

Record of Line-item Letter Ballot Review by TC Chapter for Procedural Review

Region/Locale: **North America**
 Global Technical Committee: **Gases**
 TC Chapter Cochairs: **Mohamed Saleem / Brooks Instrument/ITW**
 Standards Staff: **Laura Nguyen**

	Scheduled in Background Statement	Actual
Date	02/25/2025	02/25/2025
Location	SEMI HQ, Milpitas, CA/USA	SEMI HQ, Milpitas, CA/USA
Reason for Change of Date and/or Location (if changed)		

Note: See Regulations ¶ 9.5 Exceptions for allowable reason to change.

Document Information

I. Document Number, Title, Lists of Line Items

Document Number 7327	Document Title Line-Item Revision to SEMI E56-0317, Test Method for Determining Accuracy, Linearity, Repeatability, Short-Term Reproducibility, Hysteresis, and Deadband of Thermal Mass Flow Controllers
List of Line Items Line Item 1	Line Item Title Remove “thermal” throughout.

Line Item 1 Adjudication

II. Tally

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

Note: A minimum of 60% of the Voting Interests that have TC Members within the global technical committee that issued the Letter Ballot must return Votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.1)

Voting Tally (with example values):

Voting Interest:	Returned Vote	Distributio	Return Rate	
Letter Ballot	39	÷ 64	= 60.9%	≥60%
Intercommittee Ballot	10			
Voting Interest Reject(s)	1	Total Voters with Rejects		1
Voting Interest Accept(s)	30			

Note: See Regulations § 3.2.1 for definition of Voting Interest.

III. Rejects

Voting Interest Reject 1 (Voting Interest Name: TEL)

Voter Reject 1 (Voter: Supika Mashiro / Tokyo Electron Limited)

Negative 1

	Referenced Section/ Paragraph	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in, including text in the ballot if necessary.	
		Sections 1 and 2	
Negative	Negative Text	*Original complete Negative text (e.g., issue, justification, suggestion) should be copied.	
		Negative/ Deleting the modifier "Thermal" from "thermal mass flow controllers" in those sections should not have been done as a Line-Item Ballot. Reason/ Justification/Suggestion Deleting the modifier "Thermal" from "thermal mass flow controllers" in those sections extend the purpose and scope of the Standard significantly. These are technical changes. Technical change to Purpose and/or Scope sections can be conducted only by a major revision to per PM 3.5.1. And PM 3.4.2.6 clearly forbids use of Line Item for major revision.	
	Withdrawal (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Negative withdrawal made by Voter. GO TO "Related" subsection
Related	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	'Related' is mutually agreed upon. (Needs no motion.) GO TO "Persuasive" subsection
Persuasive	Motion and Reason (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive. (Needs ≥2/3 votes to pass.)
			Reason: Removing "thermal" does not alter the content of the document technically
	Motion by/ 2 nd by	By: Matthew Milburn / UCT Second: Yanli Chen / Applied Materials, Inc.	
	Discussion	None	
	Result of Vote (check one)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	2/3 ≤ [Negative is related and not persuasive.] < 90% GO TO "Final" subsection → (C)
Final	(check if applicable)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(C) Related and not persuasive (significant)

Disposition of Voting Interest Reject 1

Check only when the Document has not been failed.

1	Original number (#) of Negatives	(g)
0	Number of Negatives withdrawn	(h)
0	Number of Negatives found not related	(i)
0	Number of Negatives found not significant	(j)
0	Number of Negatives addressed by technical change (Negative becomes not significant)	(k)

Final	X	$g - (h + i + j + k) = 0$	Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. <i>Approval Conditions Check</i>
		$g - (h + i + j + k) > 0$	Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. <i>Approval Conditions Check</i>
		Reject without a Negative	Not Valid

Note: If all of the Negatives included with a Reject Vote are withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the Reject Vote is not valid. (*Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3*)
Note: A Negative addressed by a technical change is automatically considered to be not significant. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.1.4.5.2*)

IV. Other Technical Issues

None

V. Comments

V- (i) Voters' Comments

Commenter 1 (Eric Sklar / Safety Guru) - Comment 1

Comment	*TF/TC Chapter to fill in section/paragraph #, if necessary.	
	Doc7327 Comments Safety Guru, LLC 2025 January 24 This Document does not conform with the current requirements of the SEMI Standards Program. For example, "must" and "may" are used incorrectly. Also, I have some technical concerns. For example 12.5 instructs one to "Apply the lower setpoint to the DUT...", but it does not specify what the "lower setpoint" is. The obvious candidates are 0, 10% of nominal full flow, and "as specified by the DUT manufacturer".	
Action	The TC Chapter agreed to do one of the following actions.	
	*No motion is required in this step.	
		Already addressed by Commenter #, Comment #
	X	No further action was taken by the TC Chapter.
		Refer to the TF for more consideration.
		New Business
	Editorial Change	

V-(ii) Comments Created by Handling Negative

None

VI. Editorial Changes Other than Those Voted on in § V

None

VII. Approval Conditions Check

VII. - (i). Approval Rate

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All Negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, found not persuasive, or addressed by a technical change. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.2*)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of valid Voting Interest Accept and Voting Interest Reject Votes must be Accept. (*Regulations ¶ 9.6.2.1.3*)

Note: If both approval conditions are not satisfied, the Document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)					
Approval Rate	=	30	/	30	=	100.0%		≥90%	

VII. – (ii) Approval Level (check one)

Note: See *Regulations § 9.6.2* for further information.

Globally Approved (No Ratification Ballot needed):

Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the global technical committee.

Need a Ratification Ballot:

Line Item 1 meets the Letter Ballot approval conditions for the TC Chapter and a Ratification Ballot will be issued to validate technical changes.

Checks for Entire Document Including All Approved Line Items

VIII. Safety Check

Note: This Safety check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items. See § 15 of the *Regulations* for further information.

Motion	X	This is not a Safety Document , when all safety-related information is removed, the Document is still technically sound and complete. (<i>Regulations</i> ¶ 8.7.1)	
Motion by/2 nd by		By: Matthew Milburn / UCT Second: Daniel Zito / Swagelok	
Discussion		None	
Vote		11 Y 0 N; Motion passed	

IX. Intellectual Property (IP) Check

Note: This Letter Ballot may cover all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. Regardless of the coverage, this IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline including all the approved Line Items*. See *Regulations* § 16 for further information.

X	The TC Chapter meeting chair asked those participating, if they were aware of any patented technology that might be relevant (see <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 16.3.1.1) to the Standard or Safety Guideline; or, any copyrighted items or trademarks that are used/reproduced (see <i>Regulations</i> ¶ 16.4.1.2) in the Standard or Safety Guideline. (Also see, <i>Regulations</i> § 8.8)		
X	The question is NOT answered in affirmative (No potentially material patented technology or use/reproduction of copyrighted items/trademarks is known.)	GO TO SECTION X.	

X. Action for This Document

applica all Motion (Check	X	Line item(s) [1] passed TC Chapter review as balloted and will be forwarded to the ISC A&R SC for procedural review.	
Motion by/ 2 nd by		By: Max van den Berg / Festo SE & Co. KG Second: Matthew Milburn / UCT	
Discussion		None	
Vote		11 Y 0 N	
Final Action		X	Motion passed
			Motion failed

Note: If the use of PMPT or copyrighted item is justified by the TC Chapter, LOA or release form must be received before publication can proceed.