  |  | X | (F) | Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition) |  |
|  | (check if applicable) | Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment \# |  |  |  |

## Negative 3

| $\begin{gathered} \text { z } \\ \mathbb{D} \\ \stackrel{0}{0} \\ \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{7} \\ \underset{\sim}{2} \end{gathered}$ | Referenced Section/ Paragraph | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | 5.2 |  |  |  |
|  | Negative Text | *Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. |  |  |  |
|  |  | 5.3 data variable (DVVAL) <br> 5.4 status variable (SV) <br> 5.5 equipment constant (ECV) <br> DVVAL, SV, and ECV are class in E5, but express class, variable data, and variable object in E30. |  |  |  |
| TF input (optional) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Withdrawal (check one) |  | X No Negative withdrawal made by Voter. |  |  | GO TO "Related" subsection |
|  |  | Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY. |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ & \rightarrow \text { (A) } \end{aligned}$ |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { ग्N } \\ & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{0} \\ & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{\otimes} \end{aligned}$ | Motion and Reason (check one) | X | 'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.) |  | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  | Negative is not related. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |
|  |  | Reason XXXX |  |  |  |
|  | Motion by/ $2^{\text {nd }}$ by | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion |  |  |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed. |  |  |  |
|  |  | [Negative is not related.] < 2/3 |  |  | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is not related.] |  |  | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow(B)$ |
|  | Motion and Reason (check one) | $X \quad$ Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs $>1 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |
|  |  | Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |
|  |  | Reason |  |  |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimetrix) |  |  |  |



|  | (check one) |  |  | X | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).] |  | GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  | [Negative is not addressed by the technical [change(s).] < 2/3 |  | $\begin{aligned} & \substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (E) }} \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  | Motion |  |  | To incorporate the technical change(s). |  |  |
|  |  | Motion by/ $2^{\text {nd }}$ by |  |  | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimterix) |  |  |
|  |  | Discussion |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | Result of Vote (check one) |  |  | 16 Y-1 N; Motion passed |  |  |
|  |  |  |  | - X | 90\% $\leq$ [Agree to incorporate.] |  | $\begin{aligned} & \underset{\rightarrow}{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection }} \\ & \rightarrow \text { (F) } \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  |  |  | [Disagree to incorporate.] $>10 \%$ |  | GO TO "Final" subsection (E) |
|  | This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than $90 \%$ of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations $\mathbb{\\|}$ 9.6.1.4.5.2) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one) |  |  | It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant". |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{l} \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (D) } \end{array}\right. \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  |  | It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "significant". |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{GO} \text { TO "Final" subsection } \\ & \rightarrow \text { (C) } \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  |  | Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote. |  |  |  |
|  | Motion |  | The Negative is "not significant". |  |  |  |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \end{gathered}$ |  | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |  |  |  |  |
|  | Vote |  | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ & \rightarrow \text { (D) } \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  |  | XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ & \rightarrow \text { (C) } \end{aligned}$ |
| 끌 | (check if applicable) |  |  | (A) |  | Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition) |  |
|  |  |  |  | (B) |  | Not related (counted under i in disposition) |  |
|  |  |  |  | (C) |  | Related and not persuasive (significant) |  |
|  |  |  |  | (D) |  | Not significant (counted under j in disposition) |  |
|  |  |  |  | (E) |  | Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change | DOCUMENT FAILS |
|  |  |  | X | (F) |  | Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition) |  |
|  |  | check if plicable) |  | Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment \# |  |  |  |

## Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 2

Check only when the Document has not been failed.

| 3 | Original number (\#) of Negatives | (g) |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 0 | Number of Negatives withdrawn | (h) |
| 0 | Number of Negatives found not related | (i) |


| 0 | Number of Negatives found not significant |  |  | $(\mathbf{j})$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 3 | Number of Negatives addressed by technical change (Negative <br> becomes not significant) | $(\mathbf{k})$ |  |  |
|  | $\times$ | $\mathbf{g}-(\mathbf{h}+\mathbf{i}+\mathbf{j}+\mathbf{k})=0$ | Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the <br> denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check |  |
|  |  | $\mathbf{g - ( h}+\mathbf{i}+\mathbf{j}+\mathbf{k})>0$ | Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. <br> Approval Conditions Check |  |
|  |  | Reject without a Negative | Not Valid |  |

This table is needed for each Voting Interest Reject.
Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (Regulations $\mathbb{\|}$ 9.4.3.3)
Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant. (Regulations $\mathbb{1}$ 9.6.1.4.5.2)

## Voting Interest Reject 3 (Voting Interest Name: AFF_Yokogawa) Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Takashi Nakagawa, Yokogawa) Negative 1

|  | Referenced Section/ Paragraph | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Negative Text | *Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. |  |  |  |
|  |  | DVNAME should not be removed. I understand that it causes inconsistency and confusable point in the existing standard. But we have too many documents and computer screens including DVNAME and we need huge effort and time to change them. |  |  |  |
| TF input (optional) |  | - DVNAME is not and never was defined in E3O. <br> - Removing an ambiguous reference to DVNAME neither causes confusion nor inconsistency. It also does not require or imply that anyone's documents or computer screens be changed. <br> - DVNAME remains defined in E5. <br> - The author of the ballot and many voters think that keeping references to DVNAME in E30 adds confusion to the document, since a "NAME" is not an ID number. |  |  |  |
| Withdrawal (check one) |  | X ${ }^{\text {No Negative withdrawal made by Voter. }}$ |  |  | GO TO "Related" subsection |
|  |  | Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY. |  |  | $\underset{\rightarrow}{\rightarrow} \underset{(A)}{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection }}$ |
|  | Motion and Reason (check one) | 'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.) |  |  | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  | Negative is not related. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |
|  |  | Reason |  | XXXX |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \hline \begin{array}{c} \text { Motion by } / \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \end{array} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed. |  |  |  |



|  | (check one) |  |  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).] | GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  | [Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3 | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (E) |
|  |  | Motion |  | To incorporate the technical change(s). |  |  |
|  |  | Motion by/2 $2^{\text {nd }}$ by |  | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |  |  |
|  |  | Discussion |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | Result of Vote (check one) |  | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed. |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  | 90\% $\leq$ [Agree to incorporate.] | $\underset{\substack{\text { GO TO "Final" } \\ \rightarrow \text { (F) }}}{ }$ |
|  |  |  |  |  | [Disagree to incorporate.]>10\% | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (E) |
|  | This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than $90 \%$ of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations \\| 9.6.1.4.5.2) |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one) |  |  | It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant". |  | $\underset{\substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (D) }}}{ }$ |
|  |  |  |  | It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "significant". |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ & \rightarrow \text { (C) } \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  |  | Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote. |  |  |
|  | Motion |  | The Negative is "not significant". |  |  |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \hline \begin{array}{c} \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \end{array} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |  | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |  |  |  |
|  | Vote |  |  | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ & \rightarrow \text { (D) } \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  |  | XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority |  | $\begin{aligned} & \begin{array}{l} \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (C) } \end{array} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |
| $\begin{aligned} & 7 \overline{7} \\ & \underset{\sim}{2} \end{aligned}$ | (check if applicable) |  |  | (A) | Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition) |  |
|  |  |  |  | (B) | Not related (counted under i in disposition) |  |
|  |  |  |  | (C) | Related and not persuasive (significant) |  |
|  |  |  | X | (D) | Not significant (counted under j in disposition) |  |
|  |  |  |  | (E) | E) $\begin{array}{l}\text { Related and persuasive and not } \\ \text { addressed by technical change }\end{array}$ | DOCUMENT FAILS |
|  |  |  |  | (F) | Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition) |  |
|  |  | check if plicable) |  | Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment \# X . |  |  |

This table is needed for each Negative.

## Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 3

Check only when the Document has not been failed.

| 1 | Original number (\#) of Negatives | (g) |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 0 | Number of Negatives withdrawn | (h) |
| 0 | Number of Negatives found not related | (i) |
| 1 | Number of Negatives found not significant | (j) |


| 0 | Number of Negatives addressed by technical change (Negative <br> becomes not significant) |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | X | $\mathbf{g - ( \mathbf { h } + \mathbf { i } + \mathbf { j } + \mathbf { k } ) = 0}$ | Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the <br> denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check |  |
|  |  | $\mathbf{g - ( h}+\mathbf{i}+\mathbf{j}+\mathbf{k})>0$ | Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. <br> Approval Conditions Check |  |
|  |  | Reject without a Negative | Not Valid |  |

This table is needed for each Voting Interest Reject.
Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (Regulations $\mathbb{1}$ 9.4.3.3)
Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant. (Regulations ๆ 9.6.1.4.5.2)

## Voting Interest Reject 4 (Voting Interest Name: AFF_PEER) Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Eberhard Teichmann, PEER Group) Negative 1





This table is needed for each Negative.

## Negative 2

|  | Referenced Section/ Paragraph | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |
|  | Negative Text | *Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. |




|  | Result of Vote (check one) |  |  | 90\% $\leq$ [Agree to incorporate.] |  | $\begin{aligned} & \substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (F) }} \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | [Disagree to incorporate.]>10\% |  | $\begin{aligned} & \substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (E) }} \end{aligned}$ |
|  | This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than $90 \%$ of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations $\mathbb{\\|}$ 9.6.1.4.5.2) |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\begin{gathered} 9 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{gathered}$ | Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one) |  | It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "not significant". |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ & \rightarrow \text { (D) } \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  | It is mutually agreed upon to term the Negative "significant". |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \underset{\rightarrow \text { (C) TO "Final" subsection }}{\rightarrow \rightarrow} \end{aligned}$ |
| $\frac{7}{5}$ |  |  | Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote. |  |  |  |
| 을 | Motion | The Negative is "not significant". |  |  |  |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \hline \begin{array}{c} \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \end{array} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |  |  |  |  |
|  | Vote |  | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (D) }} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  | XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (C) }} \end{aligned}$ |
| $\begin{aligned} & \underline{7} \\ & \underline{\underline{2}} \end{aligned}$ | (check if applicable) |  | (A) |  | Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition) |  |
|  |  |  | (B) |  | Not related (counted under i in disposition) |  |
|  |  |  | (C) |  | Related and not persuasive (significant) |  |
|  |  |  | (D) |  | Not significant (counted under j in disposition) |  |
|  |  |  | (E) |  | Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change | DOCUMENT FAILS |
|  |  | X | (F) |  | Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition) |  |
|  | (check if applicable) |  | Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment \# |  |  |  |

## Voting Interest Reject 4 (Voting Interest Name: AFF_PEER) Voter Reject 2 (Voter: Christian Hoffman PEER Group)

## Negative 1

|  | Referenced Section/ Paragraph | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Negative Text | *Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. |  |  |
|  |  | The LI in the Ballot does not resolve the inconsistency in current usage of wording', acronyms and Terms. The values, names and IDs should be formed consistently (SVID, SVV(AL), SVNAME; DVID, DVV(AL), DVNAME; ECID, ECV(AL), ECNAM; CEID, CENAME) or they should not get changed at al. |  |  |
| TF input (optional) |  | - Same as other votes. Proposal to address in a Ratification ballot, change \#1. |  |  |
| Withdrawal (check one) |  | X | No Negative withdrawal made by Voter. | GO TO "Related" subsection |
|  |  |  | Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY. | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow(\mathrm{A})$ |


|  | Motion and Reason (check one) | X | 'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.) |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { GO TO "Persuasive" } \\ & \text { subsection } \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | Negative is not related. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Reason XXXX | XXXX |  |  |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \end{gathered}$ | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed. |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | [Negative is not related.] < 2/3 |  |  |  |  | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is not related.] |  |  |  |  | GO TO "Final" subsection (B) |
|  | Motion and Reason (check one) | Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs $>1 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | Reason |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimetrix) |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion | - Propose change \#1 in a ratification ballot |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) | 18 Y-0 N; Motion passed. |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | X | [Negative is related and persuasive.] > $1 / 3$ | Is a technical change recommended? (check one) | $\begin{array}{l\|l\|l} \mathrm{X} & \mathrm{Y} \end{array}$ |  | GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection |
|  |  |  | [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3 |  |  |  | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (E) |
|  |  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < $90 \%$ | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (C) |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | $90 \% \leq$ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] | GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection |  |  |  |
| $\overline{\text { ®He }}$ | Technical Change Recommendations <br> Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields. |  |  |  |  |  |  |


|  | FROM: Section/Paragraph Section 5 <br> - 5.1.24 user - a human or humans who represent the factory and enforce the factory operation model and. A user is considered to be responsible for many setup and configuration activities that cause the equipment to best conform to factory operations practices. <br> - 5.2 Variable Definitions <br> - See SEMI E5 for full definitions. <br> - 5.3 data variable (DVVAL) - a variable where the value is only valid upon occurrence of one or more associated collection events. <br> - 5.4 status variable (SV) - a variable where the value is always valid. <br> - 5.5 equipment constant (ECV) - a variable where the value is always set by the host or operator <br> - 5.6 Variable Data (V) - A data item containing a status variable (SV), data variable (DVVAL), or equipment constant (ECV) value. <br> - 5.7 Variable Data ID (VID) - A unique identifier of a variable data item. The set of VIDs is the union of all SVIDs, ECIDs, and IDs for DVVALs. |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | TO: Section/Paragraph Section 5 <br> 5.1.24 user - a human or humans who represent the factory and enforce the factory operation model and. A user is considered to be responsible for many setup and configuration activities that cause the equipment to best conform to factory operations practices. <br> 5.1.25 Variable Data (V) - A data item containing a status variable (SV), data variable (DVVAL), or equipment constant (ECV) value. <br> 5.1.26 Variable Data ID (VID) - A unique identifier of a variable data item. The set of VIDs is the union of all SVIDs, ECIDs, and IDs for DVVALs. |  |  |  |
|  | Justification (lf necessary) <br> - Delete the controversial definitions <br> - Move non-controversial definitions into section 5.1 Definitions section. 5.1.24 is unchanged; inserted alphabetically and renumbered. <br> - The section is not necessary since, as one voter points out, the classes are defined in SEMI E5. <br> - DVVAL is defined in E5, section 9.7. Usage of DVVAL is consistent with E5. |  |  |  |
| Motion |  | Negative is addressed by the technical change(s). |  |  |
| Motion by/2 ${ }^{\text {nd }}$ by |  | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimterix) |  |  |
| Discussion |  | none |  |  |
| Result of Vote (check one) |  | 18 Y-1 N; Motion passed |  |  |
|  |  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).] | GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection |
|  |  |  | [Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3 | $\begin{aligned} & \substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (E) }} \end{aligned}$ |
|  | Motion | To incorporate the technical change(s). |  |  |
|  | Motion by/ $2^{\text {nd }}$ by | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimterix) |  |  |
|  | Discussion | none |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) | 16 Y-1 N; Motion passed |  |  |
|  |  | X | 90\% $\leq$ [Agree to incorporate.] | $\begin{aligned} & \substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (F) }} \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  | [Disagree to incorporate.] $>10 \%$ | GO TO "Final" subsection (E) |


|  | This option can greater than $90 \%$ |  | sed only "if he persons | Chapter finds a Negative not p on the action". (Regulations ๆ\| | uasive by a vote equal to or 1.4.5.2) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\stackrel{\varrho O}{\underline{0}}$ |  |  | It is mutually significant". | ed upon to term the Negative "not | $\underset{\substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (D) }}}{ }$ |
|  | significant finding option" (check one) |  | It is mutually "significant" | ed upon to term the Negative | $\underset{\rightarrow \text { (C) }}{\substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow}}$ |
| 7 |  |  | Whether or | e Negative is "not significant" is dec | d by a vote. |
| 高 | Motion | The | Negative is | significant". |  |
|  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Motion by/ } \\ & 2^{\text {nd }} b y \end{aligned}$ | Nam | (Company | me (Company) |  |
|  | Vote |  | XX Y-XX N | n passed with simple majority | $\begin{aligned} & \substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (D) }} \end{aligned}$ |
|  | Vote |  | XX Y-XX | failed with simple majority | $\begin{aligned} & \begin{array}{l} \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (C) } \end{array} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  | (A) | Withdrawn (counted under h in dis | osition) |
|  |  |  | (B) | Not related (counted under i in dis | osition) |
|  | ck if |  | (C) | Related and not persuasive (signif |  |
| $\frac{7}{7}$ | applicable) |  | (D) | Not significant (counted under j i | sposition) |
| $\stackrel{\underline{1}}{ }$ |  |  | (E) | Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change | DOCUMENT FAILS |
|  |  | X | (F) | Addressed by technical change (c | ted under k disposition) |
|  | (check if applicable) |  | Comment | ted. See Section V-(ii) Comment |  |

Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 4
Check only when the Document has not been failed.

| 3 | Original number (\#) of Negatives |  |  |  | (g) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0 | Number of Negatives withdrawn |  |  |  | (h) |
| 0 | Number of Negatives found not related |  |  |  | (i) |
| 1 | Number of Negatives found not significant |  |  |  | (j) |
| 2 | Number of Negatives addressed by technical change (Negativebecomes not significant) |  |  |  | (k) |
|  | Final | X | $\mathbf{g}-(\mathbf{h}+\mathbf{i}+\mathbf{j}+\mathbf{k})=0$ | Reject is Not Valid denominator of § | is not included in the pproval Conditions Check |
|  |  |  | $\mathbf{g - ( h + i + j + k ) > 0}$ | Reject is included Approval Conditio | e denominator of § VI. heck |
|  |  |  | Reject without a Neg | Not Valid |  |

This table is needed for each Voting Interest Reject.
Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (Regulations $\mathbb{1}$ 9.4.3.3)
Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant.
(Regulations $\mathbb{\|}$ 9.6.1.4.5.2)

## Voting Interest Reject 5 (Voting Interest Name: AFF_KKR) Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Matsuda Mitsuhiro, KOKUSAI ELECRIC CORPORATION)

## Negative 1

|  | Referenced Section/ Paragraph | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | *Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. |  |  |  |
|  | Negative Text | E30 shall follow E5 definition to harmonize SEMI Standards as a set. <br> See E5 19.7, class definition is as following. <br> - Class - The data type classification (SV, ECV, or DVVAL) of the item. Status values (SVs) always contain valid information, while data values (DVVALs) may only be valid upon the occurrence of a particular event. All equipment constants (ECVs) are settable by the Host. <br> So SV shall be defined as "status value", DVVAL shall be defined "data value" and ECV shall be defined "equipment constant". <br> However this ballot introduce new word "... variable" to confuse current Standard user. |  |  |  |
| TF input (optional) |  | - Strongly disagree. The classification "status value" makes no sense. The term "status variable" is used many, many times in E5, including the definition of SVID. <br> - Ratification ballot proposes to removed the referenced section (technical change \#1). |  |  |  |
| Withdrawal (check one) |  | X No Negative withdrawal made by Voter. |  |  | GO TO "Related" subsection |
|  |  | Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY. |  |  | $\xrightarrow{\rightarrow} \rightarrow$ (A) $)$ "Final" subsection |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { ग्D } \\ & \frac{\stackrel{1}{\omega}}{\stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{\otimes}} \end{aligned}$ | Motion and Reason (check one) | X | 'Related' | greed upon. (Needs no motion.) | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  |  | Negative | . (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |
|  |  |  | Reason | XXXX |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \hline \begin{array}{c} \text { Motion by } / \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \end{array} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion |  |  |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed. |  |  |  |
|  |  | [Negative is not related.] < 2/3 |  |  | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is not related.] |  |  | $\underset{\rightarrow}{\mathrm{GO} \text { TO "Final" subsection }}$ |
|  | Motion and Reason (check one) | Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs $>1 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |
|  |  | Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |
|  |  | Reason |  |  |  |


|  | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Motion by } / \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |  | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimetrix) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Discussion |  | - Propose change \#1 in a ratification ballot |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) |  | 16 Y-0 N; Motion passed. |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | $\times$ |  | Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3 | Is a technical change recommended? (check one) | x | Y | GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection |
|  |  |  | persuasive.] < $2 / 3$ |  | N |  | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow(\mathrm{E})$ |
|  |  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90\% | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (C) |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | $90 \% \leq$ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] | GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection |  |  |  |
|  | Technical Change Recommendations <br> Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | FROM: Section/Paragraph Section 5 <br> 5.1.24 user - a human or humans who represent the factory and enforce the factory operation model and . A user is considered to be responsible for many setup and configuration activities that cause the equipment to best conform to factory operations practices. <br> 5.2 Variable Definitions <br> See SEMI E5 for full definitions. <br> 5.3 data variable (DVVAL) - a variable where the value is only valid upon occurrence of one or more associated collection events. <br> 5.4 status variable (SV) - a variable where the value is always valid. <br> 5.5 equipment constant (ECV) - a variable where the value is always set by the host or operator. <br> 5.6 Variable Data (V) - A data item containing a status variable (SV), data variable (DVVAL), or equipment constant (ECV) value. <br> 5.7 Variable Data ID (VID) - A unique identifier of a variable data item. The set of VIDs is the union of all SVIDs, ECIDs, and IDs for DVVALs. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | model and. A user is considered to be responsible for many setup and configuration activities that cause the equipment to best conform to factory operations practices. <br> - 5.1.25 Variable Data (V) - A data item containing a status variable (SV), data variable (DVVAL), or equipment constant (ECV) value. <br> - 5.1.26 Variable Data ID (VID) - A unique identifier of a variable data item. The set of VIDs is the union of all SVIDs, ECIDs, and IDs for DVVALs. |  |  | Paragraph Section 5 <br> ser - a human or humans who represent the factory and enforce the factory operation . A user is considered to be responsible for many setup and configuration activities the equipment to best conform to factory operations practices. <br> ariable Data (V) - A data item containing a status variable (SV), data variable (DVVAL), ent constant (ECV) value. <br> Variable Data ID (VID) - A unique identifier of a variable data item. The set of VIDs is of all SVIDs, ECIDs, and IDs for DVVALs. |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | Justification (lf necessary) <br> - Delete the controversial definitions <br> - Move non-controversial definitions into section 5.1 Definitions section. 5.1.24 is unchanged inserted alphabetically and renumbered. <br> - The section is not necessary since, as one voter points out, the classes are defined in SEMI E5. <br> - DVVAL is defined in E5, section 9.7. Usage of DVVAL is consistent with E5. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Motion |  |  |  | Negative is addressed by the technical change(s). |  |  |  |  |
|  | Motion by/2 ${ }^{\text {nd }}$ by |  |  |  | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimterix) |  |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion |  |  |  | none |  |  |  |  |



Negative 2

|  | Referenced Section/ Paragraph | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | 5.1 Variable Definitions |
|  | Negative Text | *Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. |


|  |  | Ballot says "See SEMI E5 for full definitions." <br> However I can't find any definition except T9.7, class definition. |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| TF input (optional) |  | - Correct. Needs to be fixed in E5. Addressed with ratification ballot( technical change \#1). |  |  |  |  |  |
| Withdrawal (check one) |  | X No Negative withdrawal made by Voter. |  |  |  |  | GO TO "Related" subsection |
|  |  | Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY. |  |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \hline \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ & \rightarrow \text { (A) } \end{aligned}$ |
|  | Motion and Reason (check one) | X | 'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.) |  |  |  | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  | Negative is not related. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | Reason XXXX |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Motion by/ $2^{\text {nd }}$ by | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed. |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | [Negative is not related.] < 2/3 |  |  |  |  | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is not related.] |  |  |  |  | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow(B)$ |
| $\begin{aligned} & \mathbb{D} \\ & \frac{\mathbb{N}}{\mathbf{N}} \\ & \stackrel{N}{0} \\ & \mathbf{N} \\ & \vdots \end{aligned}$ | Motion and Reason (check one) | $X \quad$ Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs $>1 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | Reason |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimetrix) |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion | - Propose change \#1 in a ratification ballot |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) | 16 Y-0 N; Motion passed. |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | X | [Negative is related and persuasive.] > $1 / 3$ | Is a technical change recommended? (check one) | X | Y | GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection |
|  |  |  | [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3 |  |  | N | $\begin{aligned} & \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ & \rightarrow \text { (E) } \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90\% | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (C) |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | $90 \% \leq$ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] | GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection |  |  |  |
| 伿 | Technical Change Recommendations <br> Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields. |  |  |  |  |  |  |


|  | FROM: Section/Paragraph Section 5 <br> - 5.1.24 user - a human or humans who represent the factory and enforce the factory operation model and. A user is considered to be responsible for many setup and configuration activities that cause the equipment to best conform to factory operations practices. <br> - 5.2 Variable Definitions <br> - See SEMI E5 for full definitions. <br> - 5.3 data variable (DVVAL) - a variable where the value is only valid upon occurrence of one or more associated collection events. <br> - 5.4 status variable (SV) - a variable where the value is always valid. <br> - 5.5 equipment constant (ECV) - a variable where the value is always set by the host or operator <br> - 5.6 Variable Data (V) - A data item containing a status variable (SV), data variable (DVVAL), or equipment constant (ECV) value. <br> - 5.7 Variable Data ID (VID) - A unique identifier of a variable data item. The set of VIDs is the union of all SVIDs, ECIDs, and IDs for DVVALs. |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | TO: Section/Paragraph Section 5 <br> 5.1.24 user - a human or humans who represent the factory and enforce the factory operation model and. A user is considered to be responsible for many setup and configuration activities that cause the equipment to best conform to factory operations practices. <br> 5.1.25 Variable Data (V) - A data item containing a status variable (SV), data variable (DVVAL), or equipment constant (ECV) value. <br> 5.1.26 Variable Data ID (VID) - A unique identifier of a variable data item. The set of VIDs is the union of all SVIDs, ECIDs, and IDs for DVVALs. |  |  |  |
|  | Justification (lf necessary) <br> - Delete the controversial definitions <br> - Move non-controversial definitions into section 5.1 Definitions section. 5.1.24 is unchanged; inserted alphabetically and renumbered. <br> - The section is not necessary since, as one voter points out, the classes are defined in SEMI E5. <br> - DVVAL is defined in E5, section 9.7. Usage of DVVAL is consistent with E5. |  |  |  |
| Motion |  | Negative is addressed by the technical change(s). |  |  |
| Motion by/2 ${ }^{\text {nd }}$ by |  | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimterix) |  |  |
| Discussion |  | none |  |  |
| Result of Vote (check one) |  | 18 Y-1 N; Motion passed |  |  |
|  |  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).] | GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection |
|  |  |  | [Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3 | $\begin{aligned} & \substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (E) }} \end{aligned}$ |
|  | Motion | To incorporate the technical change(s). |  |  |
|  | Motion by/ $2^{\text {nd }}$ by | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimterix) |  |  |
|  | Discussion | none |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) | 16 Y-1 N; Motion passed |  |  |
|  |  | X | 90\% $\leq$ [Agree to incorporate.] | $\begin{aligned} & \substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (F) }} \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  | [Disagree to incorporate.] $>10 \%$ | GO TO "Final" subsection (E) |


|  | This option can greater than $90 \%$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { be us } \\ & \% \text { of th } \end{aligned}$ | sed only "if he persons | Chapter finds a Negative not on the action". (Regulations | uasive by a vote equal to or 1.4.5.2) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\begin{gathered} \overrightarrow{0} \\ \stackrel{0}{0} \end{gathered}$ | Us |  | It is mutual significant" | ed upon to term the Negative "not | $\underset{\rightarrow}{\text { GO TO "Final" }} \mathbf{\rightarrow}$ |
|  | significant finding option" (check one) |  | It is mutual "significant" | ed upon to term the Negative | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow \text { (C) }$ |
| 7 |  |  | Whether or | e Negative is "not significant" is dec | d by a vote. |
| $\bar{E}$ | Motion | The | Negative is | nificant". |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \hline \begin{array}{c} \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \end{array} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Nam | (Compan | me (Company) |  |
|  | Vote |  | XXY-XX N | n passed with simple majority | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (D) |
|  | Vote |  | XX Y-XX | n failed with simple majority | $\underset{\substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (C) }}}{ }$ |
|  |  |  | (A) | Withdrawn (counted under h in d | osition) |
|  |  |  | (B) | Not related (counted under i in disp | osition) |
|  | eck if |  | (C) | Related and not persuasive (signif |  |
| 7 | applicable) |  | (D) | Not significant (counted under j i | sposition) |
| $\stackrel{1}{2}$ |  |  | (E) | Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change | DOCUMENT FAILS |
|  |  | X | (F) | Addressed by technical change (c | ted under k disposition) |
|  | (check if applicable) |  | Comment | ted. See Section V-(ii) Comment |  |

Negative 3

|  | Referenced Section/ Paragraph | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | 5.3 data variable (DVVAL), 5.4 status variable (SV), 5.5 equipment constant (ECV) |  |  |  |
|  | Negative Text | *Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. |  |  |  |
|  |  | 5.3 data variable (DVVAL), 5.4 status variable (SV), 5.5 equipment constant (ECV) They are not definition. They are characteristic of data variable. |  |  |  |
| TF input (optional) |  | - Disagree. By this rationale, SV, DVVAL, ECV are not defined anywhere, not even in E5 <br> - Addressed by ratification ballot (technical change \#1). |  |  |  |
| Withdrawal (check one) |  | X No Negative withdrawal made by Voter. |  |  | GO TO "Related" subsection |
|  |  | Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY. |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \hline \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ & \rightarrow \text { (A) } \end{aligned}$ |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { ग्0 } \\ & \stackrel{\oplus}{\omega} \\ & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{0} \end{aligned}$ | Motion and Reason (check one) | 'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.) |  |  | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  | Negative is not related. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |
|  |  | Reason |  | XXXX |  |



|  |  | TO: Sec  <br> $-\quad 5.1 .24$  <br> mod  <br> that  <br> $-\quad$ 5.1. <br> or e  <br> - 5.1. <br>  the <br>   | TO: Section/Paragraph Section 5 <br> $-\quad$ 5.1.24 user - a human or humans who represent the factory and enforce the factory operation <br> model and. A user is considered to be responsible for many setup and configuration activities <br> that cause the equipment to best conform to factory operations practices. <br> $-\quad 5.1 .25$ Variable Data (V) - A data item containing a status variable (SV), data variable (DVVAL), <br> or equipment constant (ECV) value. <br> $-\quad$ 5.1.26 Variable Data ID (VID) - A unique identifier of a variable data item. The set of VIDs is <br> the union of all SVIDs, ECIDs, and IDs for DVVALs. |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Motion |  |  | Negative is addressed by the technical change(s). |  |  |
|  | Motion by/2 ${ }^{\text {nd }}$ by |  |  | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimterix) |  |  |
|  | Discussion |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) |  |  | 18 Y-1 N; Motion passed |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).] | GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection |
|  |  |  |  |  | [Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3 | $\begin{aligned} & \substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (E) }} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  | Motion |  | To incorporate the technical change(s). |  |  |
|  |  | Motion by/2 ${ }^{\text {nd }}$ by |  | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimterix) |  |  |
|  |  | Discussion |  | none |  |  |
|  |  | Result of Vote (check one) |  | 16 Y-1 N; Motion passed |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  | 90\% $\leq$ [Agree to incorporate.] | $\underset{\rightarrow}{\substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (F) }}}$ |
|  |  |  |  |  | [Disagree to incorporate.] $>10 \%$ | GO TO "Final" subsection (E) |
|  | This option can be used only "if the TC Chapter finds a Negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than $90 \%$ of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations \\| 9.6 .1 .4 .5 .2 ) |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Use of "Not significant finding option" (check one) |  |  |  | ually agreed upon to term the Negative "not t". | $\underset{\substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (D) }}}{ }$ |
|  |  |  |  |  | ually agreed upon to term the Negative nt". | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow \text { (C) }$ |
|  |  |  | Whether or not the Negative is "not significant" is decided by a vote. |  |  |  |
|  | Motion |  | The Negative is "not significant". |  |  |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |  | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |  |  |  |
|  | Vote |  | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed with simple majority |  |  | $\underset{\substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (D) }}}{\substack{\text { (D) } \\ \hline}}$ |
|  |  |  | XX Y-XX N; Motion failed with simple majority |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \begin{array}{l} \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (C) } \end{array} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |


| $\begin{aligned} & 710 \\ & \mathbf{V} \end{aligned}$ | (check if applicable) |  | (A) | Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition) |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | (B) | Not related (counted under i in disposition) |  |
|  |  |  | (C) | Related and not persuasive (significant) |  |
|  |  |  | (D) | Not significant (counted under j in disposition) |  |
|  |  |  | (E) | Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change | DOCUMENT FAILS |
|  |  | X | (F) | Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition) |  |
|  | (check if applicable) | Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment \# |  |  |  |

Negative 4




## Negative 5

|  | Referenced Section/ Paragraph | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | - 5.3 data variable (DVVAL) |
|  | Negative Text | *Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. |



## Negative 6

| $\begin{aligned} & \text { Z } \\ & \text { © } \\ & \text { O} \\ & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{\underset{~}{心}} \end{aligned}$ | Referenced Section/ Paragraph | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | 5.3 data variable and 5.6 Variable Data |
|  | Negative Text | *Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. |
|  |  | - These words are very similar but different meaning. It may introduce confusion. <br> - New definition "data variable" should be changed. |


| TF input (optional) |  | This is essentially a duplicate of another reject which referenced a usage of "variable data" <br> Addressed by ratification ballot (technical change \#1). |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Withdrawal (check one) |  | X No Negative withdrawal made by Voter. |  |  |  | GO TO "Related" subsection |
|  |  |  | Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY. |  |  | $\underset{\substack{\text { GO TO "Final" } \\ \rightarrow \text { (A) }}}{ }$ |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { D } \\ & \stackrel{\text { D }}{0} \\ & \stackrel{W}{\otimes} \end{aligned}$ | Motion and Reason (check one) | X | 'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.) |  |  | GO TO "Persuasive" <br> subsection |
|  |  |  | Negative is not related. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |
|  |  | Reason Xxx |  | XXXX |  |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \hline \begin{array}{c} \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \end{array} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |  |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed. |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | [Negative is not related.] < 2/3 |  |  |  | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is not related.] |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ & \rightarrow \text { (B) } \end{aligned}$ |
|  | Motion and Reason (check one) | $X \quad$ Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs $>1 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | Reason |  |  |  |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Brian Rubow (Cimetrix) |  |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion | - Propose change \#1 in a ratification ballot |  |  |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) | 16 Y-0 N; Motion passed. |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | X | [Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3 | Is a technical change recommended? (check one) |  | GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection |
|  |  |  | [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3 |  | N | $\mathrm{N} \underset{\substack{\text { GO TO "Final" } \\ \rightarrow \text { (E) }}}{\text { gubsection }}$ |
|  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90\% |  | GO TO "Final" subsection $\rightarrow$ (C) |  |  |
|  |  | $90 \% \leq$ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] |  | GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection |  |  |
| 冁 를 | Technical Change Recommendations <br> Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields. |  |  |  |  |  |



|  | This option can greater than $90 \%$ |  | sed only "if he persons | Chapter finds a Negative not p on the action". (Regulations ๆ\| | uasive by a vote equal to or 1.4.5.2) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\stackrel{\varrho O}{\underline{0}}$ |  |  | It is mutually significant". | ed upon to term the Negative "not | $\underset{\substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (D) }}}{ }$ |
|  | significant finding option" (check one) |  | It is mutually "significant" | ed upon to term the Negative | $\underset{\rightarrow \text { (C) }}{\substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow}}$ |
| 7 |  |  | Whether or | e Negative is "not significant" is dec | d by a vote. |
| 高 | Motion | The | Negative is | significant". |  |
|  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Motion by/ } \\ & 2^{\text {nd }} b y \end{aligned}$ | Nam | (Company | me (Company) |  |
|  | Vote |  | XX Y-XX N | n passed with simple majority | $\begin{aligned} & \substack{\text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (D) }} \end{aligned}$ |
|  | Vote |  | XX Y-XX | failed with simple majority | $\begin{aligned} & \begin{array}{l} \text { GO TO "Final" subsection } \\ \rightarrow \text { (C) } \end{array} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |
|  |  |  | (A) | Withdrawn (counted under h in dis | osition) |
|  |  |  | (B) | Not related (counted under i in dis | osition) |
|  | ck if |  | (C) | Related and not persuasive (signif |  |
| $\frac{7}{7}$ | applicable) |  | (D) | Not significant (counted under j i | sposition) |
| $\stackrel{\underline{1}}{ }$ |  |  | (E) | Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change | DOCUMENT FAILS |
|  |  | X | (F) | Addressed by technical change (c | ted under k disposition) |
|  | (check if applicable) |  | Comment | ted. See Section V-(ii) Comment |  |

Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 5
Check only when the Document has not been failed.

| 6 | Original number (\#) of Negatives |  |  |  | (g) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Number of Negatives withdrawn |  |  |  | (h) |
| 0 | Number of Negatives found not related |  |  |  | (i) |
| 1 | Number of Negatives found not significant |  |  |  | (j) |
| 4 | Number of Negatives addressed by technical change (Negative becomes not significant) |  |  |  | (k) |
|  | Final | X | $\mathbf{g - ( h + i}+\mathbf{j}+\mathbf{k})=0$ | Reject is Not Valid denominator of § | is not included in the pproval Conditions Check |
|  |  |  | $\mathbf{g}-(\mathbf{h}+\mathbf{i}+\mathbf{j}+\mathbf{k})>0$ | Reject is included Approval Conditio | e denominator of § VI. heck |
|  |  |  | Reject without a Negative | Not Valid |  |

This table is needed for each Voting Interest Reject.
Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (Regulations $\mathbb{1}$ 9.4.3.3)
Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant.
(Regulations $\mathbb{\|}$ 9.6.1.4.5.2)

## IV. Other Technical Issues

Note: TC Chapter may choose to address a technical issue that is not part of a Negative received on a Letter Ballot (i.e., a Comment or a reason not addressed by a Vote response) by handling it as a Negative and finding it related and technically persuasive. The TC Chapter may then fail the Document or address such technical issue by using the procedure defined in Regulations § 9.6.1.4.3 to make a technical change to the Document. (Regulations § 9.6.1.4.2.5)

|  | Origin | *TF/TC Chapter to choose Comment 1 and 2 (Voter: Albert Fuchigami, PEER Group) |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Referenced | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in including text in the ballot as appropriate. |  |  |  |
|  | Section/ Paragraph | sections 7.7.5.5.2 and 7.9.3.3 |  |  |  |
|  |  | *Original Comment text, if applicable, and problem statement, including justification and suggestion, should be copied. |  |  |  |
|  | Reason | - Comment \#1 - In section 7.7.5.5.2. The footnote reference (superscript 21) was not removed on the S7,F1 entry. <br> - Think this can be addressed with an editorial change? <br> - Comment \#2 - Definition of 'message recognition' was moved to new section 7.9.3.3; was this meant to go in Section 5 - Terminology? <br> - Think this can be addressed with an editorial change? |  |  |  |
| Handle technical issue identified above as a Negative. |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { ग्ष } \\ & \frac{\stackrel{1}{\omega}}{\stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{\otimes}} \end{aligned}$ | Motion and Reason (check one) | X 'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.) |  |  | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  | Negative is not related and assigned to TF. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |
|  |  | Negative is not related and placed on agenda of current TC Chapter meeting as new business. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |
|  |  | Reason |  | XXXX |  |
|  | $\begin{aligned} & \hline \text { Motion by/ } \\ & \text { 2nd by } \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion |  |  |  |  |
|  | Result of Vote (check one) | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed. |  |  |  |
|  |  | [Negative is not related.] <2/3 |  |  | GO TO "Persuasive" subsection |
|  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is not related] and assigned to TF. |  |  |  |
|  |  | $2 / 3 \leq$ [Negative is not related] and placed on agenda of current TC Chapter meeting as new business. |  |  | subsection $\rightarrow$ (B) |
|  | Motion and Reason (check one) | X Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs $>1 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |
|  |  | Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs $\geq 2 / 3$ votes to pass.) |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Reason | XXXX |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \end{gathered}$ | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Albert Fuchigami (PEER Group) |  |  |  |
|  | Discussion | Comment \#1 to be addressed with technical change \#2 by Ratification ballot proposal. No action needed for Comment \#2. |  |  |  |
|  |  | 18 Y-0 N; Motion passed |  |  |  |



|  | (F) | Addressed by technical change |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :--- |
| (check if <br> applicable) |  | Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment $\# X$. |

## V. Comments

## V- (i) Voters' Comments

Commenter 1 (Dawn Meinhardt / INTEL) - Comment 1

|  | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph \#, if necessary. |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Pg4 : NOTICE: Unless otherwise indicated, all documents cited ARE the latest published versions.' indicates all documents later published are correct |  |
| $\stackrel{R}{2}$ | The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions. |  |
|  | *No motion is required in this step. |  |
|  | Already a | , |
|  | X ${ }^{\text {No further }}$ | on was taken by the TC Chapter. |
|  | Refer to th | for more consideration. |
|  | New Busi |  |
|  | Editorial |  |
|  |  | Case 1: No vote in this section: |
|  | for editorial | To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V. |
|  | change | Case 2: Voted in this section: |
|  | one) | Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields. |

This table is needed for each Comment accompanied a Vote

## Commenter 2 (Tadashi Mochizuki / TEL ) - Comment 1

| 2033$\mathbf{3}$$\underset{\sim}{2}$ | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph \#, if necessary. |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 5.2 Variable Definitions: <br> Reason: <br> - Thank you for revising the VID acronyms. <br> - I recommend to add a table that describes the acronym to Related Information (or some section). <br> - Following is sample table. This is my understanding for this ballot. |  |  |  |  |
|  | acronyms |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | variable type (class) | Variable data ID | variable data | variable name |
|  | variable | --- | VID | $\checkmark$ | --- |
|  | data variable | DVVAL | ID for DVVAL | data variable value (DVVAL) | DVVALNAME |
|  | status variable | SV | SVID | Status variable value (SV) | SVNAME |
|  | equipment constant | ECV | ECID | Equipment constant value (ECV) | ECNAME |
| $\begin{aligned} & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{3} \\ & \overline{3} \\ & \hline 1 \end{aligned}$ | The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions. |  |  |  |  |
|  | *No motion is required in this step. |  |  |  |  |
|  | Already addressed by Commenter \#, Comment \# |  |  |  |  |
|  | X No further action was taken by the TC Chapter. |  |  |  |  |
|  | Refer to the TF for more consideration. |  |  |  |  |
|  | New Business |  |  |  |  |
|  | Editorial Change |  |  |  |  |
|  | Options for editorial change (check one) | Case 1: No vote in this section: |  |  |  |
|  |  | To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V. |  |  |  |
|  |  | Case 2: Voted in this section: |  |  |  |
|  |  | Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields. |  |  |  |

Commenter 3 (Franz Putz / ZNT) - Comment 1

| $\begin{aligned} & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 3 \\ & \frac{3}{3} \\ & \underset{\sim}{7} \end{aligned}$ | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph \#, if necessary. |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | - 7.7.5.5.2 Host-Initiated Process Program Download - Formatted: The reference to footer 21 is obsolete. |
| $\bigcirc$ - | The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions. |



## Commenter 4 (Hyosung Kim / Doople) - Comment 1

|  | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph \#, if necessary. |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | - Hi, <br> - In Section 5.2 <br> - Can we have Alarm ID(ALID) as of standard? |  |
| $\begin{aligned} & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{3} \\ & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{0} \end{aligned}$ | The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions. |  |
|  | ${ }^{*}$ No motion is required in this step. |  |
|  | Already addressed by Commenter \#, Comment \# |  |
|  | X No further action was taken by the TC Chapter. |  |
|  | Refer to the TF for more consideration. |  |
|  | New Business |  |
|  | Editorial Change |  |
|  | Options for editorial change (check one) | Case 1: No vote in this section: |
|  |  | To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V. |
|  |  | Case 2: Voted in this section: |
|  |  | Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields. |

## Commenter 5 (Matsuda Mitsuhiro / KOKUSAI ELECTRIC) - Comment 1

| $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 0 \\ & 3 \\ & 3 \\ & 0 \\ & \hline 1 \end{aligned}$ | *TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph \#, if necessary. |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | - I think we first revise E30 without introducing "variable" concept. <br> - As I wrote Comment 2, their already exist inconsistency in E30 and E5. (not only inconsistency between E30 and E5, but also inconsistency each in E5 and in E30.) |  |
| $\begin{aligned} & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{2} \\ & \stackrel{1}{7} \\ & \end{aligned}$ | The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions. |  |
|  | *No motion is required in this step. |  |
|  | Already addressed by Commenter \#, Comment \# |  |
|  | No further action was taken by the TC Chapter. |  |
|  | Refer to the TF for more consideration. |  |
|  | New Business |  |
|  | Editorial Change |  |
|  | Options for editorial change (check one) | Case 1: No vote in this section: |
|  |  | To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V. |
|  |  | Case 2: Voted in this section: |
|  |  | Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields. |

Commenter 5 (Matsuda Mitsuhiro / KOKUSAI ELECTRIC) - Comment 2


| Options <br> for <br> editorial <br> change <br> (check <br> one) | To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. Editorial Changes Other <br> than Those Voted on in § V. |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | Case 2: Voted in this section:Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in <br> "FROM" and "TO" fields. |

## V-(ii) Comments Created by Handling Negative

## NONE

## VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.

## NONE

## VII. Approval Conditions Check

## VII. - (i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (Regulations $\mathbb{\|}$ 9.6.2.1.2)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least $90 \%$ of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (Regulations $\mathbb{\|}$ 9.6.2.1.3)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

|  |  | Accepts |  | (Accepts + Valid Rejects) |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Approval Rate | $=$ | 49 | / | 49 | $=$ | 100.0\% | $\geq 90 \%$ |


|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

## VII. - (ii) Approval Level (check one)

[^0]
## VIII. Safety Check

Note: See Regulations § 15 for further information.

| 2 | X | This is not a Safety Document, when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is still technically sound and complete. (Regulations \\| 8.7.1) |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | This is a Safety Document, when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is not technically sound and complete. (Regulations $\mathbb{\\|}$ 8.7.2) |  |
|  |  | Safety Checklist (Regulations $\mathbb{\top} 15.3$ ) is complete and has been included with the Document throughout the balloting process. (Regulations $\mathbb{I}$ 15.1.2) |  |
|  | Motion by/2 ${ }^{\text {nd }}$ by |  | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / J |
|  | Discussion |  | none |
|  | Vote |  | 14 Y-0 N; Motion passed |

## IX. Intellectual Property (IP) Check

Note: This Letter Ballot may cover all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. Regardless of the coverage, this IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline*. See Regulations § 16 for further information.

| X | The TC Chapter meeting chair asked those participating, if they were aware of any patented technology that might be relevant (see Regulations $\mathbb{I}$ 16.3.1.1) to the Standard or Safety Guideline; or, any copyrighted items or trademarks that are used/reproduced (see Regulations $\mathbb{\Pi}$ 16.4.1.2) in the Standard or Safety Guideline. (Also see, Regulations § 8.8) |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | X | The question is NOT answered in affirmative (No potentially material patented technology or use/reproduction of copyrighted items/trademarks is known.) | GO TO SECTION X. |  |  |
|  |  | The question is answered in affirmative | Is any of the known IPs a patented technology? | Yes, at least one of them is a patented technology | GO TO IX (a) "Patented Technology" subsection |
|  |  |  |  | No | GO TO IX (b) <br> "Copyright items" subsection |

IX(a) Patented Technologies subsection
IX(a1) Total numbers of Patented Technologies to be dealt with

| \# | (I) Known Patented Technology that | \# <br> Fill <br> number | (m) Number of patented technologies first became known to the TC Chapter on or after the day of the issuance of this Letter Ballot | Postpone assessment of such patented technologies to be performed at the next scheduled TC Chapter meeting. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| number | the Standard/Safety Guideline | \# <br> Fill <br> number | (n) Number of patented technologies first became known to the TC Chapter before the day of the issuance of this Letter Ballot | GO TO IX (a2) |

IX(a2) Assessment of disclosed patented technologies

| Disclosed patented technology \#1 <br> (Brief description, e.g., patent title and number): |  |  Date of <br> ber): <br> Letter B  <br> MM/DD  | Date of Assessment (lf different from the date of Letter Ballot adjudication) <br> MM/DD/YYYY |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Is disclosed patented technology \#1 found to be "might be material" to the Standard/Safety Guideline? | YES <br> (It is a PMPT) | Is the use of this PMPT technically justified? | YES | PROCEED to assess NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(a3) |
|  |  |  | NO | The Document is failed and returned to the TF |
|  | NO | No further action is needed for patented technology \#1 |  |  |

This table is needed for each disclosed patented technology.

IX(a3) LOA status check of PMPT of which inclusion assessed to be justified

## LOA Status of PMPT \#1



This table is needed for each PMPT of which inclusion assessed to be justified.

IX(b1) Total numbers of copyrighted items to be dealt with

|  |  | $0>0$ <br> (o) Known <br> There is at least one known copy righted <br> items that might be relevant to the <br> Standard/Safety Guideline | GO TO IX (b2) |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Fill |  |  |  |
| number |  |  |  |
| nopyrighted items |  |  |  |
| that are used or |  |  |  |
| reproduced to the |  |  |  |
| Standard/Safety |  |  |  |
| Guideline |  |  |  |$\quad$| $\mathbf{0 = 0}$ |
| :--- |
| There is no disclosed copyrighted item |$~$ GO TO IX (c) $\quad$.

IX(b2) Assessment of disclosed copyrighted items

## Disclosed copyrighted item \#1

(Brief description of its use in the Document):

|  |  |  |  | YES | PROCEED to assess <br> NEXT one, or |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Is disclosed copyrighted <br> item \#1 used or reproduced <br> in the the is the last one, <br> Guideline? | YES |  |  |  |  |

This table is needed for each disclosed copyrighted item.
IX(b3) Copyright release status check of copyrighted item of which inclusion assessed to be justified

Copyright release Status of copyrighted item \#1

| Has the copyright release been received from its owner?. | YES <br> NO | PROCEED to assess NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(c) |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | Ask ISC for special permission to publish. |  |
|  |  |  | Quit activity. | The Document is failed and returned to the TF |
|  |  |  | Wait for copyright release letter | PROCEED to check NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(c) |
|  |  | Motion by/ $2^{\text {nd }}$ by |  | Name (Company)/Name (Company) |
|  |  | Discussion |  | XXXX |
|  |  | Vote |  | XX Y-XX N; Motion passed (or failed) |

This table is needed for each copyrighted item of which use/reproduction assessed to be justified.

IX(c) Assessment of disclosed (identified) trademark

| Is there any trademark in the Standard/Safety Guideline? | YES | Is every instance of trademark use technically justified? | YES | GO TO IX(d) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | NO | The Document is failed and returned to the TF |
|  | NO | GO TO IX(d) |  |  |

IX(d) IP check completion condition check

| The co-chair checks if any Patented <br> Technologies first become known to <br> the TC Chapter on or after the day of <br> the issuance of this Letter Ballot? |  | YES |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| i.e., m>0 in IX(a1) | Sections IX(a2) and IX(a3) shall be completed and <br> recorded for such patented technologies at next <br> scheduled meeting of the TC Chapter. Until then, the <br> TC Chapter shall NOT go to X (making motion to <br> pass/fail this Document) (see Regulations $\mathbb{}$ <br> Until 16.4.1.2) |  |
|  |  | NO |

## X. Action for This Document

| 3 |  | This Document passed TC Chapter review as balloted and will be forwarded to the ISC A\&R SC for procedural review. |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | This Document passed TC Chapter review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A\&R SC for procedural review. |  |  |
|  | This Document passed TC Chapter review with technical changes and with or without editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A\&R SC for procedural review. A Ratification Ballot will be issued to verify the technical changes. |  |  |
|  | This Document failed TC Chapter review and will be returned to the TF for rework. |  |  |
|  | This Document failed TC Chapter review and work will be discontinued. |  |  |
| $\begin{gathered} \text { Motion by/ } \\ 2^{\text {nd }} \text { by } \end{gathered}$ |  | Chris Maloney (INTEL) / Albert Fuchigami (PEER Group) |  |
| Discussion |  | none |  |
| Vote |  | $15 \mathbf{Y}-1 \mathrm{~N}$ |  |
| Final Action |  | X | Motion passed |
|  |  |  | Motion failed |

Note: If the use of PMPT or copyrighted item is justified by the TC Chapter, LOA or release form must be received before publication can proceed.


[^0]:    Note: See Regulations § 9.6.2 for further information.

