

# Record of Line-item Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: [North America](#)

Global Technical Committee: [Traceability](#)

TC Chapter Cochairs: [Dave Huntley \(PDF Solutions\)](#) / [Yaw Obeng \(NIST\)](#)

Standards Staff: [Inna Skvortsova](#)

	Scheduled in Background Statement	Actual
Date	<a href="#">07/11/2019</a>	<a href="#">07/11/2019</a>
Location	<a href="#">Moscone, San Francisco, CA</a>	<a href="#">Moscone, San Francisco, CA</a>
Reason for Change of Date and/or Location (if changed)		

Note: See [Regulations ¶ 9.5 Exceptions](#) for allowable reason to change.

## [Document Information](#)

### I. Document Number, Title, Lists of Line Items

<b>Document Number</b> <a href="#">6471</a>		<b>Document Title</b> <a href="#">LINE ITEM REVISION TO SEMI T23-0119 SPECIFICATION FOR SINGLE DEVICE TRACEABILITY FOR THE SUPPLY CHAIN</a>
<b>List of Line Items</b>	<b>Line Item 1</b>	<b>Line Item Title</b> <a href="#">Improve clarity on carrier objects and identifiers</a>
	<b>Line Item 2</b>	<b>Line Item Title</b> <a href="#">Add a Compliance Statement and Table</a>
	<b>Line Item 3</b>	<b>Line Item Title</b> <a href="#">Clarify device ID requirements</a>
	<b>Line Item 4</b>	<b>Line Item Title</b> <a href="#">Update Device Traceability Across the Supply Chain Graphic</a>

## Line Item 1 Adjudication

### II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

**Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period**

**Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.1)**

Voting Tally (with example values):

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes	Distribution	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	39	÷ 56	= 69.6%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	48			
Voting Interest Reject(s)	1	Total Voters with Rejects		1
Voting Interest Accept(s)	39			

**Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.**

### III. Rejects

**Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: KKR)**

**Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Matsuda, Kokusai-Electric)**

**Negative 1**

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. <i>Related Information.</i>		
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. <i>Word 'must' is inaccurate. 'should' is proper in Related Information.</i>		
TF input (optional)		<i>Agree and will correct.</i>		
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.	GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)	
	Reason	XXXX		
	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		

	Discussion					
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.				
		[Negative is not related.] < 2/3	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection			
		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)			
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	X	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)			
			Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)			
			Reason	Will correct to comply with SEMI Regulations and Style Manual		
	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Albert Fuchigami (PEER Group) / Dave Huntley (PDF Solutions)				
	Discussion	none				
		Result of Vote (check one)	4 Y-0 N; Motion passed.			
	X		[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)	Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection
			[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3	X	N	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)
			2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)		
			90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection		
Final	(check if applicable)		(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)		
			(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)		
			(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)		
			(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)		
		X	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change		DOCUMENT FAILS
			(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)		
	(check if applicable)		Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.			

This table is needed for each Negative.

### Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 1

Check only when the Document has not been failed.

1	Original number (#) of Negatives	(g)
0	Number of Negatives withdrawn	(h)
0	Number of Negatives found not related	(i)
0	Number of Negatives found not significant	(j)

0	Number of Negatives addressed by technical change ( <b>Negative becomes not significant</b> )		(k)
Final		$g - (h + i + j + k) = 0$	Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. <i>Approval Conditions Check</i>
	x	$g - (h + i + j + k) > 0$	Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. <i>Approval Conditions Check</i>
		Reject without a Negative	Not Valid

Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (*Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3*)

Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.1.4.5.2*)

#### IV. Other Technical Issues

NONE

#### V. Comments

NONE

#### VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

NONE

#### VII. Approval Conditions Check

##### VII. - (i). Approval Rate

**APPROVAL CONDITION 1:** All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.2*)

**APPROVAL CONDITION 2:** At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.3*)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)					
Approval Rate	=	39	/	40	=	97.5%		≥90%	

## VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

Note: See *Regulations* § 9.6.2 for further information.

### **Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):**

Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.

### **Need a Ratification Ballot:**

Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

## Line Item 2 Adjudication

### II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

**Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period**

**Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.1)**

Voting Tally (with example values):

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes	Distribution	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	39	÷ 56	= 69.6%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	48			
Voting Interest Reject(s)	1	Total Voters with Rejects		1
Voting Interest Accept(s)	37			

**Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.**

### III. Rejects

**Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: KKR)**

**Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Matsuda, Kokusai-Electric)**

**Negative 1**

Negative	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary. <i>Section 7.1 Table title</i>		
	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied. <i>Word 'SDT' is not defined.</i>		
TF input (optional)		<i>Agree and will correct.</i>		
Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter.	GO TO "Related" subsection	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by Standards staff on MM/DD/YYYY.	GO TO "Final" subsection → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)	
	Reason	XXXX		
Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)		

	Discussion						
	Result of Vote (check one)	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.					
		[Negative is not related.] < 2/3	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection				
		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related.]	GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)				
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	X	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)				
			Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)				
			Reason	Will correct to comply with SEMI Style Manual			
	Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Albert Fuchigami (PEER Group) / Dave Huntley (PDF Solutions)					
	Discussion	none					
		Result of Vote (check one)	4 Y-0 N; Motion passed.				
	X		[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)		Y	GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection
			[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3		X	N	GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)
			2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)			
			90% ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option" subsection			
Final	(check if applicable)		(A)	Withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)			
			(B)	Not related (counted under i in disposition)			
			(C)	Related and not persuasive (significant)			
			(D)	Not significant (counted under j in disposition)			
		X	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change		DOCUMENT FAILS	
			(F)	Addressed by technical change (counted under k disposition)			
	(check if applicable)		Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.				

This table is needed for each Negative.

### Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 1

Check only when the Document has not been failed.

1	Original number (#) of Negatives	(g)
0	Number of Negatives withdrawn	(h)
0	Number of Negatives found not related	(i)
0	Number of Negatives found not significant	(j)

0	Number of Negatives addressed by technical change ( <b>Negative becomes not significant</b> )		(k)
Final		$g - (h + i + j + k) = 0$	Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. <i>Approval Conditions Check</i>
	x	$g - (h + i + j + k) > 0$	Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. <i>Approval Conditions Check</i>
		Reject without a Negative	Not Valid

Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (*Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3*)

Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.1.4.5.2*)

#### IV. Other Technical Issues

NONE

#### V. Comments

NONE

#### VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

NONE

#### VII. Approval Conditions Check

##### VII. - (i). Approval Rate

**APPROVAL CONDITION 1:** All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.2*)

**APPROVAL CONDITION 2:** At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.3*)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)					
Approval Rate	=	37	/	38	=	97.4%		≥90%	

## VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

Note: See *Regulations* § 9.6.2 for further information.

**Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):**

Line Item 2 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.

**Need a Ratification Ballot:**

Line Item 2 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

---

---

## Line Item 3 Adjudication

### II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

**Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period**

**Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.1)**

**Voting Tally (with example values):**

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes	Distribution	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	39	÷ 56	= 69.6%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	48			
Voting Interest Reject(s)	0	Total Voters with Rejects		0
Voting Interest Accept(s)	39			

**Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.**

### III. Rejects

**NONE**

### IV. Other Technical Issues

**NONE**

### V. Comments

**NONE**

### VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

**NONE**

## VII. Approval Conditions Check

### VII. - (i). Approval Rate

**APPROVAL CONDITION 1:** All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.2*)

**APPROVAL CONDITION 2:** At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.3*)

**Note:** If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)					
Approval Rate	=	39	/	39	=	100.0%		≥90%	

### VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

**Note:** See *Regulations § 9.6.2* for further information.

**Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):**

Line Item 3 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.

**Need a Ratification Ballot:**

Line Item 3 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

## Line Item 4 Adjudication

### II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

**Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period**

**Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.1)**

**Voting Tally (with example values):**

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes		Distribution		Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	39	÷	56	=	69.6%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	48					
Voting Interest Reject(s)	0		Total Voters with Rejects		0	
Voting Interest Accept(s)	39					

**Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.**

### III. Rejects

**NONE**

### IV. Other Technical Issues

**NONE**

### V. Comments

**NONE**

### VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

**NONE**

## VII. Approval Conditions Check

### VII. - (i). Approval Rate

**APPROVAL CONDITION 1:** All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.2*)

**APPROVAL CONDITION 2:** At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.3*)

**Note:** If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)					
Approval Rate	=	39	/	39	=	100.0%		≥90%	

### VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

**Note:** See *Regulations § 9.6.2* for further information.

**Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):**

Line Item 4 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.

**Need a Ratification Ballot:**

Line Item 4 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

## Checks for Entire Document Including All Approved Line Items

### VIII. Safety Check

Note: This Safety check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items. See § 15 of the Regulations for further information.

Motion	X	This is not a Safety Document, when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is still technically sound and complete. (Regulations ¶ 8.7.1)
		This is a Safety Document, when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is not technically sound and complete. (Regulations ¶ 8.7.2)
		Safety Checklist (Regulations ¶ 15.3) is complete and has been included with the Document throughout the balloting process. (Regulations ¶ 15.1.2)
Motion by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by		Albert Fuchigami (PEER Group) / Dave Huntley (PDF Solutions)
Discussion		none
Vote		4 Y-0 N; Motion passed

### IX. Intellectual Property (IP) Check

Note: This Letter Ballot may cover all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. Regardless of the coverage, this IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items\*. See Regulations § 16 for further information.

X	The TC Chapter meeting chair asked those participating, if they were aware of any patented technology that might be relevant (see Regulations ¶ 16.3.1.1) to the Standard or Safety Guideline; or, any copyrighted items or trademarks that are used/reproduced (see Regulations ¶ 16.4.1.2) in the Standard or Safety Guideline. (Also see, Regulations § 8.8)				
	X	The question is NOT answered in affirmative (No potentially material patented technology or use/reproduction of copyrighted items/trademarks is known.)	GO TO SECTION X.		
		The question is answered in affirmative	Is any of the known IPs a patented technology?	Yes, at least one of them is a patented technology	GO TO IX (a) "Patented Technology" subsection
				No	GO TO IX (b) "Copyright items" subsection

### X. Action for This Document

Motion (Check all applicable)	X	Line item(s) [3] and [4] passed TC Chapter review as balloted and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	X	Line item(s) [1] and [2] failed TC Chapter review and will be returned to the TF for rework.
Motion by/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> by		Albert Fuchigami (PEER Group) / Dave Huntley (PDF Solutions)
Discussion		none
Vote		4 Y-0 N
Final Action	X	Motion passed
		Motion failed

**Note: If the use of PMPT or copyrighted item is justified by the TC Chapter, LOA or release form must be received before publication can proceed.**