

Record of Line-item Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: [North America](#)

Global Technical Committee: [Traceability](#)

TC Chapter Cochairs: [Dave Huntley \(PDF Solutions\)](#) / [Yaw Obeng \(NIST\)](#)

Standards Staff: [Inna Skvortsova](#)

	Scheduled in Background Statement	Actual
Date	11/07/2019	110/07/2019
Location	SEMI HQ, Milpitas CA	SEMI HQ, Milpitas CA
Reason for Change of Date and/or Location (if changed)		

Note: See *Regulations* ¶ 9.5 Exceptions for allowable reason to change.

[Document Information](#)

I. Document Number, Title, Lists of Line Items

Document Number 6471A	Document Title LINE ITEM REVISION TO SEMI T23-0119 SPECIFICATION FOR SINGLE DEVICE TRACEABILITY FOR THE SUPPLY CHAIN
List of Line Items	Line Item 1 Line Item Title Improve clarity on carrier objects and identifiers
	Line Item 2 Line Item Title Add a Compliance Statement and Table

[Line Item 1 Adjudication](#)

II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: **As-cast tally after close of voting period**

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.6.2.1.1)

Voting Tally (with example values):

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes		Distribution		Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	39	÷	63	=	61.9%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	39					
Voting Interest Reject(s)	0		Total Voters with Rejects		0	
Voting Interest Accept(s)	37					

Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

III. Rejects
None.

IV. Other Technical Issues
None.

V. Comments

V- (i) Voters' Comments

Commenter 1 (Fuchigami Albert / PEER Group) - Comment 1

Comment	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph #, if necessary. (Section 4.2).	
	IEEE needs the © symbol added to the first time it is referenced (Section 4.2). The footnote to identify the organization is already there.	
Action	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.	
	*No motion is required in this step.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Refer to the TF for more consideration.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	New Business
<input type="checkbox"/>	Editorial Change	

Commenter 1 (Fuchigami Albert / PEER Group) - Comment 2

Comment	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph #, if necessary	
	Upon reviewing SEMI T23, we found that JTAG Technologies B.V. has a trademark on JTAG™. We contacted the company and received confirmation that the trademark is on their corporate logo. Using the term “JTAG” when referencing the Joint Test Action Group as we do in SEMI T23 does not use their trademark, and does not need to be marked with the ™ symbol.	
Action	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.	
	*No motion is required in this step.	

<input type="checkbox"/>	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Refer to the TF for more consideration.
<input type="checkbox"/>	New Business
<input type="checkbox"/>	Editorial Change

This table is needed for each Comment accompanied a Vote
V-(ii) Comments Created by Handling Negative None.

VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V None.

VII. Approval Conditions Check

VII. - (i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.2*)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.3*)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)					
Approval Rate	=	37	/	37	=	100.0%		≥90%	

VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

Note: See *Regulations § 9.6.2* for further information.

- Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):**
Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.
- Need a Ratification Ballot:**
Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

Line Item 2 Adjudication

II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.1)

Voting Tally (with example values):

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes	Distribution	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	39	÷ 63	= 61.9%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	39			
Voting Interest Reject(s)	0	Total Voters with Rejects		0
Voting Interest Accept(s)	37			

Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

III. Rejects None.

IV. Other Technical Issues None.

V. Comments

V- (i) Voters' Comments

Commenter 1 (Cao, Clark / NAURA) - Comment 1

Comment	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph #, if necessary.
	<i>The device supplier must be able to report the historical test and manufacturing data to be traceable to the device ID. How to avoid fraudulent reports and data? I think the historical test and manufacturing data shouldn't change after generated</i>
Action	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.
	*No motion is required in this step.
	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #
	X No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.
	Refer to the TF for more consideration.

		New Business
		Editorial Change

This table is needed for each Comment accompanied a Vote

V-(ii) Comments Created by Handling Negative None.

VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V None.

VII. Approval Conditions Check

VII. - (i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.2)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.3)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)					
Approval Rate	=	37	/	37	=	100.0%		≥	90%

VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

Note: See Regulations § 9.6.2 for further information.

Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):

Line Item 2 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.

Need a Ratification Ballot:

Line Item 2 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

Checks for Entire Document Including All Approved Line Items

VIII. Safety Check

Note: This Safety check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items. See § 15 of the Regulations for further information.

Motion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This is not a Safety Document , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is still technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.7.1)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This is a Safety Document , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is not technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.7.2)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Safety Checklist (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 15.3) is complete and has been included with the Document throughout the balloting process. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 15.1.2)
Motion by/2nd by		Albert Fuchigami (PEER Group) / Nishimura Takayuki (Screen)
Discussion		None
Vote		4Y-0 N; Motion passed

IX. Intellectual Property (IP) Check

Note: This Letter Ballot may cover all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. Regardless of the coverage, this IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items*. See Regulations § 16 for further information.

	The TC Chapter meeting chair asked those participating, if they were aware of any patented technology that might be relevant (see <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 16.3.1.1) to the Standard or Safety Guideline; or, any copyrighted items or trademarks that are used/reproduced (see <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 16.4.1.2) in the Standard or Safety Guideline. (Also see, <i>Regulations</i> § 8.8)									
		The question is NOT answered in affirmative (No potentially material patented technology or use/reproduction of copyrighted items/trademarks is known.)	GO TO SECTION X.							
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The question is answered in affirmative	Is any of the known IPs a patented technology?	<table border="1" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="background-color: #e0f7fa; text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td>Yes, at least one of them is a patented technology</td> <td style="background-color: #fce4ec;">GO TO IX (a) “Patented Technology” subsection</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="background-color: #e0f7fa; text-align: center;"><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td> <td>No</td> <td style="background-color: #fce4ec;">GO TO IX (b) “Copyright items” subsection</td> </tr> </table>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes, at least one of them is a patented technology	GO TO IX (a) “Patented Technology” subsection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No	GO TO IX (b) “Copyright items” subsection
<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes, at least one of them is a patented technology	GO TO IX (a) “Patented Technology” subsection								
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No	GO TO IX (b) “Copyright items” subsection								

IX(a) Patented Technologies subsection

IX(a1) Total numbers of Patented Technologies to be dealt with

# Fill number	(l) Known Patented Technology that might be relevant to	# Fill number	(m) Number of patented technologies first became known to the TC Chapter on or after the day of the issuance of this Letter Ballot	Postpone assessment of such patented technologies to be performed at the next scheduled TC Chapter meeting.
------------------------------	---	------------------------------	--	--

	the Standard/Safety Guideline	# Fill number	(n) Number of patented technologies first became known to the TC Chapter before the day of the issuance of this Letter Ballot	GO TO IX (a2)
--	-------------------------------	------------------	---	---------------

IX(a2) Assessment of disclosed patented technologies

Disclosed patented technology #1 (Brief description, e.g., patent title and number):			Date of Assessment (If different from the date of Letter Ballot adjudication) MM/DD/YYYY		
Is disclosed patented technology #1 found to be "might be material" to the Standard/Safety Guideline?	YES (It is a PMPT)	Is the use of this PMPT technically justified?	YES	PROCEED to assess NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(a3)	
	NO		NO	The Document is failed and returned to the TF	
	NO	No further action is needed for patented technology #1			

This table is needed for each disclosed patented technology.

IX(a3) LOA status check of PMPT of which inclusion assessed to be justified

LOA Status of PMPT #1					
Has an LOA for this patented technology been received from every owner ?	YES	PROCEED to check NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(b)			
	NO	MOTION	Ask ISC for special permission to publish.		
			Quit activity.	The Document is failed and returned to the TF	
			Wait for LOA	PROCEED to check NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(b1)	
		Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
		Discussion	XXXX		
		Vote	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed (or failed)		

This table is needed for each PMPT of which inclusion assessed to be justified.

IX(b1) Total numbers of copyrighted items to be dealt with

0 Fill number	(o) Known copyrighted items that are used or reproduced to the Standard/Safety Guideline	o > 0	There is at least one known copy righted items that might be relevant to the Standard/Safety Guideline	GO TO IX (b2)
		x	o = 0 There is no disclosed copyrighted item	GO TO IX (c)

IX(b2) Assessment of disclosed copyrighted items

Disclosed copyrighted item #1 <i>(Brief description of its use in the Document):</i>						
Is disclosed copyrighted item #1 used or reproduced in the Standard/Safety Guideline?		YES	Is the use/reproduction of this copyrighted item technically justified?		YES	PROCEED to assess NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(b3)
					NO	
			NO	No further action is needed for copyrighted item #1		

This table is needed for each disclosed copyrighted item.

IX(b3) Copyright release status check of copyrighted item of which inclusion assessed to be justified

Copyright release Status of copyrighted item #1					
Has the copyright release been received from its owner ?.		YES	PROCEED to assess NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(c)		
	MOTION	NO		Ask ISC for special permission to publish.	
				Quit activity.	The Document is failed and returned to the TF
				Wait for copyright release letter	PROCEED to check NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(c)
		Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
		Discussion	XXXX		
		Vote	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed (or failed)		

This table is needed for each copyrighted item of which use/reproduction assessed to be justified.

IX(c) Assessment of disclosed (identified) trademark

Is there any trademark in the Standard/Safety Guideline?	X	YES	Is every instance of trademark use technically justified?	X	YES	GO TO IX(d)
					NO	
			NO	GO TO IX(d)		

IX(d) IP check completion condition check

The co-chair checks if any Patented Technologies first become known to the TC Chapter on or after the day of the issuance of this Letter Ballot? i.e., m>0 in IX(a1)		YES	Sections IX(a2) and IX(a3) shall be completed and recorded for such patented technologies at next scheduled meeting of the TC Chapter. Until then, the TC Chapter shall NOT go to X (making motion to pass/fail this Document) (see Regulations ¶ 16.4.1.2) Until then this Letter Ballot Review is on hold.		
	X	NO	GO TO X		

X. Action for This Document

Motion (Check all applicable items)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [1] and [2] passed TC Chapter review as balloted and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] passed TC Chapter review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] passed TC Chapter review with technical changes and with or without editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review. A Ratification Ballot will be issued to verify the technical changes.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] failed TC Chapter review and will be returned to the TF for rework.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] failed TC Chapter review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/ 2nd by	Albert Fuchigami (PEER Group) / Nishimura Takayuki (Screen)	
Discussion	None	
Vote	4 Y-0 N	
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed

Note: If the use of PMPT or copyrighted item is justified by the TC Chapter, LOA or release form must be received before publication can proceed.