

Record of Line-item Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: **Japan**

Global Technical Committee: **Information & Control**

TC Chapter Cochairs: **Mitsuhiro Matsuda / KOKUSAI ELECTRIC, Takayuki Nishimura / SCREEN Semiconductor Solutions**

Standards Staff: **Junko Collins (SEMI Japan)**

	Scheduled in Background Statement	Actual
Date	09/26/2019	09/26/2019
Location	SEMI Japan Tokyo, Japan	SEMI Japan Tokyo, Japan
Reason for Change of Date and/or Location (if changed)		

Note: See *Regulations* ¶ 9.5 Exceptions for allowable reason to change.

Document Information

I. Document Number, Title, Lists of Line Items

Document Number 6548		Document Title Line Item Revision to SEMI E170-0419: SPECIFICATION FOR SECURED FOUNDATION OF RECIPE MANAGEMENT SYSTEM (SFORMS)
List of Line Items	Line Item 1	Line Item Title Add the description of the way to get recipe body which includes ProcessLink
	Line Item 2	Line Item Title Put Application Note which includes sequence diagram and transition of IDs instead of Figure 9.

Line Item 1 Adjudication

II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.1)

Voting Tally (with example values):

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes	Distribution	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	90	÷ 150	= 60.0%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	34			
Voting Interest Reject(s)	0	Total Voters with Rejects		0
Voting Interest Accept(s)	60			

Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

III. Rejects

None

IV. Other Technical Issues

None

V. Comments

None

VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

None

VII. Approval Conditions Check

VII. - (i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.2)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.3)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)					
Approval Rate	=	60	/	60	=	100.0%		≥90%	

VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

Note: See *Regulations § 9.6.2* for further information.

Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):

Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.

Need a Ratification Ballot:

Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

Line Item 2 Adjudication

II. Tally

Standards staff to fill in.

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.1)

Voting Tally (with example values):

Voting Interest:	Returned Votes	Distribution	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	90	÷ 150	= 60.0%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	34			
Voting Interest Reject(s)	0	Total Voters with Rejects		0
Voting Interest Accept(s)	60			

Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

III. Rejects

None

IV. Other Technical Issues

Note: TC Chapter may choose to address a technical issue that is not part of a Negative received on a Letter Ballot (i.e., a Comment or a reason not addressed by a Vote response) by handling it as a Negative and finding it related and technically persuasive. The TC Chapter may then fail the Document or address such technical issue by using the procedure defined in *Regulations* § 9.6.1.4.3 to make a technical change to the Document. (*Regulations* ¶ 9.6.1.4.2.5)

Technical Issue	Origin	<p>*TF/TC Chapter to choose Comment # (Voter: Name and company) / A reason not addressed by a Vote response</p> <p>Comment 1 (Tadashi Mochizuki/ Tokyo Electron Limited)</p>
	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	<p>*TF/TC Chapter to fill in including text in the ballot as appropriate.</p> <p>[Comment 1 to Document 6548 Line Item #2]: Reference: R1-1.2.4.4 Copy Equipment Assigned Recipe with new Recipe ID</p> <p>Comment: I think "Copy RMS Assigned" is correct, not "Copy Equipment Assigned".</p>
	Reason	<p>*Original Comment text, if applicable, and problem statement, including justification and suggestion, should be copied.</p> <p>"R1-1.2.4.4 Copy Equipment Assigned Recipe with new Recipe ID" is not correct. It should be "Copy RMS Assigned" is correct, not "Copy Equipment Assigned". This amendment cannot be covered by editorial change. This comment is related and technically persuasive.</p>

Handle technical issue identified above as a Negative.

Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.)	GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related and assigned to TF. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related and placed on agenda of current TC Chapter meeting as new business. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
			Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Discussion				
	Result of Vote (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.		
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is not related.] <2/3		GO TO "Persuasive" subsection	
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3 ≤ [Negative is not related] and assigned to TF.		GO TO "Final" subsection → (B)	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive. (Needs >1/3 votes to pass.)		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)		
			Reason	Voter's comment is a technical issue and persuasive.	

	Motion by/ 2nd by	Osamu Ohishi (IBM Japan Services Company) / Masaya Nagata (Tokyo Electron)		
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check one)	9 Y-0 N; Motion passed		
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive.] > 1/3	Is a technical change recommended? (check one)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 2/3	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Y
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90%	<input type="checkbox"/> N
		GO TO "Address by Technical Change Option" subsection		
		GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)		
		GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)		
Address by Technical Change Option	Technical Change Recommendations			
	Original section/paragraph number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.			
	Technical Changes	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX	
			TO: Section/Paragraph xxx	
			Justification (If necessary)	
		2	FROM: Section/Paragraph XXX	
			TO: Section/Paragraph xxx	
			Justification (If necessary)	
	Motion		Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).	
	Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.	
			<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is addressed by the technical change(s).]
			<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not addressed by the technical change(s).] < 2/3
			GO TO "Incorporation of the Technical Change" subsection	
		GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)		
Incorporation of the Technical Change	Motion		To incorporate the technical change(s).	
	Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check one)		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.	
			<input type="checkbox"/>	90% ≤ [Agree to incorporate.]
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Disagree to incorporate.] >10%	
		GO TO "Final" subsection → (F)		
		GO TO "Final" subsection → (E)		
Final	(check one)	<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	Not related
		<input type="checkbox"/>	(C)	Related and not persuasive

	x	(E)	Related and persuasive and not addressed by technical change	DOCUMENT FAILS
		(F)	Addressed by technical change	
(check if applicable)		Comment generated. See Section V-(ii) Comment # X.		

V. Comments

V- (i) Voters' Comments

Commenter 1 (Tadashi Mochizuki/ Tokyo Electron Limited) - Comment 1

Comment	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph #, if necessary.	
	<p>[Comment 1 to Document 6548 Line Item #2]: Reference: R1-1.2.4.4 Copy Equipment Assigned Recipe with new Recipe ID</p> <p>Comment: I think "Copy RMS Assigned" is correct, not "Copy Equipment Assigned".</p>	
Action	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.	
	*No motion is required in this step.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #
	<input type="checkbox"/>	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Refer to the TF for more consideration.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Editorial Change
	Options for editorial change (check one)	<input type="checkbox"/> Case 1: No vote in this section: <i>To be included and voted on as a group in § VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V.</i>
		<input type="checkbox"/> Case 2: Voted in this section: Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.
Editorial Changes	1	FROM: Section/Paragraph
		TO: Section/Paragraph
		Justification (if necessary)
	2	FROM: Section/Paragraph xxx
		TO: Section/Paragraph xxx
		Justification (if necessary)
Motion	To approve above editorial change(s)	
Motion by/2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Discussion	XXXX	

Vote	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed/failed.
------	----------------------------------

V-(ii) Comments Created by Handling Negative

None

VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

None

VII. Approval Conditions Check

VII. - (i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.2*)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.3*)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)				
Approval Rate	=	60	/	60	=	100.0%		≥90%

VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

Note: See *Regulations § 9.6.2* for further information.

Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):

Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.

Need a Ratification Ballot:

Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

Checks for Entire Document Including All Approved Line Items

VIII. Safety Check

Note: This Safety check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items. See § 15 of the *Regulations* for further information.

Motion	X	This is not a Safety Document , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is still technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.7.1)
		This is a Safety Document , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is not technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.7.2)
		Safety Checklist (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 15.3) is complete and has been included with the Document throughout the balloting process. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 15.1.2)
Motion by/2nd by		Osamu Ohishi (IBM Japan Services Company) / Masaya Nagata (Tokyo Electron)
Discussion		None
Vote		9 Y-0 N; Motion passed

IX. Intellectual Property (IP) Check

Note: This Letter Ballot may cover all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. Regardless of the coverage, this IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items*. See *Regulations* § 16 for further information.

x	The TC Chapter meeting chair asked those participating, if they were aware of any patented technology that might be relevant (see <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 16.3.1.1) to the Standard or Safety Guideline; or, any copyrighted items or trademarks that are used/reproduced (see <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 16.4.1.2) in the Standard or Safety Guideline. (Also see, <i>Regulations</i> § 8.8)			
X	The question is NOT answered in affirmative (No potentially material patented technology or use/reproduction of copyrighted items/trademarks is known.)	GO TO SECTION X.		
	The question is answered in affirmative	Is any of the known IPs a patented technology?	Yes, at least one of them is a patented technology	GO TO IX (a) “Patented Technology” subsection
			No	GO TO IX (b) “Copyright items” subsection

IX(a) Patented Technologies subsection

IX(a1) Total numbers of Patented Technologies to be dealt with

# Fill number	(l) Known Patented Technology that might be relevant to	# Fill number	(m) Number of patented technologies first became known to the TC Chapter on or after the day of the issuance of this Letter Ballot	Postpone assessment of such patented technologies to be performed at the next scheduled TC Chapter meeting.
------------------------------	---	------------------------------	--	--

	the Standard/Safety Guideline	# Fill number	(n) Number of patented technologies first became known to the TC Chapter before the day of the issuance of this Letter Ballot	GO TO IX (a2)
--	-------------------------------	------------------	---	---------------

IX(a2) Assessment of disclosed patented technologies

Disclosed patented technology #1 (Brief description, e.g., patent title and number):			Date of Assessment (If different from the date of Letter Ballot adjudication) MM/DD/YYYY		
Is disclosed patented technology #1 found to be "might be material" to the Standard/Safety Guideline?	YES (It is a PMPT)	Is the use of this PMPT technically justified?	YES	PROCEED to assess NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(a3)	
	NO		NO	The Document is failed and returned to the TF	
	NO	No further action is needed for patented technology #1			

This table is needed for each disclosed patented technology.

IX(a3) LOA status check of PMPT of which inclusion assessed to be justified

LOA Status of PMPT #1					
Has an LOA for this patented technology been received from every owner ?	YES	PROCEED to check NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(b)			
	NO	MOTION	Ask ISC for special permission to publish.		
			Quit activity.	The Document is failed and returned to the TF	
			Wait for LOA	PROCEED to check NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(b1)	
		Motion by/ 2 nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
		Discussion	XXXX		
		Vote	XX Y-XX N; Motion passed (or failed)		

This table is needed for each PMPT of which inclusion assessed to be justified.

IX(b1) Total numbers of copyrighted items to be dealt with

# Fill number	(o) Known copyrighted items that are used or reproduced to the Standard/Safety Guideline	o > 0 There is at least one known copy righted items that might be relevant to the Standard/Safety Guideline	GO TO IX (b2)
		o = 0 There is no disclosed copyrighted item	GO TO IX (c)

IX(b2) Assessment of disclosed copyrighted items

Disclosed copyrighted item #1 <i>(Brief description of its use in the Document):</i>					
Is disclosed copyrighted item #1 used or reproduced in the Standard/Safety Guideline?		YES	Is the use/reproduction of this copyrighted item technically justified?	YES	PROCEED to assess NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(b3)
				NO	
		NO	No further action is needed for copyrighted item #1		

This table is needed for each disclosed copyrighted item.

IX(b3) Copyright release status check of copyrighted item of which inclusion assessed to be justified

Copyright release Status of copyrighted item #1					
Has the copyright release been received from its owner ?.		YES	PROCEED to assess NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(c)		
	MOTION	NO		Ask ISC for special permission to publish.	
				Quit activity.	The Document is failed and returned to the TF
				Wait for copyright release letter	PROCEED to check NEXT one, or if this is the last one, GO TO IX(c)
		Motion by/ 2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
		Discussion		XXXX	
		Vote		XX Y-XX N; Motion passed (or failed)	

This table is needed for each copyrighted item of which use/reproduction assessed to be justified.

IX(c) Assessment of disclosed (identified) trademark

Is there any trademark in the Standard/Safety Guideline?		YES	Is every instance of trademark use technically justified?	YES	GO TO IX(d)
				NO	
		NO	GO TO IX(d)		

IX(d) IP check completion condition check

The co-chair checks if any Patented Technologies first become known to the TC Chapter on or after the day of the issuance of this Letter Ballot? i.e., m>0 in IX(a1)		YES	Sections IX(a2) and IX(a3) shall be completed and recorded for such patented technologies at next scheduled meeting of the TC Chapter. Until then, the TC Chapter shall NOT go to X (making motion to pass/fail this Document) (see Regulations ¶ 16.4.1.2) Until then this Letter Ballot Review is on hold.
		NO	GO TO X

X. Action for This Document

Motion (Check all applicable items)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [1] passed TC Chapter review as balloted and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] passed TC Chapter review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] passed TC Chapter review with technical changes and with or without editorial changes and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review. A Ratification Ballot will be issued to verify the technical changes.
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [2] failed TC Chapter review and will be returned to the TF for rework.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] failed TC Chapter review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/ 2nd by	Osamu Ohishi (IBM Japan Services Company) / Masaya Nagata (Tokyo Electron)	
Discussion	None	
Vote	9 Y-0N	
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed

Note: If the use of PMPT or copyrighted item is justified by the TC Chapter, LOA or release form must be received before publication can proceed.